



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF
THE OHIO CIVIL RIGHTS COMMISSION
September 25, 2014
Lobby Hearing Room, Rhodes Office Tower
Columbus, Ohio**

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Hubert called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Commissioners Present:

Chairman Leonard Hubert
Commissioner Lori Barreras
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III
Commissioner Tom Roberts

A quorum was present.

OCRC Staff Present:

G. Michael Payton, Executive Director; Keith McNeil, Regional Counsel/Director of Operations; Stephanie Bostos Demers, Chief Legal Counsel; Desmon Martin, Director of Enforcement and Compliance; Ronnell Tomlinson, Director of Housing/Alternative Dispute Resolution; Darlene Newbern, Toledo Regional Director; Aman Mehra, Columbus Regional Director; Norman Gibson, Dayton Regional Director; Vera Boggs, Cleveland/Akron Regional Director; Bradley Dunn, Reconsideration Supervisor; Patrick Dull, Assistant Attorney General – Ohio Attorney General’s Office; and Sandra Aukeman, Administrative Assistant.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to approve the September 4, 2014 minutes. Second by Commissioner Patmon.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES

Motion carried.

CONFIRMATION OF STAFF FINDINGS

1. Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Vacate Original No Probable Cause Finding and Grant for Further Review

Amber Liane Thornsberry v. Express Scripts, Inc.
COLB1(40610)10222013
22A-2014-00506C

Berhanu D. Bedada v. American Electric Power*
COLB1(40619)10292013
22A-2014-00465C

*Commissioners Patmon and Barreras recused themselves from participation in this case

Darla Ramsarran v. Erie Shores Landing, Ltd., Crystol Aswell, and Niederst
Management, Ltd.
AKRH4(42300)12202013
05-14-0390-8
22A-2014-00829F

Steven Taylor v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction
CLE74(42456)05022014
22A-2014-01886C

Willie Wilson v. Taco Bell
DAY76(24070)12162013
22A-2014-00648C

Willie J. Wilson v. Taco Bell
DAY76(24095)01072014
22A-2014-01120C

2. Respondent's Request for Reconsideration – Grant for Further Review

Kelsey Walden v. Linden Equities II LLC
COLH1(40816)02182014
05-14-0547-8
22A-2014-01292F

David L. Johnson v. The Reserve at Stoneridge Homeowners Association, Inc.
COLH1(40887)03252014
05-14-0688-8
22A-2014-01775F

Respondent's Request for Reconsideration – Grant for Further Review - continued

Denise Paprocki v. Freehold Investment Group, LLC dba Parkway Arms, Ltd., Eric Nugent, and Lauren Murphy
AKRH4(42280)12102013
05-14-0236-8
22A-2014-00630F

Jonathan Johnson v. Columbia Gas Transmissions / Nisource
DAYB6(24017)11142013
22A-2014-01128C

3. Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Deny – Untimely

Tim Zebbadji v. ESA Engineers, Surveyors & Associates, LLC
TOLE2(36429)03052014 (Amended)
22A-2014-01355F

LeRay Gibson v. Akron Metropolitan Housing Authority and Joseph & Mary Kury
AKRH3(37161)10282013
22A-2014-00278F

Justin Butcher v. Kohl's Department Stores, Inc.
DAYB6(24269)04182014
22A-2014-02192C

4. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General's Office

Jasmine Lee Lewis v. Electro Prime Rossford, LLC
TOL71(38935)10112011
22A-2012-00143C
Complaint No. 12-EMP-TOL-38935

5. Authorize Attorney General to Enforce Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order

Housing Research & Advocacy Center v. Latanya Emerson
CLEH4(42046)06242013 AMENDED
05-13-1530-8
22A-2013-02564F

6. Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation

Isabella Tacy v. Cuyahoga County, Department of Job and Family Services*
CLEB4(42294)12182013
22A-2014-00785C

*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

Ronald G. Farris v. AVI Food Systems, Inc.
CLE74(42301)12262013
22A-2014-00807C

Sherri Besman v. Debbie Kuhn and Nob Hill East Condominium Owners Association,
Inc. dba The Citadel of Chagrin Valley*

CLEH4(42350)02122014
05-14-0523-8

22A-2014-01163F

* Split recommendation; Probable Cause finding on the basis of Disability against Respondent Nob Hill East Condominium Owners Association, Inc., dba The Citadel of Chagrin Valley; No Probable Cause finding on the basis of Disability against Respondent Debbie Kuhn

Randy J. Frank v. State of Ohio-Dept of Youth Services
DAY76(24029)11202013
22A-2014-01066C

Elisabeth Curtis v. Michael Buttram, Owner
DAYH6(24161)02132014
22A-2014-01220F

Miami Valley Fair Housing Center, Inc. v. Mary M. Lewis
DAYH6(24385)06172014
05-14-1193-8
22A-2014-02633F

7. Issue Formal Complaint

Melody Gaston v. Comprehensive Care Services, Inc. dba Franklin Park Physical
Medicine
COL71(40584)10092013
22A-2014-00190C

Jay Piatak v. Berkshire Condominium Owner's Association, Inc.*
AKRH4(42214)10112013
05-14-0036-8
22A-2014-00207F

*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

8. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination – Close

Jeanine A. Weihl-Williams v. City of Toledo, Department of Finance
TOL72(36310)12112013 AMENDED
22A-2014-00618C

Deborah S. Davis v. Village of Dennison
AKRG3(37237)12112013
22A-2014-00610F

Nellie A. Breedlove v. American Red Cross of Summit and Portage Counties
AKRG3(37342)03062014
22A-2014-01380F

Natalie Watson v. City of Trotwood Police Department
DAY76(24012)11132013
22A-2014-00736C

Beth E. Geise v. Kleman Services, LLC
DAY76(24181)02242014 AMENDED
22A-2014-01320C

Shabie Hopkins v. Community Housing Network
ADR71(41168)08062014
22A-2014-02918C

Ben Byard v. Mobile Meals of Toledo
ADR72(36692)08122014
22A-2014-02684C

Sharyl Medina et al v. Rosewood Apartments et al; J & P Verhoff Enterprises, Inc. et al;
Pam Verhoff, Manager
ADRH2(36693)08122014
05-14-1406-8
22A-2014-02685F

John Miller v. Village Farm Dairy Co. d/b/a In & Out Mart
ADRG2(36729)08222014
22A-2014-02754F

Tim Marshall v. Express Personnel
ADRA2(36737)08262014
22A-2014-02787C

Chelsea Scott v. Wear To Go
ADRE3(37512)07022014
22A-2014-02479F

**Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination –
Close – continued**

Raymond Lockett v. The Urban Ounce of Prevention Services, Incorporated
ADRG3(37539)07152014
22A-2014-02510F

Tyrone Phillips v. VGS, Inc.
ADRB3(37560)07292014
22A-2014-02588C

Housing Research & Advocacy Center v. Yolanda Salazar, Jorge Garcia, Jr., Jorge
Garcia, Sr., Blue Water Properties
ADRH4(42472)05132014
05-14-0901-8
22A-2014-02076F

Housing Research & Advocacy Center v. Steve Rising/M40 Team
ADRH4(42484)05142014
05-14-0905-8
22A-2014-02026F

Jameka Nicole Hanna v. Prime Communications (At & T Authorized Retailer)
ADR74(42525)06252014
22A-2014-02302C

Iryna Y. Hariton v. Sunrise Cove Condominium Association, IV
ADRH4(42553)07112014
05-14-1288-8
22A-2014-02433F

Lorenzo Jackson v. Prime Communications (At & T Authorized Retailer)
ADR74(42573)07252014
22A-2014-02585C

Sundra J. Chalid v. MPA Chesterfield, LLC/Metropolitan Properties of America
ADRH4(42596)08142014
22A-2014-02742F

Sheri Lovett v. Catherine Lueckel
ADRH4(42608)08112014
22A-2014-02862F

Miami Valley Fair Housing Center, Inc. v. Douglas Haney; Properties Plus 1 LLC
ADRH6(24467)07302014
05-14-1352-8
22A-2014-02626F

9. Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement

Ellen L. Powers v. Imasen Bucyrus Technology, Inc.
TOLB2(36285)11222013
22A-2014-00486C

Mary Ann Robinson v. Eagleview Logistics, Corp.
TOLA2(36359)01272014
22A-2014-00956C

Kenneth Fell v. American Red Cross Blood Services, Western Lake Erie Region
TOLB2(36460)03242014
22A-2014-01470C

Ann Felix et al v. Oakwood Mobile Homes et al; JMC Communities, Inc. et al; Tina
Hackney, VP
TOLH2(36658)07102014
05-14-1173-8
22A-2014-02375F

Brittany A. Scisum v. Lutheran Village at Wolf Creek Condominium Owners'
Association, Inc. dba Wolf Creek Nursing Home
TOL72(36705)08152014
22A-2014-02705C

Paula Martin v. State of Ohio, Bureau of Vocational Rehabilitation, Opportunities for
Ohioans with Disabilities
CLEK4(42571)07242014
22A-2014-02546F

Lauren I. Williams v. Moody Nolan Inc.
ADRB1(41089)07032014
22A-2014-02696C

Mica Sichina v. The Pain Management Clinic, LLC
ADR71(41177)08132014
22A-2014-02973C

Mica Sichina v. The Pain Management Clinic, LLC
ADR71(41190)08202014
22A-2014-02971C

Mica Sichina v. The Pain Management Clinic, LLC
ADR71(41201)08222014
22A-2014-02954C

Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement – continued

Mica Sichina v. The Pain Management Clinic, LLC
ADR71(41219)09022014
22A-2014-02983C

Donna J. Timcisko v. Middletown Limited Partnership and Lancee Flee
AKRH4(42594)08122014
22A-2014-02762F

Eric Hoagland v. Union Metal Corporation
ADR73(37520)07022014
22A-2014-02487C

James Tucker v. Knott Brake Company
ADR73(37531)007072014
22A-2014-02387C

John A. Taylor v. Weaver Industries, Inc.
ADR73(37553)07222014
22A-2014-02523C

Erol Foster v. Mark Eastman/Terry Foster/Mgr. Metro Inspections, LLC
ADRH4(42460)05072014
05-14-0880-8
22A-2014-02064F

Therese Marshall v. East Cleveland City Schools
ADRB4(42462)05052014
22A-2014-01902C

Tia Maria Magee v. Carrington Youth Academy
ADR74(42486)05222014
22A-2014-02028C

Tonya Blair & Chris Lukaszcz v. Normandy Manor, LLC
ADRH4(42561)07182014
05-14-1395-8
22A-2014-02490F

James W. Price v. Smedley's Chevrolet
ADRB6(24469)07312014
22A-2014-02609C

10. Withdrawal of Charge – Grant

Kevin M. O'Rourke v. Mercy College of Ohio
TOLB2(36293)12022013
22A-2014-00537C

Raynard Armstrong v. BP Products North America, Inc.
TOLA2(36305)12102013
22A-2014-00611C

Michelle H. Hughes-Tucker v. City of Toledo, Division of Environmental Services
TOLA2(36319)12172013
22A-2014-00662C

Teresa Wenning v. Joint Township District Memorial Hospital
TOLB2(36393)02182014
22A-2014-01176C

April Evans v. Federal Express Corporation dba FedEx Express
TOL72(36400)02212014
22A-2014-01203C

La'Teala Allison v. Johnson Controls, Inc.
TOL72(36416)03032014
22A-2014-01342C

Verneishia L. Williams v. Full Circle to Completion LLC
TOLG2(36699)08132014
22A-2014-02691F

Gregory Wells v. David Scheeff
AKRH4(42416)04082014
05-14-0778-8
22A-2014-01637F

Brian Ciallella v. ELEK Inc. dba Webb Cliff Apartments and Theresa Stebbins
CLEH4(42470)05142014 AMENDED
05-14-0904-8
22A-2014-01959F

Robert North v. ETI Tech, Inc.
DAYE6(23998)11042013
22A-2014-00864F

Kathy North v. ETI Tech, Inc.
DAYE6(24008)11082013
22A-2014-00732F

Withdrawal of Charge – Grant – continued

Ingrid Anderson v. City of Blue Ash; M. Weber, Mayor; Municipal & Safety Center, Dan Johnson, Zoning Administrator
DAYH6(24080)12172013
05-14-0258-8
22A-2014-00967F

Kathy North v. ETI Tech, Inc.
DAYE6(24119)01172014
22A-2014-01109F

11. Administrative Closure

Sherry & Mark Wells v. New Maplewood Apts, et al.; The Levin Group, et al.
DAYH6(24395)06172014
22A-2014-02629F

12. No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Dmitry Levitin v. Indecon Solutions, LLC
COL71(40626)11012013
22A-2014-00458C

Dmitry Levitin v. American Electric Power*
COL71(40627)11012013
22A-2014-00457C

*Commissioners Patmon and Barreras recused themselves from participation in this case

Patricia Arnold v. PNC Bank, National Association
COLB1(40630)11052014
22A-2014-00470C

Simona Clardy v. Faith Mission, Inc.
COL71(40631)11062013
22A-2014-00533C

Lillian M. Lancaster v. Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
COL71(40633)11012013
22A-2014-00453C

Victoria R. Allen v. Speedway LLC
COL71(40645)11142013
22A-2014-00468C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Ericia Howard v. Ohio State University College of Nursing*
COL71(40648)11192013
22A-2014-00698C

*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

German Valentinovich Dziebel v. Resource
COL71(40651)11262013
22A-2014-00693C

Patricia Arnold v. PNC Bank, National Association
COLB1(40654)11192014
22A-2014-00688C

Valarie LaRose v. American Electric Power Service Corporation*
COLA1(40658)11212013
22A-2014-00700C

*Commissioners Patmon and Barreras recused themselves from participation in this case

Polina Simone Page v. JPMorgan Chase & Co.*
COL71(40659)11212013
22A-2014-00699C

*Commissioner Barreras recused herself from participation in this case

Arcelia Castro v. Ohio Hispanic Coalition
COL71(40661)11252013
22A-2014-00703C

Arcelia Castro v. Columbus Neighborhood Health Center
COL71(40662)11252013
22A-2014-00702C

Stanley Butler v. Hollywood Casino
COLA1(40664)11182013
22A-2014-00701C

William Carlson Kimmel v. State of Ohio, Department of Health
COLB1(40668)11262013
22A-2014-00714C

Mary Hinton v. Franklin County Community Based Correctional Facility
COLB1(40670)11262013
22A-2014-00713C

April Lashelle Clark v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction/CRC
COL71(40676)11262013
22A-2014-00690C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Kimberly D. Benton v. Brookdale Senior Living, Inc.
COLB1(40692)12132013
22A-2014-00946C

Nwandu E. Onyekwere v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction
COL71(40694)12182013
22A-2014-00938C

David Carter v. HCR Manor Care Services, LLC, dba Heartland of Uptown Westerville
COLB1(40702)12182013
22A-2014-00935C

Floyd Collins v. Hina Environmental Solutions, LLC
COLA1(40703)12192013
22A-2014-00934C

Daniel Montoly v. The Ohio State University, Wexner Medical Center East*
COL71(40757)01302014
22A-2014-01284C
*Commissioners Patmon and Barreras recused themselves from participation in this case

David L. Norris, Jr. v. PlasmaCare Donor Center, Inc. (PlasmaCare, Inc.)
COLG1(40810)02252014
22A-2014-01591F

Johnetta Yvonne Gwinn v. State of Ohio, Department of Taxation
COL71(40819)02282014
22A-2014-01585C

Cynthia Ann Mattiaccy v. Nationwide Mutual Insurance Company*
COLB1(40848)03132014
22A-2014-01519C
*Commissioner Barreras recused herself from participation in this case

Justin Speakman v. On-Board Services, Inc
COL71(40872)03262014
22A-2014-01684C

Justin Speakman v. Schenker, Inc.
COLB1(40873)03262014
22A-2014-01760C

Jynette T. Williams v. Big Brothers and Big Sisters of Central Ohio
COLB1(40914)04142014 AMENDED
22A-2014-01907C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Alyssa Keeran v. Midwest Express, Inc.
COL71(40971)05132014
22A-2014-02175C

Alyssa Keeran v. ABC Employment Holdings dba MS Companies, LLC
COL71(40972)05132014
22A-2014-02087C

Tequila L. Barney vs. Wedgewood Village 2010 LLC and Independent Management
Services LLC dba Wedgewood Village Apartments
COLH1(40991)051920104
05-14-0929-8
22A-2014-02425F

Linda Perez v. Allied Moulded Products, Inc.
COLA1(41032)06092014
22A-2014-02442C

Daniel E. Harris, Jr. v. Central Ohio Transit Authority*
COLB1(41062)06182014
22A-2014-02798C
*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

Zyna L. Neal v. Don Elijah Macneill
COLH1(41065)06182014
05-14-1073-8
22A-2014-02659F

Kenneth James Wakefield v. Target Corporation
COL76(24005)11082013
22A-2014-00705C

Dan G. Christy v. Titan Tire Corporation of Bryan
TOLB2(36300)12062013 AMENDED
22A-2014-00586C

Zenola Sherman v. Fairview Manor Nursing Center et al, Fairview Skilled Nursing &
Rehabilitation Center; HCP CC SNF, LLC; Matthew Macklin, Executive Director; Amy
Boggs, Social Worker
TOLH2(36316)12042013
05-14-0191-8
22A-2014-00852F

Anita Kear v. Wyandot County Skilled Nursing and Rehabilitation Center
TOLB2(36320)12192013
22A-2014-00710C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Demonte Cook v. PF Toledo, LLC dba Planet Fitness
TOL72(36324)12232013
22A-2014-00772C

Donald A. Costa v. Best Buy Stores, L.P.
TOLA2(36325)12232013
22A-2014-00773C

Clara Farmer v. Chrysler Group, LLC
TOLB2(36332)12302013
22A-2014-00812C

Katina Duran v. Nationwide Insurance*
TOLA2(36333)01022014
22A-2014-00813C

*Commissioner Barreras recused herself from participation in this case

Sara Stevens v. Continental Office Furniture Corporation
TOLB2(36334)01032014
22A-2014-00817C

David W. Johnson v. Stan Koch & Sons Trucking, Inc.
TOLB2(36335)01032014
22A-2014-00818C

Joseph Peake v. SMX, LLC
TOL7(36341)01152014 AMENDED
22A-2014-00868C

Alfonso A. Crayton v. Family Dollar Stores of Ohio, Inc.
TOLG2(36343)01162014
22A-2014-00880F

Jalana A. Brantley v. Park Inn Radisson
TOL72(36347)01172014
22A-2014-00889C

Lamond Carter v. Bemis Company, Inc. dba Curwood, Inc.
TOL72(36349)01212014
22A-2014-00893C

Michael Noe v. Mobis North America LLC
TOL72(36357)01232014
22A-2014-00937C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Jose G. Rodriguez, Jr. v. Port Clinton Ford, Inc.
TOLB2(36362)01272014
22A-2014-00990C

Gregory J. Bryant v. Paulding Soil and Water Conservation District
TOLE2(36384)02102014
22A-2014-01103F

Joseph Peake v. Sauder Woodworking Co.
TOL72(36385)02112014
22A-2014-01141C

Wanda Maples et al v. Somerton Apartments, Clyde Real Estate Associates, LTD
TOLH2(36399)02202014
05-14-0543-8
22A-2014-01202F

Lacreeta Alexander et al v. Alysia May Jablonski, Owner
TOLH2(36414)02132014
05-14-0575-8
22A-2014-01356F

David Printke v. The Kroger Company
TOLB2(36432)03062014
22A-2014-01362C

James Norwood v. Johnson Controls, Inc.
TOL72(36438)03102014
22A-2014-01382C

Kyeeir Russell v. Fultz & Son, Inc.
TOL72(36453)03202014 AMENDED
22A-2014-01450C

Candy Kimberlin v. Northwest State Community College
TOLK2(36487)04072014 AMENDED
22A-2014-01632F

Damon L. Young v. Board of Education of the Toledo City School District
TOL72(36569)05212014
22A-2014-01984C

Jan K. Materni v. State of Ohio, Department of Transportation
TOL72(36593)06032014
22A-2014-02046C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Sharon Felix et al v. Reynolds Village Mobile Home Park et al; Debbie Bowen, Manager et al; Reynolds Village Limited et al; William E. Thees et al
TOLH2(36659)07142014
05-14-1340-8
22A-2014-02370F

Gina L. Hutchins v. Tireman Auto Service Centers, LTD.
TOLG2(36670)07212014
22A-2014-02456F

Deborah Parker v. Stark County, Auditor's Office and Stark County, Treasurer's Office
AKRH3(37308)02132014
22A-2014-01167F

Gloria Mason v. AIY Properties, The Woods of Fairlawn and Laura Smith
AKRH3(37328)02252014
05-14-0572-8
22A-2014-01256F

Gregory L. Lewis v. Mature Services, Inc.
AKR73(37346)03072014
22A-2014-01386C

Shelby McIntosh v. Altima Tan Corp.
AKRE3(37350)03072014
22A-2014-01405F

Raymond Greene v. Pleasant View Health Care Center, Richard Morris
AKRH3(37376)03252014
22A-2014-01507F

Rebel Stroman v. Greyhound Lines, Inc.
AKRG3(37377)03252014
22A-2014-01506F

Lori Brooks v. Midwest Waffles, Inc. dba Waffle House
AKR73(37386)04022014
22A-2014-01633C

Leo L. Belton v. Welded Construction, LP
AKRA3(37407)04142014
22A-2014-01707C

Howard J. Washington v. Welded Construction, LP
AKRA3(37409)04142014
22A-2014-01708C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Marshall Prince v. Four Corners Cleaning, Inc.
AKR73(37411)04212014
22A-2014-01929C

Carla Downing v. Share and Kare, Inc.
AKR73(37422)04232014
22A-2014-01966C

Allen Binford v. Akron Foundry Co.
AKR73(37438)05062014
22A-2014-02061C

Marshall Prince v. Four Corners Cleaning, Inc.
AKR73(37439)05072014
22A-2014-02063C

Wyetta Taylor v. Share and Kare, Inc.
AKR73(37492)06172014
22A-2014-02205C Jennifer Barnett v. Regis Corporation dba First Choice Haircutters

Jennifer Barnett v. Regis Corporation, dba First Choice Haircutters
AKRB1(40859)03112014
22A-2014-01733C

Darby Bailey v. Cleveland Metropolitan Housing Authority and Margarita Hernandez,
Site Manager
AKRH4(42281)12122013
05-14-0413-8
22A-2014-00629F

James & Kathleen Curtis v. MRWA Management LLC and Rabi M. Ridha
AKRH4(42314)0112014
05-14-0739-8
22A-2014-00858F

Sandra Outlaw v. Eric Veard and Technicians Property Incorporated dba United Property
Management
AKRH4(42377)03122014 AMENDED
22A-2014-01407F

Shirley Cooper-Williams v. MCM Southgate Gardens, LLC and Gwendolyn Newsome
AKRH4(42415)04082014 AMENDED
05-14-0827-8
22A-2014-01648F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Darby Bailey v. Cleveland Metropolitan Housing Authority and Margarita Hernandez,
Site Manager
AKRH4(42501)06032014
22A-2014-02115F

Darby Bailey v. Cleveland Metropolitan Housing Authority and Margarita Hernandez,
Site Manager
AKRH4(42568)07222014 AMENDED
22A-2014-02562F

Rustem Kazazi v. James Breen Real Estate, LLC
CLE74(42310)01092014
22A-2014-00861C

Zsa Zsa Hall v. APM Management, LLC
CLEA4(42316)01132014
22A-2014-00882C

Sharon Hamrick v. Dunbar Armored, Inc.
CLE74(42337)02062014
22A-2014-01078C

Judson Young v. Strictly Styles and Profiles, Inc.
CLEE4(42345)02112014
22A-2014-01160F

Sherri Besman v. Debbie Kuhn and Nob Hill East Condominium Owners Association,
Inc. dba The Citadel of Chagrin Valley*
CLEH4(42350)02122014
05-14-0523-8
22A-2014-01163F

* Split recommendation; Probable Cause finding on the basis of Disability against
Respondent Nob Hill East Condominium Owners Association, Inc., dba The Citadel of
Chagrin Valley; No Probable Cause on the basis of Disability against Respondent Debbie
Kuhn

Douglas Hood v. Niederst Indian Hills, LLC dba Indian Hills Senior Community
CLEH4(42359)02212014
05-14-0641-8
22A-2014-01250F

Tanishia Morris v. GCA Services Group, Inc.
CLE74(42369)02282014
22A-2014-01339C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Charles E. Patterson, Jr. v. Proterra Inc.
CLE74(42423)04152014
22A-2014-01674C

Sandra A. Chappelle v. Saint Luke's Foundation of Cleveland, Ohio
CLEE4(42442)04292014
22A-2014-01836F

Angel Collins v. Seedna Enterprises, Inc. dba Subway
CLEE4(42489)05282014
22A-2014-02030F

Carmen D. Hassel v. University Hospital
CLE74(42492)05302014
22A-2014-02051C

Demetrius Lee Pope v. The Lincoln Electric Company
CLE74(42562)07212014
22A-2014-02492C

Nana M. Watson v. Franklin University
CLEA1(40778)02112014
22A-2014-01439C

Bethlehem Mengstu v. Molina Healthcare of Ohio, Inc.
CLE71(40963)04042014
22A-2014-01948C

Marvin Parmis v. Kristen M. Scalise and Michael Migden
CLEH3(37317)02192014
22A-2014-01180F

Lisa Marie Freitas v. M Square LLC dba Motel 6
DAYE6(24001)11062013
22A-2014-00728F

Cheryl Lewis v. Navistar - International Truck & Engine
DAYB6(24018)11152013
22A-2014-01126C

Stephen A. Cook v. BEF Foods, Inc.
DAYB6(24026)11202013
22A-2014-01048C

Paul A. Gray v. Miami Valley Hospital
DAYB6(24028)11202013
22A-2014-01306C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Lauro Z. Padilla v. El Ginete, Inc. et al
DAY76(24034)11212013
22A-2014-01068C

Destin Robinson v. Bob Evans*
DAY76(24048)12032013
22A-2014-01054C

*Commissioner Barreras recused herself from participation in this case

Kim S. Adkins v. Montgomery Developmental Center
DAY76(24051)12042013
22A-2014-01079C

Valarie Corwin v. Everything Bagels
DAYG6(24062)12092013
22A-2014-00678F

Spencer Davidson v. Triple Creek Retirement Community
DAYB6(24072)12172013
22A-2014-00672C

Henry L. Island v. Nex Transport, Inc.
DAY76(24077)12192013
22A-2014-01093C

William Gaines, Jr. v. C.J. International
DAY76(24087)12272013
22A-2014-01122C

Laname Jones v. Cincinnati Children's Hospital
DAY76(24089)12302013
22A-2014-01123C

Laurie M. Bowman v. Community Action Partnership of the Greater Dayton Area
DAYB6(24092)01022014
22A-2014-00971C

Marvin Dickman v. Mercy Health Anderson Hospital
DAYB6(24141)01312014
22A-2014-01223C

Ralph Bradley v. Edna Gamblin, Manager; Siena Springs; et al.
DAYH6(24146)02042014
05-14-052508
22A-2014-01135F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Lisa K. Dean v. Springfield Regional Medical Center
DAYB6(24176)02202014
22A-2014-01329C

Jo Ann R. Keller v. Milford Care, LLC dba Arbors of Milford
DAY76(24177)02212014
22A-2014-01336C

Elizabeth L. DuBose v. Crescent Park Distribution Center
DAYA6(24187)02262014
22A-2014-01311C

Elizabeth L. DuBose v. CM Personnel Services
DAYA6(24188)02262014
22A-2014-01310C

Joe L. Smith v. American Apartment Management Company, Inc.
DAYB6(24198)03052014
22A-2014-01477C

Angela D. Link v. DCT Management LLC
DAY76(24248)04022014
22A-2014-01785C

Arion M. Lillard v. Springfield Regional Medical Center
DAY76(24281)04222014
05-14-052508
22A-2014-01820C

Michelle R. Hammon v. Stillwater Center
DAYB6(24303)05062014
22A-2014-02091C

Monique Robinson v. Kenwood Family Chiropractic, LLC dba Chiro Staffing, LLC
DAYB6(24312)05132014
22A-2014-02195C

Loretta Davison v. Club Demonstration Services (CDS)
DAYB6(24327)05202014
22A-2014-02189C

Elise S. Thompson v. Dayton Public Schools
DAY76(24331)05202014
22A-2014-02127C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Laura R. Wright v. Butler Township Police Department
DAY76(24339)05232014
22A-2014-02249C

Angela Brunson v. The Learning Care Group dba LaPetite Academy
DAY76(24353)06040214
22A-2014-02282C

Cheryl Twitty-Choate v. City of Cincinnati, Public Service, Sanitation Department
DAY76(24359)06092014
22A-2014-02280C

Michael Noll v. National Church Residences Tom Slemmer, CEO, Pat Nichols, Director,
Bristol Village Homes
DAYH6(24366)06112014
22A-2014-02552F

Bradley R. Dyer v. Schneider National
DAY76(24377)06162014
22A-2014-02608C

Peggy Jo Ankrom v. Ohio Stamping & Machine LLC
DAY76(24427)07072014
22A-2014-02955C

Melody M. Woodard v. Institute For Orthopaedic Surgery
DAY76(24429)07072014
22A-2014-02636C

Henry Sanders III v. Carpe Diem, Inc. dba Donatos Pizza
DAY76(24443)07152014
22A-2014-02630C

Jennifer Colson v. LaPiazza, New Bremen
DAY71(40690)12092013
22A-2014-00659C

Laura C. Ousley v. Gallipolis Development Center of the Ohio Department of
Developmental Disabilities*
DAYA1(40804)02102014
22A-2014-01318C

*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

Stephanie Arrizola v. L&T Truckers City, Inc.
DAY72(36299)12052013
22A-2014-00582C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Santiago S. Castillo, Jr. v. Holzer Health System
DAY72(36311)12122013
22A-2014-00621C

Yolanda Hall v. Minute Men, Inc.
DAY72(36376)02072014
22A-2014-01057C

Yolanda Hall v. General Aluminum Manufacturing Company
DAY72(36377)02072014
22A-2014-01058C

MOTION by Commissioner Mercado to approve the September 25, 2014 Confirmation Agenda with noted recusals. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

STAFF BRIEFING

The Compliance Manager informed the Commissioners that the Commission is in compliance with all notification requirements as set forth in Ohio Administrative Code Section 4112-1-04.

The Compliance Department, with the Executive Director's approval, requests the following case be deleted from today's Commissioner's Agenda, Week 3, Page 2, Item 2:

Upon Remand: Consideration of Administrative Law Judge's Report and Recommendation dated September 17, 2014; Respondent's Statement of Objections; Attorney General's Response Thereto

Administrative Law Judge Recommends Cease and Desist Order

Lee Yeager v. FirstEnergy Generation Corporation
AKR73(30548)11082005
22A-2006-00678C
Complaint No. 06-EMP-AKR-30548

MOTION by Commissioner Mercado to delete the abovementioned case from today's Commissioners Agenda. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

APPEARANCES

1. Request for Reconsideration – Respondent’s Request Deny

Jay Piatak v. Berkshire Condominium Owner’s Association, Inc.*
CLEH4(42214)10112013
05-14-0036-8
22A-2014-00207F

*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

Upon review of Respondent’s Request for Reconsideration, Bradley Dunn, Reconsideration Supervisor, recommended the Commission uphold the Regional finding of Probable Cause. Mr. Dunn, Charging Party, Representative for Respondent and Counsel for Respondent were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to uphold the Regional finding of Probable Cause. Second by Commissioner Barreras.

Roll Call Vote:

Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	ABSTAIN
Commissioner Barreras	YES
Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES

Motion carried.

2. Recommendation: Upon Reconsideration – No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Kevin Roshon Houston v. American Electric Power Service*
Corporation
COL71(40737)01162014
22A-2014-00999C

*Commissioners Patmon and Barreras recused themselves from participation in this case

Upon review of Charging Party's Request for Reconsideration, Bradley Dunn, Reconsideration Supervisor, recommended the Commission uphold the Regional finding of No Probable Cause - Dismiss. Mr. Dunn, Charging Party, Representative for Respondent and Counsel for Respondent were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Mercado to Remand the case back to the Regional office to further investigate comparable employees' issues and activities as they relates to performance. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	ABSTAIN
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	ABSTAIN

Motion carried.

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to take a brief recess. Second by Commissioner Mercado.

Roll Call Vote:

Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Barreras	YES
Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES

Motion carried.

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to return to public session. Second by Commissioner Patmon.

Roll Call Vote:

Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Barreras	YES
Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES

Motion carried

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts, in the matter of Kevin Roshon Houston v. American Electric Power Service Corporation, COL71(40737)01162014, 22A-2014-00999C, to authorize Commission Legal Counsel to subpoena documentation from Respondent establishing whether or not employees comparable to Charging Party also had performance issues and, if so, were they classified as critical or non critical issues. Second by Commissioner Mercado.

SECOND MOTION by Commissioner Barreras to also subpoena original, contemporaneous documents to support documents created and submitted by Respondent.

Roll Call Vote:

Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	ABSTAIN
Commissioner Barreras	PASS
Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES

3. Recommendation: Upon Reconsideration – No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Donald Rodney McLemore, Jr. v. Honda of America Mfg., Inc.*
COL71(40767)01282014
22A-2014-01280C

*Commissioners Patmon and Barreras recused themselves from participation in this case

Upon review of Charging Party's Request for Reconsideration, Bradley Dunn, Reconsideration Supervisor, recommended the Commission uphold the Regional finding of No Probable Cause - Dismiss. Mr. Dunn, Charging Party, Counsel for Charging Party, Representatives for Respondent and Counsel for Respondent were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Mercado to uphold the Regional finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	ABSTAIN
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	ABSTAIN

Motion carried.

COMMISSIONER'S AGENDAS

Commissioner's Agenda for Week 1

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration – No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Edward H. Suber, III v. U.S. Bank
CLEG3(37223)12052013
22A-2014-00596F

Brian Leonard v. Arbor E&T dba ResCare Workforce Services
CLE74(42353)02132014
22A-2014-01192C

Robert Merkle v. Fifth Third Bank*
DAYF6(23938)10152013
22A-2014-00579F

*Commissioner Barreras recused herself from participation in this case

Melissa Csoka-Edwards v. Buckeye Harley Davidson
DAYB1(40640)11122013
22A-2014-01127C

Housing Opportunities Made Equal v. Princeton Crossing LLC,
Vonda Brooks
DAYH6(24082)12172013
22A-2014-00968F

2. No Jurisdiction - Dismiss

John S. Krix v. Trinity Lutheran Church and School
TOLB2(36350)01212014
22A-2014-00894C

Sherry McCarver v. Board of Education of the Toledo City School
District
TOLB2(36583)05292014
22A-2014-02019C

Alice Felder v. Tshawna West
AKAH3(37491)05282014
05-14-0977-8
22A-2014-02204F

Commissioner's Agenda for Week 1 - continued

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Week 1 Agenda with the abovementioned recusal. Second by Commissioner Barreras.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioner's Agenda for Week 2

1. Request for Reconsideration - Respondent's Request – Deny

Marvin Parms v. Shirley DeCheco, Kristen M. Scalise, Kitty Castilow*

AKRH3(37168)10302013

22A-2014-00288F

*Split Recommendation; Probable Cause finding on the basis of Retaliation; No Probable Cause finding on the bases of Race-Black and Sex-Male

Fair Housing Contact Service v. Marc Lessem dba Square Management, James T. Micali

CLEH3(37251)12232013 AMENDED

05-14-0392-8

22A-2014-00790F

2. Findings Upon Reconsideration - No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Jonathan J. Lighten v. City of Toledo, Department of Public Utilities

TOL72(36256)11052013

22A-2014-00346C

Rubbie Hardeman v. Mercy Health Partners*

TOLB2(36261)11122013 AMENDED

22A-2014-00385C

*Commissioner Mercado recused herself from participation in this case

Atasha N. Gray v. Peregrine Health Services, Inc. dba Heatherdowns Residential Center

TOL72(36283)11212013 AMENDED

22A-2014-00467C

Marvin Parms v. Shirley DeCheco, Kristen M. Scalise, Kitty Castilow, Diane Gaugler,
and Jack LaMonica

AKRH3(37168)10302013

22A-2014-00288F

*Split Recommendation; Probable Cause finding on the basis of Retaliation; No Probable Cause finding on the bases of Race-Black and Sex-Male

Patricia Grant v. Bellefaire Jewish Children's Bureau

CLEB3(37310)02132014

22A-2014-01195C

Ray Ann Hinson v. Bellefaire Jewish Children's Bureau

CLEB3(37318)02192014

22A-2014-01198C

Commissioner's Agenda for Week 2 - continued

MOTION by Commissioner Mercado to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Week 2 Agenda with the abovementioned recusal. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioner's Agenda for Week 3

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration – No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Maxine Annette Collins v. Gustaw “Gus” and Jean Karwowski
COLH4(40620)10252013
05-14-0062-8
22A-2014-00419F

2. Consideration of Administrative Law Judge's Report and Recommendation

Administrative Law Judge Recommends Dismissal Order

Karen S. Sanders v. Central State University
DAYA6(20442)04272009 AMENDED
22A-2009-03170C
Complaint No. 10-EMP-DAY-20442

MOTION by Commissioner Mercado to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Week 3 Agenda. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioner's Add-On Agenda

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration – No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Amber Liane Thornsberry v. Express Scripts, Inc.
COLB1(40610)10222013
22A-2014-00506C

MOTION by Commissioner Mercado to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Add-On Agenda. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

Report from the Ohio Attorney General's Office

Patrick Dull, Assistant Attorney General, reported that the Civil Rights Section conducted a seminar, "Guide for the Small Business Landlord - Navigating Fair Housing Laws and Enforcement," in Richfield Ohio on September 15th.

Commissioner Mercado attended the recent AG retreat. The Commissioners are always welcome at this annual training meeting.

The Civil Rights Section of the Ohio Attorney General's Office would like to resume training sessions with the Commissioners.

Report from the Chief Legal Counsel

Stephanie Bostos Demers and Lori Anthony, Chief, Civil Rights Section, are drafting two technical policies for sections for the Commissioner's Guidance Manual. The first addresses service animals in housing, employment and public accommodation cases and the second addresses veterans' standing when filing charges based on military status.

There will be two applications for Certification of a Bona Fide Occupational Qualification on the next meeting.

All staff will attend the required annual ethics training before the end of the year.

Report from the Executive Director, G. Michael Payton

Director Payton announced the Sixth Annual Civil Rights Hall of Fame will be October 2, 2014 in the Ohio Statehouse.

Our next meeting will be held in Herrick Hall Auditorium on the campus of Denison University in Granville, Ohio.

Remarks

Commissioner Mercado thanked the Attorney General's office for including her in their retreat and commended them for their outreach to the business community.

Commissioner Roberts suggested Commissioners consider scheduling an all day training retreat with the Ohio Attorney General.

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to adjourn the public meeting. Second by Commissioner Mercado.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

The regular meeting of The Ohio Civil Rights Commission was ADJOURNED at 12:50 pm.

* * *

Commissioner

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to adjourn the public meeting. Second by Commissioner Mercado.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

The regular meeting of The Ohio Civil Rights Commission was ADJOURNED at 12:50 pm.

* * *



Commissioner