



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF
THE OHIO CIVIL RIGHTS COMMISSION**

**February 1, 2018
Lobby Hearing Room
Rhodes State Office Tower
Columbus, Ohio**

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Hubert called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Commissioners Present:

Chairman Leonard Hubert
Commissioner William Patmon
Commissioner Lori Barreras
Commissioner Madhu Singh
Commissioner Juan Cespedes

A quorum was present.

OCRC Staff Present:

G. Michael Payton, Executive Director; Darlene Newbern, Director of Operations; Stephanie Demers, Chief Legal Counsel; Desmon Martin, Director of Enforcement and Compliance; Ronnell Tomlinson, Director of Housing Enforcement and Alternative Dispute Resolution; Aman Mehra, Columbus Regional Director; Bradley Dunn, Akron Regional Director; Vera Boggs, Cleveland Regional Director; Duffy Jamieson, Dayton Regional Supervisor; Beyan Asoba, Reconsideration Supervisor; Lori Anthony, Chief – Civil Rights Section, Ohio Attorney General’s Office.

Chairman Hubert welcomed everyone to the meeting.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to approve the January 11, 2018 minutes. Second by Commissioner Barreras.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

CONFIRMATION OF STAFF FINDINGS

1. Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Vacate Original No Probable Cause Finding and Grant for Further Review

Beth Breckenridge v. Hondros College Inc., dba Hondros College of Business
COL71(45099)04042017 Amended
22A-2017-02246C

James P. Cunningham v. Michael Bell, Resident Monitor; Michelle Turner, Property Manager for Love Zion Manor; Carter Property Management (Taliafaro, Inc.) c/o Ambrose Moses, III, Registered Agent; and NBC-USA Housing Inc. Five c/o Taliafaro, Inc.
COLH1(45367)06022017
05-17-9019-8
22A-2017-03080F

Freda Knapper v. City of Columbus
COLB1(45456)08182017
22A-2017-03431C

Christopher F. Adams v. Savers
TOL72(38415)04172017
22A-2017-01884C

Raynard Armstrong v. BP-Husky Refining, LLC
TOLA2(38425)04242017
22A-2017-01989C

Vivian Bridges v. Miller-Valentine Group Realty Services; Jessica Miller; Miller Valentine Group Realty Services LLC c/o Jane Marx, Registered Agent
TOLH2(38428)02212017
05-17-7819-8
22A-2017-02182F

Victoria S. Nafziger v. AWI Leasing, LLC dba Auto Parts Center
TOLB2(38526)06152017
22A-2017-02706C

Floyd Robinson v. Buckeye Community Thirty Five, LP, Linda Collins, RLJ Management Co., Inc.
CLEH3(38977)05042017
05-17-9152-8
22A-2017-02266F

Fair Housing Advocates Association v. Buckeye Community Thirty Five, LP, Linda Collins, RLJ Management Co., Inc.
CLEH3(44025)05232017
05-17-9173-8
22A-2017-02563F

Kevin Moore v. PNK (Ohio), LLC dba Belterra Park Gaming and Entertainment Center
DAYB6(26683)08282017; AMENDED
22A-2017-03583C

2. Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Vacate Original No Jurisdiction Finding and Grant for Further Review - Continued

Roger and Maria Francis v. Akron Metropolitan Housing Authority
AKRH3(39319)12142017
22A-2018-00785F

3. Respondent's Request for Reconsideration – Grant for Further Review

Darnell Smith v. Orchard Farms Apartments; Brad D'Arcangelo, Owner; Karen Apodaca, Property Manager; J.B. Enterprises, LTD.
TOLH2(38383)03292017
05-17-7800-8
22A-2017-01686F

*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the basis of retaliation; No Probable Cause on the basis of race

4. Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Deny - Untimely

Janyce Sparks v. Cleveland Clinic Foundation
CLEG4(44242)09272017
22A-2017-03860F

5. Withdrawal of Charge – Request a Right to Sue; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General's Office

Walker, Logan Cheyenne v. National Carton & Coating Company
DAY76(25997)10212016
22A-2017-00290C
Complaint No. 17-EMP-DAY-25997

6. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General's Office

McKiddy, Kimberly v. Chartwell Condominium Owner's Association
TOLH2(37751)04212016
05-16-4625-8
22A-2016-01597F
Complaint No. 17-HOU-TOL-37751

McKiddy, Kimberly v. Chartwell Condominium Owner's Association
TOLH2(37987)08312016
22A-2016-02704F
Complaint No. 17-HOU-TOL-37987

7. Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation

Christopher Clark v. John and Winnie Hung
COLH6(26638)04062017
05-17-0417-8
22A-2017-03622F

Charletta D. Slaughter v. Huntington National Bank; Todd A. Roth, Mortgage Loan Officer, Huntington National Bank
TOLH2(38318)02272017
05-17-7693-8
22A-2017-01469F

Trina Hickman v. FCA US LLC
TOL72(38395)04052017
22A-2017-01738C

*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the bases of race, sex, and retaliation/denial of team leader assignment and pay; No Probable Cause on the bases of race, sex, and retaliation/issue of performing work not included in man assignment

8. Issue Formal Complaint

Christina M. Brown v. Molina Healthcare of Ohio, Inc.
COLB1(45080)04052017
22A-2017-02321C

Yvonne Brinkley v. Aram Gosdanian, Owner/Broker; Abbeyhill Realty & Management, LLC c/o Aram Gosdanian, Agent/Registrant; Lyric Properties, LLC c/o John Hyre, Agent/Registrant; and Derek Kinzer, Neighbor
COLH1(45201)05082017 AMENDED
05-17-7378-8
22A-2017-02370F

Trina Hickman v. FCA US LLC
TOL72(38290)02092017
22A-2017-01287C

9. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order After a Finding of Probable Cause – Close

Fair Housing Resource Center v. Revoe Robinson and Judith Robinson
CLEH3(44099)04102017
05-17-8437-8
22A-2017-03046F

10. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination – Close

Raymond D. Scott v. Meijer Group, Inc.
TOLG2(38671)08182017
22A-2017-03429F

Billy Hines, Jr. v. Gateway Food & Fuel, Inc.
TOLG2(38737)09292017
22A-2018-00021F

Mary Jo DeCapito v. NRP Management LLC and Kent Elderly, LP
AKRH3(39271)11082017 AMENDED
05-18-0274-8
22A-2018-00448F

Yolanda Rivera v. The Cleveland Clinic Foundation
CLEG4(44067)06232017
22A-2017-02815F

Tara S. Campbell v. Ohio Housing Finance Agency
DAY76(26388)04262017
22A-2017-02157C

Chrys Martin v. Bill Cooper II, Owner
DAYH6(26434)05122018
22A-2017-02458F

Tiffany A. Cline v. Cardiologists of Greene County, LLC
DAYB6(26799)10262017
22A-2018-00311C

Haley Wright v. Jeannie Merritt, Property Manager, Wallace F. Ackley Co.
ADRH1(45642)10262017
05-18-0409-8
22A-2018-00356F

Theresa Weiler v. Varsity Square Apartments; Tobin Group; The Tobin Group, LLC; Lee Barkeau,
Manager, Varsity Square Apartments
ADRH2(38779)10162017
05-18-9776-8
22A-2018-00213F

Dametris Ross-Voet v. Joy Smothers, Agent; Welles Bowen Realtors; Kevin Smith, Broker; Wells
Bowen Realtors; Taylor McNeil, Agent, Welles Bowen Realtors
ADRH2(38787)10202017
05-18-0373-8
22A-2018-00223F

Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination – Close - Continued

Sherelle Foster v. The Woodlands Apartments; LC Woodlands LLC An Ohio Limited Liability Company; APM Management LLC
ADRH2(38789)10232017
05-18-0446-8
22A-2018-00264F

Brenda Toot v. John Doss Enterprises
ADRE3(39229)10072017
22A-2018-00103F

Kalle Obeng v. Sunview Petroleum Inc., dba Sonoco
ADRG3(39274)11092017
22A-2018-00455F

Fair Housing Contact Services v. Gerald Braden
ADRH3(39311)12062017
05-18-0249-8
22A-2018-00702F

Carolyn Slaughter v. RLJ Management Co., Inc. Ohio City Elderly L.P. and Kimberly Meyers
ADRH4(44206)09072017 AMENDED
05-17-9615-8
22A-2017-03604F

Janice F. Labig v. Datwyler Sealing Solutions, USA
ADRA6(26865)12012017
22A-2018-00687C

11. Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement

Anim N. Mihalys v. Methodist ElderCare Services dba Wesley Ridge
COL71(45151)04252017
22A-2017-02350C

Maurice Bryant v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Corrections
COL71(45666)11152017
22A-2018-00485C

Larry Harvey v. Columbus City Schools
COL71(45697)12042017
22A-2018-00594C

Bright Owusu Gyasi v. Huntington Bancshares Financial Corporation
COL71(45756)12282017
22A-2018-00884C

*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case.

Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement - Continued

Peter Scranton v. Student Legal Services, Inc.
COL71(45764)01032018
22A-2018-00894C

Terron Rankin v. Advance Health Care, Inc.
TOL72(38474)05172017
22A-2017-02360C

Chris L. Redding v. Grand River A & W, Inc. dba Long John Silvers
TOLB2(38502)06052017
22A-2017-02594C

Jovan Bocvarov v. Local 349, American Federation of State, County and Municipal
Employees, ALF-CIO
TOL72(38764)10102017
22A-2018-00112C

Andrew Jackson v. The Apostolos Group, Inc. dba Thomarios
AKR73(38956)04232017
22A-2017-02014C

Robyn Clemens v. Children's Hospital Medical Center of Akron dba Akron Children's Hospital
AKR73(39270)11062017
22A-2018-00452C

David T. Konteh v. CompuNet Clinical Laboratories
DAY76(26345)04122017
22A-2017-02075C

Ronald Lewis Robinson v. MUY Burger dba Wendy's Hamburger
DAYA6(26403)05022017
22A-2017-02222C

David T. Konteh v. CompuNet Clinical Laboratories
DAY76(26798)10252017
22A-2018-00309C

Leah McBride v. LaRosa's Pizzeria
DAYB6(26924)12212017
22A-2018-00900C

Jessica Allen v. Talk-A Lot Metro PCS
ADRB1(45326)06292017
22A-2017-02864C

Donna M. Jones v. Jeff Wyler Columbus
ADRF1(45652)11082017
22A-2018-00397F

Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement - Continued

John Otway v. Lyon Video, Inc.
ADRA1(45690)11302017Amended
22A-2018-00579C

Marla Y. Cole v. Renhill Group, Inc.
ADRA2(38708)09182017
22A-2017-03742C AMENDED

Lucy K. Kutscher v. Meijer Stores Limited Partnership dba Meijer (Store #111)
ADR72(38758)10052017
22A-2018-00090C

Douglas L. Perry v. Johns Manville
ADRB2(38768)10102017
22A-2018-00116C

Rebecca A. Posey v. Waycraft Industries, Inc.
ADRE2(38831)11082017
22A-2018-00412F AMENDED

Lontina Bannister v. 1341 DS, Inc. dba Dollar Dollar Plus
ADRA2(38842)11142017
22A-2018-00493C

Thomas T. McAdams v. Waycraft Industries, Inc.
ADRE2(38852)11162017
22A-2018-00504F

Lerlin Branscum v. Emerson Climate Technologies, Inc.
ADR72(38856)11162017
22A-2018-00508C

Eric Kemp v. Ice Industries, Inc.
ADR72(38857)11172017
22A-2018-00509C

Donna J. Moore-James v. IET, Inc.
ADRB2(38875)11282017
22A-2018-00600C

Marla Y. Cole v. Renhill Group, Inc.
ADRA2(38878)11282017
22A-2018-00604C

Brian R. Linch v. City of Toledo, Streets, Bridges and Harbor Department
ADRB2(38921)12182017
22A-2018-00789C

Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement - Continued

James Cole v. Belle Tire Distributors, Inc.
ADR72(38930)12202017
22A-2018-00817C

Marita Emmert v. Cuyahoga Valley Scenic Railroad
ADRG3(39166)09042017
22A-2017-03630F

John Tucker v. Greer Steel Company
ADRB3(39240)10202017
22A-2018-00203C

Paul Gatto v. Professional Electric Products Co.
ADRA3(39246)10242017
22A-2018-00254C

Yvette McIntyre-Allen v. Northeast Ohio Applied Health Noah LLC
ADR73(39269)11062017
22A-2018-00451C

Joseph Gable v. Warmus Builders, Inc.
ADRA3(39294)11282017
22A-2018-00580C

Kristopher Restivo v. Apollo Supply
ADRE4(44235)09252017
22A-2017-03825F

Mohammad Obaid Khan v. APM Management LLC
ADR74(44237)09262017 AMENDED
22A-2017-03856C

Gregory Roller v. FM Dealership, LLC dba Adventure Chrysler Jeep
ADRB4(44288)10242017
22A-2018-00273C

Perry Harris v. Bruce H. Bauer and Sally Bauer
ADRH4(44313)10242017
05-18-0405-8
22A-2018-00473F

Valerie Mitchell v. On Board PMO Corporation
ADRB4(44305)11022017
22A-2018-00345C

Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement - Continued

Carol Warren v. Noggin, LLC
ADRE4(44321)11072017
22A-2018-00402F

Natia Hollingsworth v. Elmcroft of Medina
ADR74(44331)11112017
22A-2018-00440C

Rachel Shepard v. First National Bank of Pennsylvania
ADR74(44336)11142017
22A-2018-00468C

12. Withdrawal of Charge – Grant

Helen Fishman v. Greenbriar Lakes Condominium Association, Towne Properties Asset Management Co., Ltd., David Brock, Association Manager
DAYH6(26665)08162017
22A-2017-03439F

Heidi Stecher v. Greene County Transportation Board
DAYG6(26935)01022018
22A-2018-00904F

Marla Y. Cole v. Board of Education of the Springfield Local School District
ADRA2(38692)08312017
22A-2017-03592C

Marla Y. Cole v. Board of Education of the Springfield Local School District
ADRA2(38752)10052017
22A-2018-00084C

Marla Y. Cole v. Board of Education of the Springfield Local School District
ADRA2(38877)11282017
22A-2018-00603C

13. Withdrawal of Charge – Request Notice of Right to Sue - Grant

Nichole R. Dennewitz v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
TOL72(38443)05032017
22A-2017-02137C

Amy M. Flores v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
TOL72(38444)05032017
22A-2017-02139C

14. Withdrawal of Charge – Request Notice of Right to Sue - Grant

Renee M. Foels v. Pinnacle Eye Group, Inc.
TOLB2(38450)05052017
22A-2017-02183C

15. No Jurisdiction – Dismiss XNJ

Michael E. Sneed v. JP Morgan Chase
COLE1(45464)08172017
22A-2017-03463F

Jeremiah Hairston v. Licking Knox Goodwill
COLE1(45544)09252017
22A-2017-03816F

Evan Jones v. State of Ohio, Office of Budget and Management
COLE1(45618)10242017
22A-2018-00240F

Ashleigh Davis v. Ron Bettin, Owner/Landlord
COLH1(45655)11092017
22A-2018-00418F

Jeremy Hartley v. Moore Enterprises
COLE1(45668)11132017
22A-2018-00435F

Christine Schonauer v. Dex Media Inc. dba Dex YP
COLE1(45695)12042017
22A-2018-00592F

Shawn Kingsmill v. Team Towing
AKRB3(39279)11092017
22A-2018-00463C

Kristen Newman v. Ohio Multi-County Development Corporation
AKRH3(39310)12062017
22A-2018-01068F

Hassan Hakim v. Durox Company
CLEE4(44349)11212017
22A-2018-00551F

Anika Coleman v. Coca Cola Bottling Company
CLEE4(44373)12062017
22A-2018-00648F

No Jurisdiction – Dismiss XNJ - Continued

Jessica Riggs v. Red Roof Inn / Economy Inn
DAYG6(26103)12092016
22A-2018-00965F

Daniel Sizemore v. Wright State University
DAYE6(26439)05112017
22A-2017-02991F

Karen Hinse v. Miami Valley Dance Center
DAYG6(26828)11072017
22A-2018-00394F

Christopher Thomas v. Orbis Corporation
DAYE6(26890)12062017
22A-2018-00665F

16. No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Valerie Leach v. National Youth Advocate Program, Inc.
COL71(45053)03212017
22A-2017-01995C

Marlin Evans v. Charter Communications
COL71(45078)04032017 Amended
22A-2017-02010C

Consuela Floyd v. Franklin County Job & Family Services
COLA1(45081)04052017
22A-2017-02433C

Barbara Crawford v. Adult Parole Authority
COLA1(45092)04022017
22A-2017-02234C

Consuela Floyd v. Franklin County Job and Family Services
COLA1(45096)04042017
22A-2017-02241C

Elizabeth Smoot v. State of Ohio Development Services
COL71(45103)04052017
22A-2017-02248C

Vladislav Melkumov v. Old Dominion Freight Line, Inc.
COL71(45120)03202017
22A-2017-02176C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Tonya Lynn Kuhn v. Dr. Pepper Snapple Group/American Bottling Company
COLB1(45121)04102017
22A-2017-02355C

Emmanuel Holt v. White Castle
COLG1(45126)04142017
22A-2017-02198F

Bridgette Stevens v. Print Syndicate, Inc.
COL71(45133)04192017
22A-2017-02185C

Abdi A. Geesay v. National Electric Coil Company, L.P.
COL71(45143)04212017
22A-2017-02192C

Abu Abu v. National Electric Coil Company, L.P.
COL71(45145)04212017
22A-2017-02194C

Motique Ramsey v. Zulily, LLC
COL71(45152)04252017
22A-2017-02369C

Motique Ramsey v. Staff Management
COL71(45153)04252017
22A-2017-02339C

Emmanuel Holt v. Walgreens
COLG1(45154)04252017
22A-2017-02341F

Kandi S. Young v. Saber Healthcare Group-The Manor of Whitehall
COLB1(45158)04272017
22A-2017-02340C

Michele Tartt v. State of Ohio, Department of Job and Family Services
COLB1(45161)04222017
22A-2017-02231C

*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case.

Consuela Floyd v. Franklin County Job and Family Services
COLA1(45164)04262017
22A-2017-02267C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Naya Revere v. State of Ohio, Department of Transportation
COL71(45178)04292017
22A-2017-02277C

Stefanie D. Moss v. The Ohio State University – Wexner Medical Center
COLA1(45197)05062017
22A-2018-00888C
*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case.

Stefanie D. Moss v. The Ohio State University-Wexner Medical Center
COLA1(45202)05082017 (Amended)
22A-2017-02344C
*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case.

Lori Howard v. Menard, Inc.
COLG1(45240)05232017
22A-2017-02548F

Don Fairfax v. Advance Stores Company, Inc. dba Advance Auto Parts
COLB1(45255)05312017
22A-2017-02610C

Alexandro Da Silva v. The Ohio State University - Fawcett Center
COL71(45275)06102017 Amended
22A-2017-02662C
*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case.

Motique Ramsey v. Staff Management
COL71(45398)07312017
22A-2017-03203C

Motique Ramsey v. Zulily, LLC
COL71(45402)07312017
22A-2017-03204C

Elka Bowe v. Marcy Store & Diner
COLE1(45422)08082017
22A-2017-03302C

Alexandro Da Silva v. The Ohio State University - Fawcett Center
COL71(45460)08222017
22A-2017-03443C
*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case.

Bridgette Stevens v. Print Syndicate, Inc.
COL71(45486)09012017
22A-2017-03561C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Ashley Paul v Beaver Plans Rental
COLH1(45495)09012017
22A-2017-03572F

Brittany R. Beach v. North Community Counseling Centers, Inc.
COL71(45634)10312017
22A-2018-00303C

James Connolly v. Plaza Properties, Inc. c/o Gloria S. Haffer, Registered Agent; and The Canterbury Apartments c/o Plaza Properties, Inc.
COLH1(45677)11172017
05-18-9904-8
22A-2018-00488F

Brittani L. Doster v. Ekaterina Yanklevich, DDS, Inc.
COL71(45678)11202017
22A-2018-00512C

Christine Moore v. Else and Daniel Damen Nebiyu, Owners
COLH6(26611)04112017
22A-2017-03623F

Trina Hickman v. FCA US LLC
TOL72(38395)04052017
22A-2017-01738C

*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the bases of race, sex, and retaliation/denial of team leader assignment and pay; No Probable Cause on the bases of race, sex, and retaliation/issue of performing work not included in man assignment

Valoree Ohl v. City of Toledo
TOLA2(38419)04192017
22A-2017-01913C

Linda M. Graham v. Madison Avenue School of Arts
TOLB2(38426)04252017
22A-2017-02019C

Jennifer Peabody v. General Motors LLC
TOL72(38435)04272017
22A-2017-02089C

Shantez M. Harvis v. Hearthside Food Solutions, LLC
TOLB2(38436)04282017
22A-2017-02090C

Shantez M. Harvis v. Impact Employment Solutions, Inc.
TOLB2(38437)04282017
22A-2017-02091C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

William R. Duncan v. W.S.O.S. Community Action Commission, Inc.
TOL72(38441)05022017
22A-2017-02118C

Eneshia A. Barnes v. Harborside Sylvania, LLC dba Sylvania Center
TOL72(38451)05052017
22A-2017-02208C

Richard Mingione v. Vin Devers, Inc.
TOLA2(38453)05082017
22A-2017-02303C

Laura C. Murray v. Healthcare Services Group, Inc.
TOL72(38455)05092017 AMENDED
22A-2017-02306C

Malcolm Jones v. Mercy Health-St. Anne Hospital LLC
TOL72(38456)05092017
22A-2017-02307C

Douglas Moore v. Pilkington North America, Inc. dba Pilkington NSG Glass
TOLA2(38462)05112017
22A-2017-02301C

Jamall Hodges v. Oldcastle Building Envelope, Inc.
TOLB2(38472)05162017
22A-2017-02346C

Housing Opportunities Made Equal (H.O.M.E.) v. Star One Realtors-Tri County Office, Carol R. Prazynski, Agent; Star One Realtors-Tri County Office, John F. Prazynski, Agent
TOLH6(26568)04112017
05-17-8154-8
22A-2017-03149F

Jonathan Roundtree v. Charter Communications, LLC fka Time Warner Cable
AKR73(38868)03102017
22A-2017-01592C

Lewis D. Keller v. Village of Boston Heights, Ohio Police Department
AKRB3(38964)04282017
22A-2017-02102C

Jimmy Hughes v. Youngstown State University
AKRA3(38995)05152017
22A-2017-02490C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Nicole Cutlip v. Sebring – West Branch Hot Stove League, Inc.
AKRG3(39007)05222016 AMENDED
22A-2017-02416F

Del Thompson v. Debbie Kotick, Millennium Management, Inc., Deer Run Apartments Limited
AKRH3(39044)06132017
05-17-8474-8
22A-2017-02763F

Tara Clemons v. YWCA of Youngstown Housing, LLC and Leah Merritt
AKRH3(39069)06302017
05-17-8815-8
22A-2017-03002F

Mary Ann and Larry Lamovsky v. UMH OH Valley Hills, LLC
AKRH3(39077)07062017 AMENDED
05-17-8832-8
22A-2017-03033F

Raelynn Dolwick v. New Leaf Residential Services, Incorporated
AKRB3(39082)07102017
22A-2017-03057C

Martin Richard Rhoades v. Davey Kent, Inc. dba Davey Drill
AKRB3(39113)07172017 AMENDED
22A-2017-03185C

Renee Nativio v. Gander Properties, LLC and Svetlana Chernyak
AKRH3(39122)07102017
05-17-0427-8
22A-2017-03308F

Clifford Maddox v. Metalico Akron, Inc.
AKR73(39134)08102017
22A-2017-03346C

Barry Lee v. Trelleborg Systems Americas, Inc.
AKRA3(39208)09192017
22A-2017-03838C

Kelly Prigmore v. Family Dollar Stores of Ohio, Inc.
AKR73(39213)09222017
22A-2017-03844C

Henry Provitt v. Community Legal Aid Services, Inc.
AKRG3(39216)09272017
22A-2017-03862F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

David McIntosh Carpenter v. Summit Management Services, Inc. and Jewish Senior Housing of Akron
AKRH3(39217)09272017
05-17-9499-8
22A-2017-03861F

Sherman Moore, Sr. v. Youngstown Urban Minority Alcoholism and
Drug Abuse Outreach Program
AKR73(39230)10092017
22A-2018-00104C

Shareea Noel v. Legacy Place Twinsburg, LLC
AKR74(43969)04242017
22A-2017-02095C

Ladys Rivera v. Shapiro, Marnecheck & Palnik
CLEE4(43988)05092017
22A-2017-02298F

Octavius A. Simmons v. Taylor Steel, Inc.
AKR74(43999)05162017
22A-2017-02413C

Jill Conway v. Vladimir Lavrisiuk
CLEH4(44005)05192017
22A-2018-02418F

Corey Golliday v. United Parcel Services, Inc.
CLEA4(44053)06142017
22A-2017-02776C

Hamad Hamad v. MBL Management, Inc. and Westown Gardens LLC
AKRH4(44132)07072017 AMENDED
05-17-8672-8
22A-2017-03217F

Candice Amos v. The Council for Economic Opportunities in Greater Cleveland
CLE74(44161)08152017
22A-2017-03367C

Michael Montijo v. Cuyahoga County Children and Family Services
CLE74(44166)06052017
22A-2017-03371C

Laurel Thomas v. The PNC Financial Services Group, Inc.
CLEA4(44181)08232017
22A-2017-03469C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Rosay Aksakal v. The Cleveland Clinic Foundation dba Marymount Hospital
CLE74(44200)09012017
22A-2017-03587C

Prince Southern v. BASF Corporation
CLEB4(44214)09132017
22A-2017-03737C

Tarek Muhammad v. Key Bank National Association
CLE74(44224)09202017
22A-2017-03800C

Anthony Maxie Jr. v. Higbee West Main, LP dba Dillard's
CLEG4(44238)09262017
22A-2017-03857F

Anthony Maxie Sr. v. Higbee West Main, LP dba Dillard's
CLEG4(44239)09262017
22A-2017-03858F

Quinton Sanders II v. French Creek Burgers, LLC dba Five Guys
CLE74(44280)10232017
22A-2018-00245C

Ronald Garr v. Recovery Resources
CLEG4(44291)10252017
22A-2018-00278F

Bruce Committee v. The Cleveland Clinic Foundation
CLEG4(44301)10282017
22A-2017-00341F

Frederick Aponte v. Swagelok Company
CLE74(44304)11012017
22A-2017-00344C

Thomas Harold Gompf v. Board of Education of the Mansfield City School District
CLEB4(44325)11082017
22A-2018-00406C

Patrick D. Pisano v. Tempcraft Corporation dba Arconic
CLEA4(44328)11092017
22A-2018-00437C

Yvette Brown v. State of Ohio, Office of Budget and Management
CLE71(45269)06092017
22A-2017-02637C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Donovan Sledge cv. Lutheran Home Society, Inc. dba Genacross Lutheran Services
CLE72(38466)05122017
22A-2017-02316C

Angela Hodges v. Dillard Tennessee Operating Limited Partnership dba Dillard's
CLEA2(38784)10192017
22A-2018-00260C

Brinaldo Buford v. District Petroleum Products, Inc. dba District Tire Center
CLEG2(38881)11302017
22A-2018-00607F

Patricia Stone v. Ashtabula County District Library
CLE73(39214)09222017
22A-2017-03820C

Pamela Fowler v. Edward Bruce Jr.
CLEH6(26574)05032017
05-17-8494-8
22A-2017-03160F

Draco Crawl v. Towne Properties Asset Management Company
DAY76(26307)03202017
22A-2017-02067C

Denise Jackson v. Wal-Mart Stores East LP
DAY76(26321)03282017
22A-2017-01704C

Olivia Serna v. Colonial Nursing Center
DAY76(26332)04062017
22A-2017-02218C

Steven Jerome Coleman v. Green Tokai Company, LTD.
DAY76(26338)04102017
22A-2017-02216C

Mohammed Kutite v. PSA Airlines
DAYA6(26340)04112017
22A-2017-02078C

Donesia Liggins v. Anna Louise Inn Apts.; Marvin Cox & Robin Stanley, et al.
DAYH6(26342)04122017
05-17-0517-8
22A-2017-02117F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Raahkiim El Bey v. Ali Industries Inc.
DAY76(26352)04172017
22A-2017-02164C

Pauline Thompson v. He Qiming
DAYH6(26364)04062017
22A-2017-02213F

HOME v. He Qiming
DAYH6(26365)04062017
05-17-7638-8
22A-2017-02502F

Natalie Sheppard v. Liberty Nursing Center of Colerain, Inc.
DAY76(26368)04212017
22A-2017-02161C

Marquita L. Roddy v. Fuyao Glass America, Inc.
DAY76(26369)04242017
22A-2017-02080C

Mohammed Kutite v. PSA Airlines
DAY76(26392)04272017
22A-2018-00714C

Aundrea Kinion v. Dollar Tree Stores, Inc.
DAYG6(26399)04292017
22A-2017-02499C

Herbert J Morris v. PNC Bank, NA
DAYA6(26401)04272017
22A-2017-02456C

Gennelle Thomas v. Fuyao Glass America
DAY76(26407)05042017
22A-2017-02512C

Venita Washington v. OSF International, Inc. dba Old Spaghetti Factory
DAYE6(26419)05052017
22A-2017-02508F

Veronica Payne v. BEF Foods, Inc. d/b/a Bob Evans Farms
DAYB6(26420)05092017
22A-2017-02509C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – Continued

Teresa Hart v. Sally Beauty Supply, LLC
DAYB6(26426)05122017
22A-2017-02482C

Michael Schultz-Navara v. Twist Inc.
DAYM6(26427)05152017
22A-2017-02463F

Leslie Nicole Carton v. Fuyao Glass America, Inc.
DAY76(26430)05152017
22A-2017-02460C

Sharen Washington v. Hamilton County Job & Family Services
DAYB6(26438)05232017
22A-2017-02908C

LaVonda Stewart v. Procter & Gamble
DAYB6(26442)05152017
22A-2017-02912C

Pamela Patterson v. Caterpillar Inc.
DAY76(26455)05232017
22A-2017-02494C

Mitchell Deshawn Johnson v. Superior Environmental Labor, LLC
DAY76(26491)06072017
22A-2017-02894C

Kim C. Heflin v. Caterpillar Logistics, Inc.
DAYA6(26512)06192017
22A-2017-02913C

Belinda Grafireed v. Pristine Senior Living of Norwood Towers
DAY76(26761)10052017
22A-2018-00058C

Lacey Welliford v. Hospitality Center for Rehab & Healing
DAY76(26847)11162017
22A-2018-00559C

Janice F. Labig v. E-Mek
DAYA6(26866)12012017
22A-2018-00688C

Winn C. Brown v. Bill Marine Honda
DAYA6(26868)12042017
22A-2018-00673C

MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to approve the February 1, 2018 Confirmation Agenda. Second by Commissioner Barreras.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES - with noted recusals
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

STAFF BRIEFING

The Compliance Director informed those present that the Commission had complied with all notification requirements as set forth in Ohio Administrative Code Section 4112-1-04.

The Compliance Department, with the Executive Director's approval, requested that the following appearance be deleted from the Commissioners' agenda Week 3, Page 1, Item I-A because the Respondent's counsel withdrew the request to appear and present oral argument before the Commission:

Trina Hickman v. FCA US LLC
TOL72(38290)02092017
22A-2017-01287C

MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to approve the staff briefing and remove the aforementioned appearance from the Week 3 agenda. Second by Commissioner Barreras.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

APPEARANCE CASES

Appearance 1

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 3, Page 2, Item II-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Peter K. Newman v. University of Dayton
DAY76(26265)02282017
22A-2017-01567C

Upon review of Charging Party's application for reconsideration, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

**MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss.
Second by Commissioner Barreras.**

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	NO
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 2

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 3, Page 2, Item II-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Peter K. Newman v. University of Dayton
DAYG6(26268)03012017
22A-2017-01512F

Upon review of Charging Party's application for reconsideration, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	NO
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to take a recess. Second by Commissioner Barreras.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to return to public session. Second by Commissioner Barreras.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 3

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 3, Page 2, Item II-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Mickey Tate v. Columbus Metropolitan Library
COL71(44971)02162017
22A-2017-01957C

Upon review of Charging Party's application for reconsideration, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

**MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause – Dismiss.
Second by Commissioner Singh.**

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	NO
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioners' Agenda for Week 1
Page 1 of 1

1. Request For Reconsideration: Respondent Request - Deny

David Boyd v. American Red Cross Blood Services, Western Lake Erie Region
TOL72(38358)03172017
22A-2017-01621C

2. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Deirdre Masten v. M.J.M. Management Corp., Carter Manor Apartments Limited Partnership, and John D'Altorio
CLEH4(43927)03282017
22A-2017-01869F

3. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Jurisdiction - Dismiss

Gilbert Pallay, Jr. v. Novel Creations USA Inc.
CLEE4(44189)08282017
22A-2017-03514F

MOTION by Commissioner Barreras to adopt the foregoing captioned cases on the Commissioners' Agenda for Week 1. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioners' Agenda for Week 2
Page 1 of 1

1. Consideration of Motion of Respondent's Counsel to Appear, Pro Hac Vice Before the Ohio Civil Rights Commission - Grant

Michael Ruzicho v. Larry Flynt's Hustler Club
CLE74(44292)10252017
22A-2018-00279C

Michael Ruzicho v. Larry Flynt's Hustler Club
CLE74(44298)10262017
22A-2018-00336C

Michael Ruzicho v. Larry Flynt's Hustler Club
CLE74(44302)10292017
22A-2017-00342C

2. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Nnamdi Ibe v. SP Plus Corporation
COLB1(45368)07172017
22A-2017-03081C

Angela Marie Beechler v. Total Quality, Inc. dba Wendy's
COLB1(45577)10122017
22A-2018-00108C

3. No Jurisdiction - Dismiss

Floyd Ellis, Sr. v. City of Youngstown, City Hall
AKRG3(39236)10162017
22A-2018-00167F

MOTION by Commissioner Barreras to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Commissioners' Agenda for Week 2. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioners' Agenda for Week 3
Page 1 of 2

1. Request For Reconsideration: Respondent's Request - Deny

Jennifer Lynne Bailey v. Hope Crow and Tracy Greewell
AKRH3(38989)05092017
22A-2017-02295F

Jay Barrett Williams v. Neon Engineering, Inc.
DAYE6(26450)05222017
22A-2017-02493F

2. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Mardi (Mardelle) J. Morantz v. State of Ohio, Public Utilities Commission
COLG1(44980)02212017
22A-2017-01958F

Sidnie E. Conrad v. Newark Corporation dba Newark element14
AKR74(43931)04032017
22A-2017-01906C

Felicia Rogers v. Ted Haber, Tim Waldrip, and McMicken 649 LLC
CLEH6(26460)03272017 AMENDED
22A-2017-02995F

Kenia Wagner v. Lorain Metropolitan Housing Authority
CLEH4(43920)03272017
22A-2017-01725F

3. No Jurisdiction – Dismiss

Saima Khawaja v. Deborah Pentenberg, Manager; and Office Evolution Easton Columbus
COLH1(45639)10312017(Amended)
22A-2018-00353F

Lori Lynn Howard v. Tom Scott Building & Repair; Ross
County Planning Department
COLH1(45733)12162017
22A-2018-00798F

Charlene Shadler v. HealthSCOPE Benefits, Inc.
TOL72(38630)08022017
22A-2017-03246C

Commissioners' Agenda for Week 3
Page 2 of 2

No Jurisdiction – Dismiss - Continued

Sharyll Primus v. United States Department of Housing and Urban
Development
TOLH3(39176)09062017
22A-2017-03682F

Sharyll Primus v. State of Ohio, Civil Rights Commission
TOLH3(39178)09062017
22A-2017-03730F

Paul Cunningham v. United States Department of Housing and
Urban Development
TOLH3(39181)09062017
22A-2017-03692F

Gloria Dunnivan v. Canton City School District Board of Education
AKRB3(39000)05172017
22A-2017-02382C

Michelle Callier v. Kent State University, East Liverpool, School of Nursing
AKRG3(39363)01162018
22A-2018-01083F

Terence Gragston v. United States Department of Veterans Affairs
DAYM6(26968)01112018
22A-2018-00956F

**MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the
Commissioners' Agenda for Week 3. Second by Commissioner Singh.**

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

**Commissioners' Add-On Agenda
Page 1 of 1**

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Vivian Bridges v. Miller-Valentine Group Realty Services; Jessica Miller; Miller Valentine Group Realty Services LLC c/o Jane Marx, Registered Agent
TOLH2(38428)02212017
05-17-7819-8
22A-2017-02182F

MOTION by Commissioner Barreras to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Commissioners' Add-On Agenda. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

Report from the Ohio Attorney General's Office

Lori Anthony, Civil Rights Section Chief – Ohio Attorney General's Office had nothing to report.

Report from the Chief Legal Counsel

Chief Legal Counsel, Stephanie Demers reported the Commission recently participated in testifying in support of HB 160, the Ohio Fairness Act, which would add sexual orientation and gender identity to the list of specific protected classes for employment, public accommodation, credit and housing discrimination. Opposition testimony has yet to be scheduled for this Bill.

In addition, HB 271 – the accessibility notification bill for places of public accommodation passed the House floor with the modifications of making the notification requirement optional (may) vs. mandatory (shall). The amendments included the addition the Commission sought that the law does not apply to provisions of 4112.02(H) (fair housing).

Report from Executive Director

Executive Director, G. Michael Payton began his report by recognizing the outreach efforts of Ronnell Tomlinson, Director of Housing Enforcement and Alternative Dispute Resolution. The Ohio Supreme Court recently asked Ronnell to serve as a mediation coach at a Continuing Legal Education training seminar. In addition, Ronnell attended a Career Day workshop and participated in two panel discussions at his alma mater Capital University Law School. Finally, Ronnell attended the 5th annual State of the Science of Implicit Bias Review at the Kirwan Institute at The Ohio State University.

With regard to HB 160 “Gay Rights Bill”, Ohio has a strong public policy of protecting men and women from discrimination. The staff will keep the Commissioners posted on HB 160.

Director Payton offered a reminder regarding the upcoming Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. Art, Essay and Multimedia Contest being held on Friday, February 2, 2018 at 10am.

Lastly, Director Payton introduced Darlene Newbern as the new Director of Regional Operations. Darlene has served the OCRC with distinction for over 28 years, most recently as the Regional Director of the Toledo Regional Office. She has a national reputation for her work in housing enforcement and outreach. She is also known for her passion for civil rights and is well respected among her peers and members of the community. Darlene thanked the Commission for the opportunity.

Vera Boggs, Cleveland Regional Director, introduced extern Elizabeth Childers from Cleveland Marshall College of Law.

Remarks

Chairman Hubert and Commissioners congratulated Darlene Newbern on her new role.

MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to adjourn the public meeting. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES

Motion carried.

The regular meeting of The Ohio Civil Rights Commission was ADJOURNED at 1:41PM.

* * *



Commissioner