

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF
THE OHIO CIVIL RIGHTS COMMISSION**

February 21, 2013

The Ohio State University

Michael E. Moritz College of Law (Drinko Hall)

Saxbe Auditorium

Columbus, Ohio

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Hubert called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.

Commissioners Present:

Chairman Leonard Hubert

Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik

Commissioner Tom Roberts

Commissioner Stephanie Mercado

Commissioner William Patmon, III

A quorum was present.

OCRC Staff Present:

G. Michael Payton, Executive Director; Keith McNeil, Director of Operations; Norman Gibson, Dayton Regional Director; Darlene Newbern, Toledo Regional Director; Aman Mehra, Columbus Regional Director; Vera Boggs, Cleveland Regional Director; Ronnell Tomlinson, Director of Housing; Courtney Calhoun, Reconsideration Supervisor; Bradley Dunn, Reconsideration Supervisor; Pat Dull, Assistant Attorney General Civil Rights Section, Attorney General's Office; Desmon Martin, Director of Enforcement and Compliance and Carol Swartzmiller, Administrative Assistant.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Commissioner Roberts moved to approve the January 31, 2013 minutes. Seconded by Commissioner Mercado.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner William Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

CONFIRMATION OF STAFF FINDINGS

1. **Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Vacate Original No Probable Cause Finding and Grant for Further Review**

Leon D. Murphy v. City of Columbus, Division of Fire
COLA1(39313)04042012
22A-2012-01872C

Kathleen Martin v. State of Ohio, Ohio Department of Job and Family Services
COL71(39340)04182012
22A-2012-02029C

Krista Nye v. Dental Reflections, Daniel R. Whittaker, DMD, Inc. dba Family Dental Care of Napoleon, Inc.
TOLA2(35148)03282012
22A-2012-01553C

Willena Lareea Banks v. HVM L.L.C. dba Extended Stay Hotels
TOL72(35149)03282012
22A-2012-01555C

Valerie D. McCampbell v. Owens State Community College
TOLB2(35158)03302012
22A-2012-01592C

Curtis L. Turner v. Cloverleaf Cold Storage Co.
TOL72(35178)04112012
22A-2012-01715C

Sherjewel Clark v. Signature Health, Inc.
TOL74(41424)02282012
22A-2012-01323C

Sherjewel Clark v. Signature Health, Inc.
TOL74(41455)03222012
22A-2012-01529C

Tari L. Stewart v. The W. W. Williams Company
AKR71(39386)05022012
22A-2013-00140C

Michelle L. White v. Raneri, LLC dba Mandi's Playhouse
CLEE4(41752)10182012
22A-2013-00256F

Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Vacate Original No Probable Cause Finding and Grant for Further Review (Cont'd)

William Cargill III v. Enterprise Rent-a-Car
DAYG6(22871)04062012
22A-2012-01962F

Yelena Lippke v. Sinclair Community College
DAYK6(22933)05072012
22A-2012-03138F

David L. Wellborn v. RockTenn Services, Inc.
DAYB6(23150)08212012
22A-2012-03056C

2. Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Deny - Untimely

Ronald J. Smith v. State of Ohio, Department of Natural Resources
AKR71(39208)02292012
22A-2012-01313C

3. Withdrawal of Charge; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General's Office

Fair Housing Advocates Association v. Arthur Burton
DAYH6(19324)05142007
22A-2007-04991F
Complaint No. 07-HOU-DAY-19324

4. Withdrawal of Chare with Settlement; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General's Office

Fair Housing Resource Center v. Rosebuck Properties, LTD, et al.
CLEH4(40157)03052010
05-10-0735-8
22A-2010-02621F
Complaint No. 11-HOU-CLE-40157

5. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order; Dismiss Formal Complaint Submitted by the Attorney General's Office

Samantha Luz Ramos v. Solomon Oil Company
COL71(38623)06012011
22A-2011-02957C
Complaint No. 12-EMP-COL-38623

Bertha Faunce v. Heritage Commercial, LLC, Nick Wlasiuk and Paul Wlasiuk
TOLH2(35067)02132012
22A-2012-01131F
Complaint No. 12-HOU-TOL-35067

Caden R. Hanson v. Stein Hospice Service, Inc.
DAYB6(22264)06062011
22A-2011-03127C
Complaint No. 12-EMP-DAY-22264

6. Independent Settlement; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General's Office

Johnnye Warnsley v. Board of Education, Toledo City School District
TOL72092605(29755)092605
22A-2006-00276C
Complaint No. 10093

Johnnye Warnsley v. Board of Education, Toledo City School District
TOL72060304(28950)111604
22A-2005-00841C
Complaint No. 9955

7. Res Judicata/Collateral Estoppel – Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General's Office

Johnnye Warnsley v. Toledo Federation of Teachers Foundation
TOL72092605(29756)092605
22A-2006-00277C
Complaint No. 10092

Johnnye Warnsley v. Toledo Federation of Teachers, Local 250
TOL72060304(28949)111604
22A-2005-00842C
Complaint No. 9954

8. Issue Cease & Desist Order – Submitted by the Attorney General’s Office

Sabur Jabbar v. Bryan Parks
AKRH3(33445)05272008
22A-2008-04100F
Complaint No. 08-HOU-AKR-33445

Robert L. Jackson, Jr. v. North Shore Auto Sales, Inc. dba J.D. Byrider
CLE74(38438)10222007
22A-2008-01930C
Complaint No. 08-EMP-CLE-38438

9. Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation

Kimberly Pollard v. Custom Employee Management, Inc. dba Custom Staffing
Management
COL71(39318)04102012
22A-2012-01876C

Chandra L. Smith v. Ohio American Health Care, Inc.
COLB1(39324)04122012
22A-2012-01879C

Eric Grinston v. Columbus Baking Company
COL71(39356)04242012
22A-2012-02083C

Kristin Lyn Heinmiller v. South Beach Fitness Center LLC
COL71(39721)09172012
22A-2013-00909C

Chester R. Maurer v. Chipotle Mexican Grill, Inc.
AKR73(36353)04202012
22A-2012-01904C

Albert A. Bias v. Eco Tree Services, LLC
CLEB4(41714)09182012
22A-2012-03111C

Housing Opportunities Made Equal v. Michael L & Deanna K Weber
DAYH6(23155)08212012
05-12-1049-8
22A-2013-00010F

Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation (Cont'd)

Lateefah Lowe v. Vu Vinh V & Ty T Dao, Owners
DAYH6(23157)08212012
05-12-1250-8
22A-2013-00032F

Amber Johnson v. Vu Vinh V & Ty T Dao, Owners
DAYH6(23232)09142012
05-12-1401-8
22A-2013-00021F

Patrece Stallworth v. Vu Vinh V & Ty T Dao, Owners
DAYH6(23305)10182012
05-13-0013-8
22A-2013-01388F

10. Issue Formal Complaint

Housing Research & Advocacy Center v. Mayflower Condominium Association
CLEH4(41444)03052012
05-12-1007-8
22A-2012-01668F

Saunya Moore v. Vladimire Putin
DAYH6(22796)02232012
05-12-0482-8
22A-2012-01862F

Jody Smith v. William Shumaker, et al.
DAYH4(41460)03202012
05-12-0607-8
22A-2012-01840F

11. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order After A Finding of Probable Cause

Dawn S. Smith v. James O'Neil and Looper Properties, LLC
CLEH4(41446)03072012
05-12-0554-8
22A-2012-01670F

12. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination – Close

Fair Housing Contact Service v. Edward G& Cheryl A Smith, Trustees
AKRH3(36317)04022012
05-12-1553-8
22A-2012-01768F

Nora Waller v. GMS Management
AKRH3(36573)10012012
05-13-0111-8
22A-2013-00004F

HR&AC v. Realty Trust Services, LLC
CLEH4(41573)05242012
05-12-0888-8
22A-2012-02399F

Dorothy Pazos v. Hollister House; Wallick / Stern-Hendy Properties, LLC
DAYH6(22922)05022012
05-12-0739-8
22A-2012-02608F

Lori McDonald v. Gerald Walters, Jr., Professional Property Management L.L.C. and Robert Hamilton
DAYH6(23392)12112012
05-13-0183-8
22A-2013-01047F

Jayne Abernathy on behalf of Tamara Zimmer v. Kelleys Island Ferry Boat Line
ADRG2(35493)09202012
22A-2012-03147F

Marianne C. Moscato v. Area Office on Aging of Northwestern Ohio
ADRB2(35622)11282012
22A-2013-00722C

Maria A. Casillas v. Silgan Can Company
ADRB2(35678)12212012
22A-2013-01057C

Sarah E. Green v. Golden Corral
ADRG2(35685)01022013
22A-2013-01073F

**Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination –
Close (Cont'd)**

Sandra L. Johnson v. Aramark Food Service, LLC
ADRA2(35706)01142013
22A-2013-01198C

Stark County Fair Housing Department v. Shelly Lorius, Robert Lorius and RLSL LLC
ADRH3(36351)04202012
05-12-0797-8
22A-2012-01902F

Elizabeth A. Whelpdale v. J.B. Dollar Stretcher Magazine
ADRG3(36638)12052012
22A-2013-00810F

Shelila Ingram v. Lincoln Square Apartments, Deloris Hicks and Tshuna West
ADRH3(36660)12132012
05-13-0357-8
22A-2013-01157F

Fair Housing Contact Service, Inc. v. David Hite and Ann Hite
ADRH3(36681)12212012
05-13-0457-8
22A-2013-01182F

Margaret Knigga-Daugherty v. J.B. Dollar Stretcher Magazine
ADRG6(23398)12132012
22A-2013-01081F

Jamie A. Lockett v. 5 Star Hotel Management II, LP dba Hawthorne Suites
ADR76(23425)01022013
22A-2013-01188C

13. Independent Settlement - Close

George Haycraft v. Taylor Hyundai, Inc.
TOLA2(35194)04202012
22A-2012-01762C

14. Withdrawal of Charge – With Settlement

Crystal Kupar v. Dr. Alan Gillogly
COLG1(39540)07102012
22A-2012-02908F

John Wesley Carson v. Source One Transportation, LLC.
COL71(39862)11132012
22A-2013-00709C

Salma Hersi v. Full-Care Home Health, LLC
COL71(39878)11202012
22A-2013-00677C

Suzette A. Daniel v. Med1Care, LLC
TOL72(35192)04202012
22A-2012-01760C

Tykeisha Crawford v. Family Dollar Stores of Ohio, Inc.
TOL72(35485)09182012
22A-2012-03117C

Linda Carr v. Norplas Industries, Inc.
TOL72(35641)12042012
22A-2013-00792C

Derric Williams v. AK Tube LLC
TOL72(35671)12182012
22A-2013-00990C

Darrell A. Hill v. J.V. Financial Group, LLC
AKRB3(36512)08162012
22A-2012-02810C

Lawrence Thomas v. Alcoa, Inc.
AKR74(41648)07232013
22A-2012-02512C

Erin Stewart v. Bank of America
DAYB6(23084)07182012
22A-2013-00445C

Patricia A. Hayley v. Paul Brown Stadium
DAYG6(23149)08202012
22A-2012-03055F

Withdrawal of Charge – With Settlement (Cont'd)

Cheri L Keita v. Montgomery County Credit Union, Inc.
DAY76(23322)10292012
22A-2013-00557C

Lynne Mitchell-Heaggans v. City of Columbus, Division of Police
ADRB1(39791)10162012
22A-2013-00804C

Michael Evans v. Sysco Cleveland, Inc.
ADRB1(39889)11292012
22A-2013-00931C

Virginia J. Clark v. Grand Plaza Hotel
ADR72(35615)11262012
22A-2013-00639C

Steven V. Daunhauer v. Lowe's Home Improvement
ADR72(35645)12062012
22A-2013-00846C

Timothy Rose et al v. Fifth Third Bank et al; Judy Ryan, Mortgage Loan Officer
ADRH2(35691)10262012
05-13-0067-8
22A-2013-01162F

Thomas A. Tate v. Lowe's Distribution 990
ADR72(35729)01252013
22A-2013-01319C

Marvin Bush v. Dave Towell Cadillac, Inc.
ADR73(36663)12142012
22A-2013-01160C

Valerie J. Salyerds v. J & K Subway, Inc. dba Subway
ADRG3(36719)01182013
22A-2013-01267F

Stephanie Gray v. Community Assessment and Treatment Services, Inc.
ADR74(41834)01102013
22A-2013-01235C

Jose E. Silva v. American Signature Inc. dba Value City Furniture
ADRB4(41844)01222013
22A-2013-01304C

15. Withdrawal of Charge - Grant

Kimberly P. Cooper v. Mount Carmel Health System, Inc.
COLB1(39570)07182012
22A-2012-02842C

Commissioner Patmon recused himself from the above case (39570).

Nancy J. Sparks v. Black Swamp Area Council, Inc., Boy Scouts of America
TOLA2(35181)04122012
22A-2012-01743C

John Johnson v. The Toledo Hospital
TOL72(35187)04182012
22A-2012-01752C

Billy D. Brown v. Magna Modular Systems, Inc. dba T.E.A.M. Systems
TOL72(35395)08062012
22A-2012-02597C

Juanita R. Bezdek v. Lake Tomahawk Property Owners Association, Inc.
AKRA3(36581)10052012
22A-2013-00168C

Paul E. Marich, Jr. v. Cleveland Express Limousine Services, LLC
AKRB4(41785)11152012
22A-2013-00474C

James Boyd v. Towne Properties; Angela Shade
ADRH6(23406)12182012
05-13-0237-8
22A-2013-01099F

16. Failure to Cooperate - Dismiss

Jessica Adams v. Randall Cunagin
DAYH6(23387)12112012
05-13-0162-8
22A-2013-01042F

Robin Harries v. David Stephens
DAYH6(23422)12272012
05-13-0239-8
22A-2013-01187F

17. Failure to Accept Full Remedy - Dismiss

Wesley Schoenhofer v. NZR Retail of Toledo, Inc. dba Stop & Shop
TOLG2(35261)05252012
22A-2012-02103F

18. Administrative Closure

Steven Reed v. Faithful & Gould, Inc.
TOLB2(35244)05172012 AMENDED
22A-2012-02001C

Janet M. Steadman v. State of Ohio, Department of Health
AKRB1(39493)06212012
22A-2012-02375C

19. No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Ruth James v. State of Ohio, Department of Job and Family Services
COL71(39278)03272012
22A-2012-01793C

Lidia Lea Conkle v. Delaware County Sheriff's Office
COL71(39286)03282012
22A-2012-01811C

Tonya Thomas v. Smith Clinic Department of Psychiatry
COLG1(39344)04192012
22A-2012-02032F

Ralph Harris, Jr. v. Columbus State Community College
COLA1(39348)04232012
22A-2012-02060C

Tiffany Robertson v. Comprehensive Medical Data Management, L.L.C. d/b/a Advocate
Radiology Billing and Reimbursement Specialists
COL71(39350)04232012
22A-2012-02061C

Nasir Saed v. Thirty-One Gifts, LLC
COL71(39355)04242012
22A-2012-02082C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss (Cont'd)

Mary E. Helfers v. State of Ohio, Department of Taxation
COLB1(39357)04242012
22A-2012-02084C

Alice DeAnne Hill v. State of Ohio, Public Defender Commission
COL71(39358)04242012
22A-2012-02085C

Lee Stamp v. Friendly Transportation Services, Inc.
COL 71 (39367) 04262012
22A-2012-02091C

Jackie Lynn Lewis v. Franklin County Court of Common Pleas Division of Domestic
Relations and Juvenile Branch
COLB1(39368)04262012
22A-2012-02092C

Stephanie M. Neely v. Safe Auto Insurance Company
COLB1(39379)05012012
22A-2012-02117C

James Eugene Gordon v. House of Hope, Inc.
COL71(39399)05082012
22A-2012-02797C

Keith Robert Krzeminski v. Ohio School Facilities Commission
COL71(39420)05152012
22A-2013-01015C

Larry King v. IForce
COL71(39422)05142012
22A-2013-01017C

Griffin Kamus v. Mount Carmel Health System dba Mount Carmel East
COL71(39442)05242012
22A-2012-02520C

Commissioner Patmon recused himself from the above case (39442).

Landon M. Ward v. Stumptown Lumber & Pallet Mills LTD
COLB1(39451)05292012
22A-2013-01029C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss (Cont'd)

Christopher Scott v. Auto direct, LLC, dba Toyota Direct
COL71(39487)06202012
22A-2012-02697C

Faatimah F. & Bilal J. Sabir v. Dominion Homes, Inc., Omni Community Association
Managers, LLC and Canal Cove Association, Inc.
COLH1(39504)05312012
05-12-1070-8
22A-2012-02996F

Carrie Puck v. Valhalla Enterprises
COLH1(39505)06152012,
05-12-1065-8
22A-2012-02995F

Anita Marfo v. Thirty-One Gifts
COL71(39591)07312012
22A-2012-02740C

Kantz and Bethany LaPorte v. Brice Developments, LLC and New Village Communities,
LLC dba Kensington Commons
COLH1(39602)08012012
05-12-1263-8
22A-2012-03001F

Ranetta C. Pack v. Scioto Downs, Inc.
COL71(39611)08072012
22A-2012-02725C AMENDED

Aminata Sow v. ACS @ Xerox, LLC
COL71(39615)08072012
22A-2012-02724C

Arvind Shah v. State of Ohio, Auditor of State
COL71(39631)08132012
22A-2013-00129C

Kantz and Bethany LaPorte v. Brice Road Developments, LLC and New Village
Communities, LLC dba Kensington Commons
COLH1(39646)08202012
22A-2012-03010F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss (Cont'd)

Dalena M. Hand v. RPM Midwest, LLC
COLH1(39664)07312012
05-12-1205-8
22A-2012-02997F

Chantilly C. Farmer-Robinson v. Donald R. & Janice A. Lyons
COLH1(39665)08012012
05-12-1211-8
22A-2012-03002F

Anthony Richards v. Elisabeth A. Belkin-Kaps
COLH1(39668)08152012
05-12-1269-8
22A-2012-03007F

Saneice Gates v. Old Village Ohana, LLC
COLH1(39671)08272012
05-12-1361-8
22A-2012-03013F

Kenneth R. Darby v. Carpenter Hall, LTD & Buckeye Management Company dba
Carpenter Hall Apartments
COLH1(39676)08282012
05-12-1360-8
22A-2012-03015F

Harold G. Hawkins v. PNC Bank, National Association
COLH1(39684)09042012
05-12-1382-8
22A-2012-03025F

Monet D. Chitison v. Stephen M. Smith & Katheryne Larimore-Smith & Ohio Capital
Resources LLC
COLH1(39686)09052012
05-12-1391-8
22A-2012-03028F

Rachel B. Miller v. DataCenter.BZ, LLC
COL71(39691)08062012
22A-2013-00461C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss (Cont'd)

Barbara J. Sherbourne v. Coulter Venture, LLC dba Rogue Fitness
COLB1(39701)09062012
22A-2013-00871C

Ramona Michaela Babu v. MS Companies, LLC
COL71(39719)09182012
22A-2013-00888C

Brett K. Zumfelde v. The Ohio State University
COL71(39722)09172012
22A-2013-00976C

Commissioner Patmon recused himself from the above case (39722).

Jondrea Burke v. Loving Hearts, LLC
COL71(39797)10182012
22A-2013-00798C

Rachel Hall v. Easton Shoes, Incorporated
COLE1(39826)10152012
22A-2013-00533F

Michael D. Bell v. Byers Imports, LLC
COL71(39849)11072012
22A-2013-00500C

Judy Ann Heskett v. Kingston National Bank
COLA1(39917)12112012
22A-2013-01006C

Judy Ann Heskett v. Dollar General Corporation
COLA1(39918)12112012
22A-2013-01008C

Paul A. Schybal v. Alfred Nickles Bakery Inc.
COLB4(41691)08232012
22A-2013-00904C AMENDED

Ida Hartfield v. Lucas County Board of Elections
TOL72(35162)040302012 AMENDED
22A-2012-01616C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss (Cont'd)

Eva M. Smith v. Sorenson Communications, Inc.
TOL72(35173)04092012
22A-2012-01675C

Victor K. Colbert v. American Broadband & Telecommunications, Inc.
TOLA2(35174)04102012
22A-2012-01711C

Victoria D. Colbert v. American Broadband & Telecommunications, Inc.
TOL72(35175)04102012
22A-2012-01712C

Andrew L. Paris v. Blanchard Valley Hospital
TOL72(35177)04112012
22A-2012-01714C

Angela Walton v. General Motors LLC
TOL72(35186)04132012 AMENDED
22A-2012-01751C

Mary H. Guillen v. Communicare Health Services, Inc. dba Advanced Specialty Hospital
of Toledo
TOL72(35191)04192012
22A-2012-01759C

Teresa Mitchell v. Owl Staffing LLC dba Page Plus Cellular
TOLA2(35193)04202012
22A-2012-01761C

Shawna Giddens v. Ohio Department of Rehabilitation and Correction
TOL72(35196)04202012 AMENDED
22A-2012-01773C

Terrail D. West v. The Laurels of Toledo, LLC
TOL72(35199)04242012
22A-2012-01800C

Brittany Noller v. Speedway LLC
TOL72(35200)04242012
22A-2012-01801C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss (Cont'd)

Dawn R. McNulty v. Covenant Care Ohio, Inc. dba Edgewood Manor Nursing Center
TOLA2(35202)04252012
22A-2012-01825C

Ernesto Vargas v. Rod's Bar & Grill, LLC
TOLG2(35221)05092012
22A-2012-01936F

Kimberly L. Jenkins v. Impact Employment Solutions, Inc.
TOL72(35225)05092012
22A-2012-01940C

Tommie E. Lee v. University of Toledo Medical Center
TOL72(35258)05242012
22A-2012-02100C

Andrew L. Paris v. Blanchard Valley Hospital
TOL72(35390)08022012
22A-2012-02573C

Tashawn Williams v. Toledo Gold Exchange, LLC
TOLG2(35406)08132012
22A-2012-02720F

Carol Aldrich Gray v. Fruchtmann Marketing
TOLA2(35421)08202012
22A-2012-02878C

Tiffany Cox v. Lourdes University
TOLK2(35471)09112012
22A-2012-03023F

Frederick D. Bell Jr. v. City of Toledo, Department of Water Distribution
TOL72(35595)11142012
22A-2013-00487C

Denise Russell v. City of Toledo, Department of Neighborhoods
TOL72(35601)11162012 AMENDED
22A-2013-00491C

Clarence Griffin v. Dialysis Partners of Northwest Ohio, LLC
TOLG2(35628)11302012
22A-2013-00740F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss (Cont'd)

Lisa D. Boecker-Snyder v. New Glass Bowl Lanes
TOL72(35648)12072012
22A-2013-00859C

Carolyn A. Southward v. Progressive Stamping, Inc.
TOLB6(22916)05012012
22A-2012-02055C

Caroline Parr v. Portage Private Industry Council, Inc. d/b/a Portage Learning Centers
AKRB3(36352)04202012
22A-2012-01903C

Knobi Ysumde v. Winking Lizard, Inc.
AKR73(36452)06292012
22A-2012-02329C

Vonell Sadler v. Humility of Mary Health Partners, St. Elizabeth Health Center
AKRB3(36506)08132012
22A-2012-02732C

Corey S. Smith v. United National Security, Inc.
AKR73(36509)08152012
22A-2012-02809C

Parceanur A. Whittsette v. State of Ohio, Rehabilitation Services Commission
AKR73(36536)09042012
22A-2012-03035C

Duane Hayes v. Triad Staffing
AKR73(36542)09072012
22A-2013-03040C

Duane Hayes v. Waste Management of Ohio, Inc.
AKR73(36544)09072012
22A-2012-03042C

Christopher Anthony Hartman v. Compco Industries, Incorporated
AKRB3(36545)09102012
22A-2012-03043C

Parceanur A. Whittsette v. State of Ohio, Rehabilitation Services Commission
AKR73(36552)09172012
22A-2012-03097C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss (Cont'd)

Gary J. Antonio v. Shree Krishna, Inc. dba Best Western Plus North Canton, Inn & Suites
AKRA3(36566)09242012
22A-2012-03169C

Patricia Antos v. Nestle USA, Inc.
AKRA3(36630)11212012
22A-2013-00688C

Stark County Fair Housing v. Gary Lee & FHL Enterprises
AKRH3(36645)12102012
22A-2013-00918F

Harla Williams v. Gary Lee & FHL Enterprises
AKRH3(36646)12102012
22A-2013-00919F

Jibril Abdullah v. Blick Clinic, Inc.
AKRA3(36648)12102012
22A-2013-00916C

Victor Lewis v. The American Building Company dba Dr. Pepper Snapple Group
AKR71(39708)09102012
22A-2013-00889C

Beverly A. Wyatt v. Candle Coach, LLC
AKRG3(36709)01112013
22A-2013-01222F

Audrey Ransey v. General Motors LLC
AKR72(35190)04192012
22A-2012-01756C

Willie Copeland, Jr. v. International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local Union No.
8 dba IBEW
AKR72(35538)10112012
22A-2013-00116C

Stacy A. Polocy v. Gregory L. Wiemken, D.P.M., Inc.
AKRE4(41536)05102012
22A-2013-00119F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss (Cont'd)

Martin P. Murphy v. County of Cuyahoga, Office of the County Executive
AKRA4(41539)05142012
22A-2013-00124C

Leonard R. Norwood v. Kalkreuth Roofing & Sheet Metal, Inc.
AKRB4(41610)06262012
22A-2012-02314C

Leonard R. Norwood v. Kalkreuth Roofing & Sheet Metal, Inc.
AKRB4(41611)06262012
22A-2012-02315C

Erika Baum v. Vascular & Endovascular Specialist of Ohio, Inc.
AKR74(41627)07112012
22A-2012-02442C

Erica Herring v. Standard Parking Corporation
AKR74(41774)11052012
22A-2013-00373C

Joe Lintz v. DeVry University, Inc.
AKR74(41776)11082012
22A-2013-00468C

Kenneth Smith v. Field Works, LLC
CLE74(41566)05292012
22A-2012-02390C

Je'neen V. Willams v. Field Works, LLC
CLE74(41621)07052012
22A-2012-02429C

Ruby J. Kelly v. Transworld Systems, Inc.
CLE74(41638)07172012
22A-2012-02468C

Sonia L. Kimble v. Transitional Living Centers, Inc.
CLEA4(41679)08152012
22A-2012-02776C

Robin Lynn Hosey v. GMRI, Inc. dba Red Lobster
CLEB4(41699)08282012
22A-2012-02955C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss (Cont'd)

Marcia Murico-Kovac v. State of Ohio, Department of Mental Health
CLEB4(41710)09072012
22A-2012-03051C

Robin Lynn Hosey v. GMRI, Inc. dba Red Lobster
CLE74(41716)09182012
22A-2012-03134C

Robin Lynn Hosey v. GMRI, Inc. dba Red Lobster
CLEB4(41717)00192012
22A-2012-03135C

Felisha F. Holcomb v. Deluxe Manufacturing Operations, Inc., a subsidiary of Deluxe Corporation
CLEB4(41722)09212012
22A-2012-03177C

Kimberley D. Cook v. Jai Hari, LLC dba Simply Food
CLEE4(41767)08032012
532-2012-02092F

Lonnie Petrie v. Mike Gisondo Auto Service, LLC
CLEE4(41799)11292012
22A-2013-00784F

Randy J. Seymore v. QSL of Sheffield, Inc. dba Quaker Steak & Lube
CLE74(41802)11302012
22A-2013-00820C

Debra J. Laws v. Autoneum North America, Inc.
CLEA2(35631)12032012
22A-2013-00766C

Tasha Langenkamp v. Upper Valley Medical Center
DAY76(22854)03292012
22A-2012-01831C

Sallie Cooper; Richard Chadwick v. Belmont Properties
DAYH6(22855)03292012
05-12-0801-8
22A-2013-00223F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss (Cont'd)

Nadia Lynn Smith v. Southern Ohio Medical Center
DAY76(22911)04272012
22A-2012-02145C

Gregory Randolph v. Miami Woodworking
DAYB6(22927)05042012
22A-2013-00018C

Michael C. Fleishman v. Edison Community College
DAYB6(22936)05092012
22A-2012-02866C

Deborah K. Denny v. The Union Institute & University
DAYB6(22937)05252012
22A-2012-02869C

Housing Opportunities Made Equal v. The Courtyard, Dominion Management Services, LLC, Kathy Smith, Regional Manager, Acting Community Manager, Jacki Buie, Cincinnati Leasing Housing Associates I, LP Respondent
DAYH6(22950)05162012
05-12-0836-8
22A-2013-00298F

Heather J. Maddux v. Mercy Siena Retirement Community
DAYB6(22961)05222012
22A-2013-00071C

Brent Piphus v. Ford Motor Company
DAY76(22971)05252012
22A-2013-00111C

Ebony Young v. UC Physicians, Inc.
DAY76(22976)05302012
22A-2012-02276C

Robert Dornbusch v. The Courtyard, Dominion Management Services, LLC, Kathy Smith, Regional Manager, Acting Community Manager, Jacki Buie, Cincinnati Leasing Housing Associates, I, LP
DAYH6(22983)06012012
05-12-0858-8
22A-2013-00296F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss (Cont'd)

Christian D. Johnson v. Miller Management, LLC dba Burger King
DAYB6(23040)06282012
22A-2013-00659C

Martin Phillips v. Act Fast
DAY76(23048)07032012
22A-2013-00123C

Nicolette Thornhill v. Bob Evans Farms, Inc.
DAYB6(23164)08232012
22A-2012-03067C

Barbara Beachler v. Sam's East, Inc.
DAYB6(23167)08232012
22A-2012-03070C

Carla Lewis v. Choices, Inc.
DAY76(23181)08292012
22A-2013-00426C

Housing Opportunities Made Equal v. Courtney J. Tudor
DAYH6(23191)08312012
05-12-1341-8
22A-2013-00030F

Dwight Phillips v. Jasper Roofing Company
DAYA6(23223)09132012
22A-2013-00103C

Amy Binder v. Lima Lincoln-Reineke Family of Dealerships
DAY76(23295)10112012
22A-2013-00587C

Judy A. Elam v. Country Maid Bakery, Inc.
DAYA6(23297)10162012
22A-2013-00623C

Michael Stiles v. St. Vincent DePaul
DAY76(23298)10162012
22A-2013-00375C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss (Cont'd)

Carole W. Bowman v. Cancer Support Community
DAYA6(23301)10172012
22A-2013-00553C

Sharon Cooke v. Cancer Support Community
DAYA6(23302)10172012
22A-2013-00554C

Fred P James IV v. Rock-Tenn Services, Inc.
DAYB6(23311)10222012
22A-2013-00307C

Janet Gora v. Down Syndrome Association of Greater Cincinnati
DAY76(23312)10222012
22A-2013-00308C

David Todd v. Walmart Stores East,
DAY76(23327)10312012
22A-2013-00539C

Joanne Johnson-Spencer v. The Christ Hospital
DAYA6(23359)11152012
22A-2013-00640C

Commissioner Mercado moved to approve the Confirmation Agenda. Seconded by Commissioner Roberts.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

STAFF BRIEFING

The Compliance Manager informed the Commissioners that the Commission is in compliance regarding notification requirements as set forth in Ohio Administrative Code Section 4112-1-04.

The Compliance Department, with the Executive Director's approval, requests that the following case be deleted from the Week 3 agenda:

No Jurisdiction; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General's Office

Kwame Dadzie v. Bowling Green State University
TOLK2 (33754) 04302010
22A 2010 0206F
Complaint No. 11-EDU-TOL-33754

The Compliance Department, with the Executive Director's approval, requests that the following case be deleted from the Confirmation agenda:

No Probable Cause - Dismiss

John White v. Lima Memorial Hospital
DAYB6 (23227) 09132012
22A 2013 00980C

Commissioner Patmon moved to adopt the above deletions from Week 3 and the Confirmation Agenda. Seconded by Commissioner Roberts.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

APPEARANCES

1. No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Mandy Dezeree Hardiman v. Airtron Heating and Air Conditioning, Inc.
COL71 (39803) 10232012
22A 2013 00789C

Bradley Dunn, Reconsideration Supervisor, recommended that Charging Party's request for reconsideration be denied. No new information was provided to warrant a change in the Region's original recommendation of No Probable Cause.

The parties appeared to discuss the above mentioned case. The Charging Party alleged that Respondent terminated her because of her sex, pregnancy.

Commissioner Yajnik moved to adopt the Regional recommendation and adopt the No Probable Cause finding. Seconded by Commissioner Patmon.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	NO
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	NO
Commissioner William Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

2. Certification of Bona Fide Occupational Qualification - Grant

1. Echoing Hills Village, Inc.
 - President/CEO
 - Executive Vice President/Chief Financial Officer
 - Vice President of Gift Planning & Public Relations
 - Vice President of Human Resources
 - Director of Habilitation Services
 - Regional Director
 - Program Director
 - QDDP
 - Direct Support Professionals
 - Chaplin/Campus Administrator
 - Camp Administrator
 - Camp Program Director
 - Volunteer Outreach Coordinator
 - Camp Program Assistant
 - Camp Registered Nurse
 - Cabin Leader

EchoingU

- Executive Director
- Campus Supervisor
- Class Coordinator
- Director of Community Based Services

Desmon Martin, Director of Enforcement and Compliance, recommended that the BFOQ be granted in its entirety.

The requesting party appeared to discuss the above mentioned case.

Commissioner Roberts moved to Grant the BFOQ in the above matter. Seconded by Commissioner Patmon.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

3. No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Sherjewel Clark v. Signature Health, Inc.
TOL74 (41424) 02282012
22A 2012 01323C

Darlene Newbern, Toledo Regional Director and Inder LeVesque, Toledo Supervisor, recommended that Charging Party’s request for reconsideration be denied. No new information was provided to warrant a change in the Region’s original recommendation of No Probable Cause.

The parties appeared to discuss the above mentioned case. The Charging Party alleged that Respondent engaged in an unlawful discriminatory practice due to race, black and retaliation.

Commissioner Roberts moved to adopt the Regional recommendation and adopt the No Probable Cause finding. Seconded by Commissioner Mercado.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

4. No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Sherjewel Clark v. Signature Health, Inc.
TOL74 (41455) 03222012
22A 2012 01529C

Darlene Newbern, Toledo Regional Director and Inder LeVesque, Toledo Supervisor, recommended that Charging Party’s request for reconsideration be denied. No new information was provided to warrant a change in the Region’s original recommendation of No Probable Cause.

The parties appeared to discuss the above mentioned case. The Charging Party alleged that Respondent disciplined her in retaliation for filing a previous charge.

Commissioner Mercado moved to adopt the Regional recommendation and adopt the No Probable Cause finding. Seconded by Commissioner Roberts.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioner Patmon moved to take a short recess. Seconded by Commissioner Mercado.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioner Roberts moved to return to regular session. Seconded by Commissioner Mercado.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried

5. No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Charles Ewell v. Montgomery County Common Pleas Court
DAYB6 (22810) 03062012
22A 2012 02153C

Courtney Calhoun, Reconsideration Supervisor, recommended that Charging Party's request for reconsideration be denied. No new information was provided to warrant a change in the Region's original recommendation of No Probable Cause.

The parties appeared to discuss the above mentioned case. The Charging Party alleged that Respondent terminated him because of his race, African American and his disability.

Commissioner Mercado moved to adopt the Regional recommendation and find No Probable Cause in the above finding.

Motion failed.

Commissioner Roberts moved to reject the Regional recommendation and Reverse No Probable Cause – Dismiss to Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation in the above matter. Seconded by Commissioner Yajnik.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	NO
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	NO
Commissioner William Patmon, III	NO

Motion carried.

***The Commission ultimately moved to adopt the Regional recommendation and find No Probable Cause – Dismiss. (See pages 33 and 34.)**

6. No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Valeta L. Jenkins v. Edvantages, Inc. dba Trotwood Preparatory & Fitness Academy
DAY76 (22841) 0312012* AMENDED
22A 2012 01956C

Norman Gibson, Dayton Regional Director, recommended that Charging Party's request for reconsideration be denied. No new information was provided to warrant a change in the Region's original recommendation of No Probable Cause.

The parties appeared to discuss the above mentioned case. The Charging Party alleged that Respondent terminated her employment because of her race, sex and retaliations.

Commissioner Mercado moved to adopt the Regional recommendation and adopt the No Probable Cause finding. Seconded by Chairman Hubert.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	NO
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	NO
Commissioner Tom Roberts	NO
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon, III	NO

Motion failed.

COMMISSIONER AGENDA

Agenda for Week 1

1. No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Sharon L. Edwards v. Thomas P. Wagoner dba Accelerated Benefits
COLA1 (39624) 08082012
22A 2013 00284C

Mandy Dezeree Hardiman v. Airtron Heating and Air Conditioning, Inc.
COL71 (39803) 10232012
22A 2013 00789C

Kwame M. Dadzie v. Land-O-Sunn Dairies, LLC dba Frostbite Brands
TOLB2 (35278) 06052012
22A 2012 02193C

Charles Ewell v. Montgomery County Common Pleas Court
DAYB6 (22810) 03062012
22A 2012 02153C

***Commissioner Roberts voted No on the above appearance case (22810).**

Maria Finley v. Winton Woods City Schools
DAYA6 (23019) 06212012
22A 2012 02504C

2. Upon Reconsideration: No Jurisdiction - Dismiss

Miles L. Davis, Sr. v. City of Cincinnati, Public Safety, Fire Division
DAY76 (23130) 08092012
22A 2012 02795C

3. No Jurisdiction - Dismiss

Roberta Jo Angle v. Bousquet & Associates
AKRE3 (36680) 12202012
22A 2013 01181F

Commissioner Mercado moved to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases for Week 1. Seconded by Commissioner Roberts.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES (Voted No on 22810)
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

Agenda for Week 2

1. No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Karen S. Blichington v. Westar V, Inc. dba Jersey Mike's Subs
COL71 (39292) 03282012
22A 2012 01799C

Rebecca Hartman v. Stark County District Library
AKR73 (36315) 03302012
22A 2012 01766C

Brad Landa v. The Ohio Bell Telephone Company dba AT&T
CLE74 (41505) 04242012
22A 2012 02049C

Patricia Pincura v. EGJ Elyria Investments, LLC dba Big Hits
Sweepstakes Café
CLEE4 (41516) 04302012
22A 2013 00090F

Stephanie Miroewski v. EGJ Elyria Investments, LLC dba Big Hits
Sweepstakes Café
CLEE4 (41517) 04302012
22A 2013 00091F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss (Cont'd)

Veleta L. Jenkins v. Edvantages, Inc. dba Trotwood Preparatory & Fitness Academy
DAY76 (22841) 03212012 *AMENDED
22A 2012 01956C

***Commissioner Roberts made a motion to Reverse No Probable Cause - Dismiss to Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation. Seconded by Commissioner Patmon.**

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	NO
Commissioner William Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

2. No Jurisdiction - Dismiss

Michael E. Brown v. TODCO, Inc.
COL71 (39825) 10192012
22A 2013 00516C

Commissioner Patmon moved to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases for Week 2. Seconded by Commissioner Mercado.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

Agenda for Week 3

1. Respondent's Request – Deny

Ruth Winstead v. Mogodore Square Apartments LLC, Rob Wymer,
Manager, Woodbine Management, and Lori Lowe
AKRH3 (36295) 03192012
05-12-0648-8
22A 2012 01707F

2. No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Sherjewel Clark v. Signature Health, Inc.
TOL74 (41424) 02282012
22A 2012 01323C

Sherjewel Clark v. Signature Health, Inc.
TOL74 (41455) 03222012
22A 2012 01529C

3. **CERTIFICATION OF A BONA FIDE OCCUPATIONAL QUALIFICATION – GRANT**

Echoing Hills Village, Inc.

- President/CEO
- Executive Vice President/Chief Financial Officer
- Vice President of Gift Planning & Public Relations
- Vice President of Human Resources
- Director of Habilitation Services
- Regional Director
- Program Director
- QDDP
- Direct Support Professionals
- Chaplin/Campus Administrator
- Camp Administrator
- Camp Program Director
- Volunteer Outreach Coordinator
- Camp Program Assistant
- Camp Registered Nurse
- Cabin Leader

EchoingU

- Executive Director
- Campus Supervisor
- Class Coordinator
- Director of Community Based Services

Commissioner Roberts moved to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases for Week 3. Seconded by Commissioner Patmon.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

ATTORNEY GENERAL'S REPORT

Pat Dull presented the following information to Commissioners:

- Pat Dull said that Lori Anthony is back and looking forward to attending our next meeting
- Training sessions will reconvene soon.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director Payton presented the following information to Commissioners:

- Director Payton gave a budget update.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

- **Chairman Hubert stated that the MLK Celebration is scheduled for next Wednesday, February 27, 2013 at the Rhodes Tower.**

Commissioner Yajnik moved to adjourn the public meeting. Seconded by Commissioner Mercado.

The Commissioners voted as follows:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Rashmi Yajnik	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon, III	YES

Motion carried.

The regular meeting of The Ohio Civil Rights Commission was ADJOURNED at 2:19 p.m.



Commissioner

* * *