



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF
THE OHIO CIVIL RIGHTS COMMISSION**

**February 21, 2019
Administrative Hearing Room
Rhodes State Office Tower
Columbus, Ohio**

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Lori Barreras called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Commissioners Present:

Chair Lori Barreras
Commissioner William Patmon
Commissioner Madhu Singh
Commissioner Juan Cespedes
Commissioner Carolyn Peters

A quorum was present.

OCRC Staff Present:

G. Michael Payton, Executive Director; Darlene Newbern, Director of Operations; Stephanie Bostos Demers, Chief Legal Counsel; Mary Turocy, Director of Public Affairs and Civic Engagement; Desmon Martin, Director of Enforcement and Compliance; Ronnell Tomlinson, Director of Housing and Alternative Dispute Resolution; Aman Mehra, Columbus Regional Director; Inder LeVesque, Toledo Regional Director; Bradley Dunn, Akron Regional Director; Vera Boggs, Cleveland Regional Director; Kathy Haley-Ross, Acting Dayton Regional Supervisor; Beyan Asoba, Reconsideration Supervisor. Also in attendance: Sharon Tassie, Assistant Chief – Civil Rights Section, Ohio Attorney General’s Office.

Chair Barreras welcomed everyone to the meeting.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION by Commissioner Peters to approve the January 31, 2019 minutes. Second by Commissioner Singh.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	ABSTAIN
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

CONFIRMATION OF STAFF FINDINGS

1. Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Vacate Original No Probable Cause Finding and Grant for Further Review

Debra Cooley v. Columbus Park Apartments; Towne Properties Asset Management Company c/o Ralph E. Heyman, Registered Agent; Avnet III, LLC c/o VCorp Agent Service, Inc., Registered Agent; India Taylor, Assistant Manager; Kelly Givens, Manager; and Brett Huffman, District Manager
COLH1(46202)06252018
05-18-2117-8
22A-2018-02698F

Maria Otero v. JP Morgan Chase, N.A.
COLG1(46349)08132018 AMENDED
22A-2018-03189F

Terri Kirkpatrick v. Wells Fargo Home Mortgage, Inc.
AKRH3(39674)07242018
22A-2018-03030F

Lars St. John v. City of Lakewood, Lakewood Municipal Court
CLEG4(44563)03302018
22A-2018-01845F

**Split Recommendation: Probable Cause on the basis of religion; No Probable Cause on the basis of race and retaliation*

Cecelia Morris v. Payless ShoeSource, Inc.
DAY76(27110)03232018
22A-2018-02057C

Glenn Laws v. State of Ohio, Department of Veterans Services,
Georgetown Veterans Home
DAYA6(27350)06282018
22A-2018-02761C

2. Respondent's Request for Reconsideration – Grant for Further Review

Victoria Urban v. TGM Worthington Green, Inc.; Cindy Daylong, Regional Property Coordinator; Luke Gillett, Manager; and TGM Communities, LLC
COLH1(46252)07132018 AMENDED
22A-2018-02887F
05-18-2157-8

**Split Recommendation: Probable Cause on the basis of sex on the issues of refusal to rent or deal and discrimination in the terms and conditions in the occupancy and services; No Probable Cause on the basis of disability on the issues of refusal to rent or deal and discrimination in the terms and conditions in the occupancy and services.*

Respondent's Request for Reconsideration – Grant for Further Review - Continued

Geoffrey Coccia v. State of Ohio, Department of Transportation
AKRB3(39498)04052018
22A-2018-01879C

**Split Recommendation: Probable Cause on the basis of disability and retaliation and on the issue of failure to hire; No Probable Cause on the basis of disability and sex and on the issue of harassment and denial of full-time hire.*

Bailey Gilchrist v. Exchange Housing LLC, BRG Management, Inc.
Amanda Lowe and Ryan Rowe
AKRH3(39788)09132018
05-18-3066-8
22A-2018-03551F

Lars St. John v. City of Lakewood, Lakewood Municipal Court
CLEG4(44563)03302018
22A-2018-01845F

**Split Recommendation: Probable Cause on the basis of religion; No Probable Cause on the basis of race and retaliation*

Mrinal Chakraborty v. Erin Roby, Mont Michel Apartments
DAYH6(27114)03262018
22A-2018-02017F

3. Complainant's Motion to Reopen - Grant

Donna Herring v. Continent Village Apartments
COLH1(46553)10272018
22A-2019-00273F

4. Complainant's Motion to Reopen – Deny - Untimely

Gina Lott v. North College Hill City Schools
DAYE6(27607)10292018
22A-2019-00683F

5. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General's Office

Crystal Adams v. Madison Development Co., LLC, et al.
CLEH4(44255)10062017
05-18-1543-8
22A-2018-00147F
Complaint No. 18-HOU-CLE-44255

6. Issue Cease and Desist Order

Zachariah Grigsby and Danielle DeCarlo v. Debbie Ratliff
COLH1(44252)05162016
05-16-4949-8
22A-2016-01888F
Complaint No. 17-HOU-COL-44252

7. Issue Formal Complaint

Jasmaine Barry v. Roy and Tamara Jackson, Owners
TOLH2(39069)03092018
05-18-1218-8
22A-2018-01556F

Angela Boozer v. Omega Health Systems dba Alpha House
CLE74(44632)05032018
22A-2018-02225C

Miami Valley Fair Housing Center, Inc. v. Richard “Dick” L. Wuebker, Sr.; Patricia M. Wuebker; Gail A. and James T. Yost, Co-Owners
DAYH6(27060)03022018
05-18-3622-8
22A-2018-01600F

Tiffany Feltner v. Richard “Dick” L. Wuebker, Sr., et al.
DAYH6(27061)03022018
22A-2018-01601F

Alisha Lange v. BND Rentals dba Vandalia Rentals
DAY76(27077)03092018
22A-2018-01654C

Mrinal Chakaborty v. Erin Roby, Property Owner; Mont Michel Apartments
DAYH6(27114)03262018
22A-2018-02017F

8. Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation

Verna Cheers v. Northwest State Community College
TOL72(39126)04102018
22A-2018-01872C

**Split Recommendation: Probable cause on the basis of race and retaliation/issue of termination, denied position; No Probable Cause on the basis of sex/issue of termination, denied position, on the basis of race, sex, and retaliation, issue of demotion.*

Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation - Continued

J. Matthew Krull v. The University of Toledo
TOLB2(39136)04162018
22A-2018-01959C

Richard Kubiak v. General Motors LLC
AKRB3(39579)05212018
22A-2018-02384C

Dionne Sneed v. Dolgen Midwest, LLC dba Dollar General
AKRB3(39598)05072018
473-2018-00827C

Matthew Smucker v. Wayne County Commissioners Office
AKR73(39574)05162018
22A-2018-02381C

Shyanne Robinson v. Carolyn and Tennis King
AKRH3(39789)09132018
05-18-3154-8
22A-2018-03552F

Gilbert Abercrombie v. 4Lamm, LLC dba Fitness Zone
CLEG4(44862)09182018
22A-2018-03625F

**Split Recommendation: Probable Cause on the basis of sex; No Probable Cause on the basis of disability and religion*

Jason Hamby v. Village of Yellow Springs
DAY76(27151)04092018 AMENDED
22A-2018-01997C

9. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order After a Finding of Probable Cause

Jordan M. Cross v. The Cincinnati Air Conditioning Company
AKR73(39687)05302018
473-2018-01223

10. Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement After a Finding of Probable Cause

Sara & Jonathan Baker v. Kemba Financial Credit Union, Inc. Randi Decker, Mortgage Loan Advisor
TOLH6(27124)03062018
05-18-0862-8
22A-2018-01783F

Brandi Richardson v. A&D Home Health Professionals
DAYB6(27042)02202018
22A-2018-01415C

11. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination

Kareema Martin Case v. Cam Vic Corp.

DAYH6(27121)03232018

22A-2018-01780F

Carolyn L. Wheelright v. Falcon Trace Condominiums Association, et al.

DAYH6(27193)04302018

05-18-3151-8

22A-2018-02055F

Thomas Pappas v. Fawn Hinkin, Manager; Borrer Senior Living; and Amanda Jeffries

ADRH1(46656)12102018 AMENDED

05-19-3866-8

22A-2019-00698F

Wendie Thomas v. Oakview Apartments; Oakview Limited Partnership; Deardorf
Property Management, Inc.; Deanna Walter, Manager Oakview Apartments

ADRH2(39455)09142018

05-18-3627-8

22A-2018-03607F

Alexandria C. Woods v. Park Terrace Apartments Ohio LLC; Amy Rundio, Property
Manager Princeton Enterprises

ADRH2(39520)10192018

05-19-3920-8

22A-2019-00280F

Lyllyan Blare v. Meander Hospitality Group, Inc. dba Hampton Inn

ADRG3(39838)10032018

22A-2019-00073F

Peaches McDowell v. Jim Little and Ninth Street Holdings V Ltd.

ADRH3(39894)11072018

05-19-4048-8

22A-2019-00401F

Jennie Sue Gibbons v. Maple Brook at Golden Pond,
The NRP Group, Randi Reed, and Sheila Salisbury

ADRH3(39903)11152018

05-19-3786-8

22A-2019-00439F

Shanay Carey v. Ohio Multi-County Development Corporation
and Melissa Massey-Flinn

ADRH3(39936)12062018

05-19-3785-8

22A-2019-00657F

Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination - Continued

Lavonne Person v. Maxion Wheels Akron, LLC
ADR73(39949)12142018
22A-2019-00780C

Belinda Anderson v. NCC Solutions, Inc.
ADR74(45023)12172018
22A-2019 00806C

Gary Zigmann v. Stevenson Services Experts
ADRA6(27626)11062018
22A-2019-00368C

Ghitana Williams v. Premier Estate of Riverside
ADR76(27652)11192018
22A-2019-00583C

12. Withdrawal of Charge – With Settlement

Vicki A. Moore v. Denison University
ADR71(46655)12102018
22A-2019-00697C

Da'Mion Lawson v. Buckeye Restaurant Group LLC dba Wingstop
ADR71(46689)12282018 AMENDED
22A-2019-00868C

Carol Skeen v. Steven Blank, Regional Vice President; Debra Bowen, Manager; Meritus Communities; Reynolds Senior Village; Fred LNU, Previous Owner; Jimmy LNU, Previous Maintenance; Rick Oxley, Contractor
ADRH2(39449)09122018
22A-2018-03596F

Sabrina M. Williams v. Lucas County Department of Jobs and Family Services
ADR72(39561)11082018
22A-2019-00478C

Susan M. Hertle v. Nagle Toledo, Inc.
ADR72(39570)11192018
22A-2019-00487C

Antoinette Gaiter v. Lucas Metropolitan Housing Authority
ADRH2(39597)12102018
05-19-3911-8
22A-2019-00638F

Withdrawal of Charge – With Settlement - Continued

Sharmila E. Caldwell v. First Federal Bank
ADR72(39614)12202018
22A-2019-00801C AMENDED

Terree' Walton v. Argus Corporation
ADR72(39621)12272018
22A-2019-00834C

Erin Conrad v. Aldi Inc.
ADR73(39834)10022018
22A-2019-00042C

Erica Guthrie v. Carter Lumber Company
ADRB3(39837)10042018
22A-2019-00059C

Sheila Shuttlesworth v. Summit County Alcohol Drug Addiction & Mental Health Service Board
ADRB3(39862)10172018
22A-2019-00180C

Martha (Marty) Lang v. Harpst Ross & Becker Co., LLC
ADRA3(39917)11282018
22A-2019-00542C

Kimberly Sanchez v. Premier Protective Services
ADR74(44929)10182018
22A-2019-00276C

Joseph Green v. CVF, LLC dba Chagrin Valley Farm
ADR74(45044)01042019
22A-2019-00906C

Jeri Murray v. Warren County Educational Services Center
DAYB6(27469)08272018
22A-2018-03355C

Yvonne Charles v. Lowe's, Inc.
DAYA6(27501)09112018
22A-2018-03526C

13. Withdrawal of Charge - Grant

Edward Williams II v. Garda CL Great Lakes, Inc.
TOL72(39250)04272018
473-2018-01047

Withdrawal of Charge - Grant - Continued

Ransley Creech v. Montgomery County Sheriff's Office
DAY76(27169)04162018
22A-2018-02062C

Darlene Clements-McKinney v. Natalie Neff
DAYH6(27181)04202018
22A-2018-02130F

Shauntavia Russell v. Bella Vista Estates, et al.
DAYH6(27334)06022018 AMENDED
22A-2018-02674F

14. Withdrawal of Charge – Request for Notice of Right to Sue

Paula Bennett v. United Parcel Service, Inc.
TOLA2(39180)05012018
22A-2018-02155C

Frank Czerniejewski, Jr. v. United Parcel Service, Inc.
TOLB2(39186)05032018
22A-2018-02164C

Lorenzo Lavender v. Titanium Metals Corporation dba Timet
AKR73(39705)08092018
22A-2018-03161C

15. Administrative Closure

Ciera Gillard v. Mac's Convenience Stores LLC dba Circle K
TOL72(39109)03292018
22A-2018-01766C

David Sanders v. City of Toledo, Department of Sewer and Drainage
TOL72(39306)06132018 AMENDED
22A-2018-02621C

Daniel Ebert; Andria Dorsten Ebert v. Fifth Third Bank; Fifth Third Mortgage Company; James J. Florian, Appraiser; The William Fall Group, Inc.
TOLH2(39448)09122018
22A-2018-03595F

Administrative Closure

Daniel Ebert; Andria Dorsten Ebert v. James J. Florian, Appraiser; The William Fall Group, Inc.; Fifth Third Bank; Fifth Third Mortgage Company
TOLH2(39456)09122018
22A-2018-03608F

Tracey Bowman v. Stark Metropolitan Housing Authority
AKRH3(39543)05072018
05-18-2122-8
22A-2018-02277F

Walter B. Allen Jr. v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
AKRA3(39874)10302018
22A-2019-00303C

Amanda Searcy v. Colonial Court
DAYH6(27217)05042018
05-18-1412-8
22A-2018-02207F

16. No Jurisdiction – Dismiss (XNJ)

Elliot Monroe v. Target
COL71(46056)04272018 AMENDED
22A-2018-02049C

Brian Bibler v. US Government
COLG1(46408)09032018
22A-2018-03443F

Sherelle Dulaney v. Columbus Urban League
COLE1(46680)12192018
22A-2019-00791F

Brooke Tillman v. Kathy Smith, Owner; and Ohio Capital Resources
COLE1(44616)11212018
22A-2019-00997F

Dawn Serna-Gensch v. United States District Court for the Northern District of Ohio
TOL72(39576)11242018
22A-2019-00520C

Barry Wright v. Bennett Management Corp.
TOLE2(39581)11282018
22A-2019-00528F

No Jurisdiction – Dismiss (XNJ) - Continued

T’Vonna Knighten v. Mercy Health, St. Vincent Medical Center, LLC
TOLE2(39605)12162018
22A-2019-00760F

Diane Simms v. Drury Hotels Company, LLC
dba Drury Inn & Suites - Findlay
TOLE2(39652)01182019
22A-2019-01148F

Mary Brewer v. Sawmill Road Management Company, LLC,
Karla Kincaid and Robert Hellmuth
AKRH6(27648)11012018
05-19-3433-8
22A-2019-00713F

Alexandria Shields v. Judd Powell
AKRH6(27692)11212018
05-19-3542-8
22A-2019-00844F

Tawnia Ridenour v. Randall Lyle
AKRH3(39975)01022019
22A-2019-00954F

Tahana Armstead v. Pearl Leasing Co., LLC dba Greenbrier Healthcare Center
CLEE4(44985)11272018
22A-2019-00562F

Katherine Nagel v. Tradesmen International
CLE74(44993)12032018
22A-2019-00615F

DaVonte Bryant v. Kalahari Resorts and Conventions
CLEG4(44997)12042018
22A-2019-00626F

Tsipora Shoykeht v. Yeshiva Derech HaTorah
CLEG4(45003)12062018
22A-2019-00623F

Shondra Fryson v. Echoing Hills
CLEE4(45019)12122018
22A-2019-00756F

No Jurisdiction – Dismiss (XNJ) - Continued

William Colmer v. General Mills
DAYE6(27177)04192018
22A-2018-02111F

Leslie Frazier v. The Kroger Company
DAYE6(27196)04282018
22A-2018-02067F

Angela Pepper v. Adolescent Substance Abuse Programs, Inc.
DAYE6(27212)05052018
22A-2018-02181F

Cheyenne Connors v. Sunnv Valley, LLC, et al.
DAYH6(27322)05152018
05-18-1464-18
22A-2018-02597F

Ray Hinesman v. “Neighbor” (FNU/LNU)
DAYH69(27345)06252018
22A-2018-01278F

Gina Pierce v. Miller Valentine Group Property Mgmt. et al.
DAYH6(27404)07232018
22A-2018-03143F

Tina Gutierrez & Larry Brown v. Hammond North Condo Association, et al.
DAYH69(27423)07312018
22A-2018-03423F

Roderick D. Garrett v. The Martins, The Montgomerys
DAYE6(27665)11212018
22A-2019-00738F

Gary C. Watts v. Montgomery County Children Services
DAYE6(27705)12112018
22A-2019-00858F

17. No Jurisdiction – Dismiss

Dr. Jack A. Shulman v. Facebook, Inc.
COLG1(46707)01042019
22A-2019-00919F

No Jurisdiction – Dismiss - Continued

Joseph Proctor v. Children’s Hospital Medical Center of Akron
AKRG3(39931)12062018
22A-2019-00645F

Sara Wright v. Riverside Towers Resident Association
AKRH1(46650)12062018
22A-2019-00625F

Kathy Marie Bible v. Riverside Towers Resident Association
AKRH1(46657)12102018
22A-2019-00700F

Michael Ruzicho v. 1981-13311 Brookpark, LLC dba Amber’s Cabaret
CLEE4(44949)10312018
22A-2019-00352F

Michael Ruzicho v. 1981-13311 Brookpark, LLC dba Amber’s Cabaret
CLEE4(44966)11122018
22A-2019-00465F

Crystal Underwood v. University Hospitals Ahuja Medical Center, Inc.
CLEG4(44978)11182018
22A-2019-00476F

Michael Ruzicho v. 1981-13311 Brookpark, LLC dba Amber’s Cabaret
CLEE4(45005)12092018
22A-2019-00634F

Jeff Di Fiore v. Cuyahoga County Community College
CLEG4(45057)01122019
22A-2019-01008F

Jeff Di Fiore v. Lakeland Community College
CLEK4(45058)01122019
22A-2019-01009F

Christine Hurless obo Levi Miller v. Upper Valley School District
DAYE6(27748)01072019
22A-2019-01024F

Roger Evans v. Day Air Credit Union
DAYF6(27755)01142019
22A-2019-01030F

18. No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Melinda Lowery v. Protech Northland Heating & Cooling Co., Inc.
COL71(45985)04032018
22A-2018-01804C

Tracy Williams v. VAT Inc.
COL71(45986)04032018 AMENDED
22A-2018-01810C

Willard Flack v. CBRE
COLA1(46003)04102018 AMENDED
22A-2018-01875C

Shailendra Rana v. JP Morgan Chase
COL71(46011)04122018
22A-2018-01901C

Gena Moore v. Goodwill Columbus
COL71(46016)04132016
22A-2018-01916C

Hallie Hoover v. Air Contact Transport, Inc.
COL71(46020)04152018
22A-2018-01922C

Timeko Bryant v. PNC Bank
COLB1(46023)04162018 AMENDED
22A-2018-01931C

Minnie Dukuly v. L Brands
COL71(46054)04272018
22A-2018-02046C AMENDED

Anthony Vázquez v. Ryder Truck Rental, Inc.
COL71(46062) 05022018
22A-2018-02110C

Michelle Foley v. JPMorgan Chase/Chase BankCard Services, Inc.
COLA1(46073)05032018 AMENDED
22A-2018-02138C

Germika Davis v. Beauty Express Salons Inc.,
dba Pure Beauty Salons and Spas at Macy's
COL71(46081)05072018
22A-2018-02183C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Jeffery Phillips v. UniFirst Corporation
COLA1(46117)05212018
22A-2018-02327C

Tarleshia Holmes v. Centene Management Company LLC
COL71(46132)05252018 AMENDED
22A-2018-02417C

Jackie Shirley v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
COLA1(46148)06042018 AMENDED
22A-2018-02491C

Leah Porter v. Franklin County Child Support Enforcement Agency
COL71(46156)06072018
22A-2018-02516C

Matthew Fisher v. Ruscilli Construction Co. Inc.
COL71(46173)06142018
22A-2018-02589C

Jamie White v. New Life Properties of Ohio, LLC; Melissa Evans; New Life Property Management, LLC; Paigelynn Guzmán, Resident Manager; and Jenny Rosengren, Director of Human Resources
COLH1(46311)08012018 AMENDED
05-18-2460-8
22A-2018-03056F

Tara Tucker v. City of Columbus, Department of Public Health
COL71(46339)08082018 AMENDED
22A-2018-03144C

Derar Alhelo v. Kimberly Market
COLB1(46361)08172018 AMENDED
22A-2018-03214C

José Vílchez v. Ryder Truck Rental, Inc.
COL71(46368)05022018
22A-2018-02112C

Magdy S. Abdelgawad v. The Ohio State University, Office of Student Life
COL71(46403)09042018
22A-2018-03429C

*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Elizabeth Ann Wilcox Hawkins v. State of Ohio, Department of Youth Services
COLB1(46424)09112018
22A-2018-03520C

Mekeba N. Smith v. Community Housing Network, Inc.; and Celeste Cardwell
COLH1(46447)09202018
05-18-2950-8
22A-2018-03610F

Halima Mohamud v. Sam's East, Inc. dba Sam's Club
COL71(46474)10022018
22A-2019-00030C

Phyllis Sonnenberg v. Capital Square Hotel LLC dba
Holiday Inn downtown Capital Square
COLA1(46535)10242018
22A-2019-00213C

Tiara Napper v. Zulily
COL71(46563)11052018
22A-2019-00335C

Grace Woicinski v. First Equity Properties, LLC
COLB1(46595)11122018 AMENDED
22A-2019-00422C

Mary Elizabeth Evans v. Anthony Thomas Candy Company
COLA1(46599)11552018
22A-2019-00426C

Tona V. McNeal v. Rumpke Consolidated Companies, Inc.
COL71(46622)11272018
22A-2019-00510C

James N. Richmond, Jr. v. Ryan Environmental Transport
COLE1(46661)12142018
22A-2019-00718F

Belinda Frazier v. Fields Excavating
COL71(46722)01112019
22A-2019-00980C

Verna Cheers v. Northwest State Community College
TOL72(39126)04102018
22A-2018-01872C

**Split Recommendation: Probable cause on the basis of race and retaliation/issue of termination, denied position; No Probable Cause on the basis of sex/issue of termination, denied position, on the basis of race, sex, and retaliation, issue of demotion.*

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

The Estate of Jack Dearman v. Vicky Kirkpatrick, Community Manager, Faith Housing Communities, LLC; Ami Homestead, Regional Manager, Faith Housing Communities, LLC; Dave Kiette, President, Multifamily Property Management, Miller Valentine Group Realty Services LLC
TOLH2(39131)04122018
22A-2018-01903F

Yvonne Scales v. The University of Toledo Medical Center
TOLA2(39142)04182018
22A-2018-01966C

Jennifer Strock v. Jonathan and Catherine Balduf
TOLH2(39148)04202018
05-18-2207-8
22A-2018-01973F

Janice Parkinson v. Detroit Manufacturing Systems Toledo And Non-Automotive, LLC
TOL72(39171)04262018
22A-2018-02093C

Peggy Myers v. Heritage Commercial, LLC; Paul Wlasiuk, President of Heritage Commercial LLC; Kelly Fowler, Heritage Commercial LLC; Phil Stanball, Manager, Heritage Commercial, LLC
TOLH2(39172)04272018
05-18-1765-8
22A-2018-02094F

Shawn Liggons v. General Motors, LLC
TOL72(39175)04302018
22A-2018-02144C

Phillip Doyle & Pharlandia Doyle v. Chelsea Garden Apartments; Chelsea Garden Apartments LLC; Chelsea Garden Apartments LLC A Delaware LLC; Angela Katafiasz, Property Manager; Kaila Meshack, Property Manager; Morgan Management LLC; Grand Atlas Property Management
TOLH2(39178)05012018 AMENDED
22A-2018-02153F

Debbra Jackson v. The University of Toledo
TOLB2(39181)05012018
22A-2018-02158C

Kimberly Kirkham v. University of Toledo, Medical Center
TOLB2(39182)05012018
22A-2018-02159C

Janice Parkinson v. Detroit Manufacturing Systems Toledo And Non-Automotive, LLC
TOL72(39183)05022018 AMENDED
22A-2018-02161C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Ernest Tucker v. Roppe Corporation
TOL72(39184)05022018
22A-2018-02162C

David M. Cavanaugh v. Lowe's Home Centers, LLC
TOLB2(39185)05022018
22A-2018-02163C

Jamie Buress v. Ridgewood Facility Operations, LLC dba Ridgewood Manor
TOL72(39187)05032018
22A-2018-02165C

Daniel Bisson v. Advanced Construction Group, Inc.
TOL72(39190)05062018
22A-2018-02190C

Sharon Jacobs v. Bryan City Schools
TOLB2(39193)05092018
22A-2018-02232C

Miguel Rodriguez v. Hanon Systems USA, Inc.
TOL72(39197)05102018
22A-2018-02237C

Meagan Adele Jackson v. Toledo Day Nursery
TOLG2(39202)05162018
22A-2018-02333F

Jasmine Foster v. Famous Dave's Corporation
TOL72(39204)05162018
22A-2018-02337C

Sierra Carros v. Famous Dave's Corporation
TOL72(39205)05162018
22A-2018-02338C

Kennedy Haithcock v. The University of Toledo Medical Center
TOL72(39206)05162018 AMENDED
22A-2018-02339C

Judith Jaynes v. Checker Distributors
TOLB2(39208)05172018
22A-2018-02341C

Tiffany R. Doss v. Syncreon. US Inc. dba Syncreon North America
TOL72(39211)05172018
22A-2018-02344C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Tiffany R. Doss v. Kelly Services, Inc.
TOL72(39212)05172018
22A-2018-02345C

Kristen Anderson and Olivia Anderson v. ReMax Preferred Associates Property Management; Cindi Kurtz, Director of Property Management; Erin Osstifin, Remax Preferred Associate
TOLH2(39213)05172018
05-18-2129-8
22A-2018-02346F

Antoinette M. Yarborough v. Mondelez Global LLC
TOL72(39217)05182018
22A-2018-02349C

Sharon Hill v. The University of Toledo
TOLB2(39225)05212018 AMENDED
22A-2018-02443C

Sharon Hill v. The University of Toledo
TOLB2(39226)05212018 AMENDED
22A-2018-02444C

Ibrahim Ibrahim v. State of Ohio, Department of Public Safety, Ohio State Highway Patrol
TOL72(39251)06062018
22A-2018-02567C

Sue Henneman v. Senator International, Inc.
TOLB2(39550)11012018
22A-2019-00384C

Gloria Monval v. Arlington Church of God of Akron, Ohio, Inc. dba Irma A. Jones Preschool/Infant Center
AKR73(39558)05102018
22A-2018-02290C

Dorsey Butler v. Lambert Buick GMC Inc.
AKRG3(39655)07142018
22A-2018-02924F

Richard Gallagher v. NTX, Inc.
AKRB3(39657)07162018
22A-2018-02934C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Nyle Hill v. Howard Street Garage II, Inc.

AKR73(39667)07192018

22A-2018-03031C

Rosa Hartman v. Peregrine Health Services, Inc. dba McCrea Manor Nursing & Rehabilitation Center

AKR73(39718)08132018

22A-2018-03295C

Emily Snyder for Jason Snyder v. Kent State University

AKRK3(39722)08132018

22A-2018-03263F

Keely Jones v. County of Summit, Department of Job & Family Services

AKRA3(39724)08142018

22A-2018-03266C

Dennis Lewis v. Oriana House, Inc. and Kyle McDonald

AKRH3(39725)08102018

05-18-3538-8

22A-2018-03267F

Indiah Boggs v. County of Stark, Job & Family Services

AKR73(39765)08312018

22A-2018-03493C

Indiah Boggs v. Vets Securing America, Inc.

AKR73(39766)08312018

22A-2018-03494C

Nyle Hill v. Howard Street Garage II, Inc.

AKR73(39768)09042018

22A-2018-03497C

Eydie Nash v. Hendrickson USA, L.L.C.

AKRA3(39770)09042018

22A-2018-03499C

Angelina Hopson v. Environmental Control, LLC

AKR73(39805)09202018

22A-2018-03663C

Therese L.F. Elder v. Tommie Matello

AKRH3(39822)08162018

22A-2019-00048F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Therese L.F. Elder v. Maurice Brown
AKRH3(39823)08162018
22A-2019-00049F

Therese L.F. Elder v. Kyle and Michelle Casto
AKRH3(39826)08162018
22A-2019-00053F

Therese L.F. Elder v. James Raha
AKRH3(39827)08162018
22A-2019-00054F

Therese L.F. Elder v. Penny Raha
AKRH3(39828)08162018
22A-2019-00055F

Ashley Davis v. Paul J. and Dorphine Peace, Sr., Marie Tarpley and Thais and Arnold Davidson
AKRH3(39872)10272018
22A-2019-00258F

Robert Burwell v. Village of Sugarcreek
AKRM3(39916)11272018
22A-2019-00541F

Floyd Ellis, Sr. v. WFMJ Television, Inc.
AKRG3(39981)01062019
22A-2019-00961F

Floyd Ellis, Sr. v. State of Ohio, Lottery Commission
AKRG3(39988)01102019
22A-2019-00988F

Katrina Robinson v. Cleveland State University
AKRB3(44710)06182018
22A-2018-02662C

Katrina Robinson v. Cleveland State University
AKRB3(44711)06182018
22A-2018-02664C

James Holbrook v. Swift Transportation Services, LLC
AKRB1(46187)06202018
22A-2018-02666C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Jeanine Conway v. Thomas Woods and Norway Apartments LLC
CLEH4(44662)05252018
05-18-2777-8
22A-2018-02486F

Kim A. Price v. Applied Industrial Technologies, Inc.
CLEA4(44667)05302018
22A-2018-02483C

Lisa M. Brady v. Alliance Group Agency, Inc.
CLEE4(44699)05222018
22A-2018-02641F

Dante Orsini v. The Salvation Army and Matt Bechtold
CLEH4(44702)06152018
05-18-2764-8
22A-2018-02633F

David Foster v. Hudec Dental
CLE74(44813)08202018
22A-2018-03313C

Gilbert Abercrombie v. 4Lamm, LLC dba Fitness Zone
CLEG4(44862)09182018
22A-2018-03625F

**Split Recommendation: Probable Cause on the basis of sex; No Probable Cause on the basis of disability and religion*

Aislinn Dunne v. City of Middleburg Heights
CLE74(44878)09262018
22A-2018-03690C

Laura Takacs v. City of Middleburg Heights
CLE74(44879)09262018
22A-2019-00004C

Patrick Hill v. Cleveland Clinic Foundation
CLE74(44894)10012018
22A-2019-00039C

Ronald Garr v. Recovery Resources
CLEF4(44916)10132018
22A-2019-00263F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Ronsheena Johnson v. Regnig, LLC dba Wasabi Japanese Steakhouse
CLEG4(44921)10152018
22A-2019-00265F

Pamela Beavers v. City of Cleveland, Division of EMS
CLE74(44930)10192018
22A-2019-00250C

Pamela Beavers v. City of Cleveland, Division of EMS
CLE74(44931)10192018
22A-2019-00252C

John Kestner v. Kent State University, College of Podiatric Medicine
CLE74(44937)10232018
22A-2019-00279C

Michael Threat v. City of Cleveland, Division of EMS
CLE74(44940)10232018
22A-2019-00295C

Margerita Noland-Moore v. City of Cleveland, Division of EMS
CLE74(44941)10232018
22A-2019-00296C

Lawrence Walker v. City of Cleveland, Division of EMS
CLE74(44942)10232018
22A-2019-00323C

Reginald Anderson v. City of Cleveland, Division of EMS
CLE74(44946)10262018
22A-2019-00343C

Michael Clark v. 1313 Linda, Inc. dba Wine Bar Rocky River
CLE74(44958)11052018
22A-2019-00434C

Nicole Jones v. Cleveland Clinic Foundation
CLE74(44973)11142018
22A-2019-00458C

Sheila Slaughter v. Kappa Alpha Psi Fraternity House of Cleveland, Ohio, Inc.
CLEE4(45020)12122018
22A-2019-00758F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Edward Helmuth v. Tarkett, USA, Inc.
CLEA3(39854)10152018
22A-2019-00133C

Isiah Simpson v. Lima Radio Hospital, Inc.
DAY76(27145)04092018
22A-2018-02008C

Ashley Cox v. NaphCare, Inc.
DAY76(27150)04092018
22A-2018-01990C

Jasmine Richardson v. Speedway (Store #1090)
DAY76(27157)04112018
22A-2018-02011C

Sara Collier v. Greenbriar Senior Living Campus
DAY76(27158)04112018
22A-2018-02058C

Seth E. Fezatte v. Jeff Wyler Automotive Family
DAY76(27162)04122018
22A-2018-01974C

Mary Rottert v. Falcon Trace Condominiums, et al.
DAYH6(27163)04112018
05-18-1215-8
22A-2018-01976C

Beverly Stevens v. Clark State Community College
DAYA6 (27170) 04152018
22A-2018-01987C

Stacy Howell v. The Wharf
DAY76(27179)04202018
22A-2018-02129F

Trenton D. Tolliver v. Ford Motor Company
DAY76(27189)04262018
22A-2018-02040C

Elsa G. Alvarado v. Mary Scott Nursing Center
DAY76(27192)04272018
22A-2018-02047C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Jami S. Wagner v. NCP Finance
DAYA6(27197)04272018
22A-2018-02068C

Tyler Freel v. American Line Builders Apprenticeship Training Committee dba ALBAT
DAYB6(27198)04302018 AMENDED
22A-2018-02078C

Mark G. Adkins v. Schindewolf Express, Inc.
DAY76(27199)04302018
22A-2018-02090C

Cassandra Horton v. Tina Heist, Manager, Wimbledon Apartments, et al.
DAYH6(27209)05072018
22A-2018-02209F

Adriel Peterson v. Mercy Siena Springs, et al.
DAYH6(27223)05102018
22A-2018-02219F

Julie Kelly v. First Data Corporation
DAYB6(27240)05172018
22A-2018-02392C

Steven Ray Riley v. Spherion of Lima, Inc.
DAYA6(27260)05242018
22A-2018-02412C

Parrish C. Lattimore v. State of Ohio, Department of Transportation
DAY76(27268)05292018
22A-2018-02428C

Sandro Jones v. St. Vincent DePaul Shelter
DAYH6(27354)06282018
22A-2018-02755F

Margie Black v. Premier Energy Services, LLC
DAY76(27468)08272018
22A-2018-03541C

Steven Ray Riley v. Celina Aluminum Precision Technology, Inc.
DAYA6(27578)05242018
22A-2019-00170C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Ke'Shayonda Stewart v. Thirty-One Gifts LLC
DAYB1(46036)04232018
22A-2018-01983C

Ke'Shayonda Stewart v. Securitas Security Services USA, Inc.
DAYB1(46037)04232018
22A-2018-01984C

Marcus Stanford v. Eldorado Scioto Downs
DAYA1(46122)05212018
22A-2018-02354C

John Stos v. Dana Driveshaft Manufacturing LLC
DAYA2(39161)04252018
22A-2018-02083C

MOTION by Commissioner Singh to approve the February 21, 2019 Confirmation Agenda. Second by Commissioner Peters.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES – with noted recusal
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

STAFF BRIEFING

The Compliance Director reported that the Commission had complied with all notification requirements as set forth in Ohio Administrative Code Section 4112-1-04.

APPEARANCE CASES

Appearance 1

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 2, Page 1, Item I-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Danyale Johnson v. Sandalwood Apartments of Toledo, Inc.; Sandalwood Apartments; Charlene Rittner,
Property Manager
TOLH2(39100)03272018
05-18-1391-8
22A-2018-0175F

Upon review of the application for reconsideration in this matter, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination. Neither party was present to discuss the case.

**MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to reinstate the previous finding of No Probable Cause - Dismiss.
Second by Commissioner Cespedes.**

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 2

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 2, Page 1, Item I-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Sue Lamb v. Saint-Gobain Performance Plastics Corporation
AKR73(39526)04252018
22A-2018-02056C

Upon review of the application for reconsideration in this matter, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination. Second by Commissioner Peters.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 3

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 2, Page 2, Item I-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Diane Myers v. Riser Foods Company dba Giant Eagle
CLE74(44574)04112018
22A-2018-01883C

Upon review of the application for reconsideration in this matter, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

**MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination.
Second by Commissioner Peters.**

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 4

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 3, Page 1, Item I-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: Uphold Probable Cause Determination

Tiffany Feltner v Richard "Dick" L. Wuebker, Sr., et al.
DAYH6(27061)03022018
22A-2018-01601F

Upon review of the application for reconsideration in this matter, staff recommended the Commission uphold the Probable Cause determination. The parties were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Peters to uphold the previous Probable Cause determination. Second by Commissioner Singh.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	NO
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: Uphold Probable Cause Determination

Miami Valley Fair Housing Center, Inc. v. Richard "Dick" L. Wuebker, Sr., et al.
DAYH6(27060)03022018
05-18-3622-8
22A-2018-01600F

Upon review of the application for reconsideration in this matter, staff recommended the Commission uphold the Probable Cause determination. The parties were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to uphold the previous Probable Cause determination. Second by Commissioner Peters.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

MOTION by Commissioner Singh to take a recess. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

MOTION by Commissioner Peters to return to public session. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 6

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 3, Page 1, Item I-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: Uphold Probable Cause Determination

Alisha Lange v. BND Rentals, Inc. dba Vandalia Rental
DAY76(27077)03092018
22A-2018-01654C

Upon review of the application for reconsideration in this matter, staff recommended the Commission uphold the Probable Cause determination. The parties were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to uphold the previous Probable Cause determination. Second by Commissioner Peters.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioners' Agenda for Week 1

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Patrick B. Clark v. Jefferson Industries Corporation
COL71(46022)04162018
22A-2018-01928C

Kelly Mabra v. Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
COL71(46228)07012018 AMENDED
22A-2018-02766C

MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Commissioners' Agenda for Week 1. Second by Commissioner Peters.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioners' Agenda for Week 2

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Andrea Sealey v. Plus One Communications, LLC
AKR73(39500)04062018
22A-2018-01882C

Andrea Sealey v. Plus One Communications, LLC
AKR73(39533)04262018
22A-2018-02140C

Lars St. John v. Cuyahoga County Personnel Review Commission
CLE74(44872)09242018
22A-2018-03649C

Lars St. John v. Cuyahoga County Administrative Headquarters
CLE74(44873)09242018
22A-2018-03653C

MOTION by Commissioner Peters to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Commissioners' Agenda for Week 2. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioners' Agenda for Week 3

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration: Uphold Probable Cause Determination

Sanad Al Madhagi v. JP Morgan Chase Bank
DAY76(27049)02262018
22A-2018-01484C

MOTION by Commissioner Singh to reverse the previous Probable Cause determination to No Probable Cause – Dismiss Formal Complaint. Second by Commissioner Patmon.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	NO
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	NO

Motion carried.

2. Findings Upon Reconsideration: Reverse No Probable Cause to Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation

Steven R. Bederman v. Andes Bar & Grill
COLE1(45915)03092018
22A-2018-01566F

MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned case on the Commissioners' Agenda for Week 3. Second by Commissioner Peters.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Report from the Ohio Attorney General's Office

Sharon Tassie, Assistant Civil Rights Section Chief – Ohio Attorney General's Office, informed the Commissioners that assistant attorney general Azure'D Metoyer is leaving the Civil Rights section. She will be taking a job with the Franklin County Court of Common Pleas. As she said her goodbyes, Azure'D thanked the Commission for the experience and expressed her excitement for the new opportunity.

Report from the Chief Legal Counsel

Chief Legal Counsel Stephanie Demers began her report by bidding Farewell to Azure'D Metoyer. Next, she reminded the Commissioners and the E-2 staff that the deadline to file financial disclosures is May 15th. She offered assistance to anyone who needs it. Lastly, she reported all 41 rules have been submitted to JCARR. This includes no change rules, rescinded rules and amended rules. While we will not need to review the rules for another five years, the General Assembly enacted a law, which will go into effect in August which may require the agency to convert any law-based policies to an administrative rule. We are waiting on further information and instructions from JCARR.

Report from Executive Director

Executive Director G. Michael Payton thanked Azure'D Metoyer and recognized the distinguished history of the civil rights section and the individuals who have come thru the section. Director Payton briefly spoke about the arrangements and logistics for the March 14th Commission meeting at Wright State University. He reminded the Commissioners of the upcoming Martin Luther King Jr. Art, Essay and Multimedia contest being held at the Ohio Historical Society on February 28, 2019. He ended his report by informing the Commissioners that Policy Matters Ohio, a progressive non-profit advocacy organization, has decided to make the OCRC part of its focus in the upcoming budget cycle. Policy Matters Ohio has placed civil rights high on its priority list and will advocate for an increase in the OCRC's budget.

Remarks

The Commissioners commended Chair Barreras on her work as the Chair and acknowledged the good work of the staff. Commissioner Patmon gave special recognition to Darlene Newbern for her work with the General Motors cases. Commissioners Peters wished everyone a happy Black History month. Commissioner Cespedes appreciated spending time with Director Payton and Mary Turocy at the Senate advocating for the OCRC's budget.

MOTION by Commissioner Singh to adjourn the public meeting. Second by Commissioner Peters.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	ABSENT
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

The regular meeting of The Ohio Civil Rights Commission was ADJOURNED at 1:40PM.



* * *

Commissioner