



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF
THE OHIO CIVIL RIGHTS COMMISSION**

**September 26, 2019
Administrative Hearing Room
Rhodes State Office Tower
Columbus, Ohio**

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Lori Barreras called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Commissioners Present:

Chair Lori Barreras
Commissioner William Patmon – Did Not Participate
Commissioner Madhu Singh
Commissioner Juan Cespedes
Commissioner Carolyn Peters

A quorum was present.

OCRC Staff Present:

G. Michael Payton, Executive Director; Darlene Newbern, Director of Operations; Stephanie Bostos Demers, Chief Legal Counsel; Mary Turocy, Director of Public Affairs and Civic Engagement; Desmon Martin, Director of Enforcement and Compliance; Ronnell Tomlinson, Director of Housing Enforcement and Alternative Dispute Resolution; Aman Mehra, Columbus Regional Director; Angel Stone, Columbus Regional Supervisor; Inder LeVesque, Toledo Regional Director; Bradley Dunn, Akron Regional Director; Vera Boggs, Cleveland Regional Director; Deborah Heater, Dayton Regional Supervisor; Beyan Asoba, Reconsideration Supervisor. Also in attendance: Lori Anthony, Civil Rights Section Chief, Ohio Attorney General's Office.

Chair Barreras welcomed everyone to the meeting.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION by Commissioner Singh to approve the August 29, 2019 minutes. Second by Commissioner Peters.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	DID NOT PARTICIPATE
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

CONFIRMATION OF STAFF FINDINGS

1. Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Vacate Original No Probable Cause Finding and Grant for Further Review

Bing Tian v. The Ohio State University
COLA1(46489)10092018
22A-2019-00104C

*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

Neal Kelley v. The Ohio State University
COLB1(46490)10092018
22A-2019-00105C

*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

Asegedech Kumnegere v. JP Morgan Chase
COLB1(46608)11162018 AMENDED
22A-2019-00470C

Michael Asamoah v. Capstone Logistics LLC & Progressive Logistics Services, LLC
COLA1(46892)03202019
22A-2019-01644C

Evan Booth v. Aptree, Inc.
TOL72(39563)11082018
22A-2019-00480C

Joshua Ashmore v. Eastpointe Apartments LP; Ten South Management Company; Kelly Adesi-
Beaubien, Property Manager; Marissa Ramirez, Manager
TOLH2(39577)11242018 AMENDED
05-19-4210-8
22A-2019-00521F

Marvin K. Meeks, Sr. v. Monro, Inc.
TOL72(39655)01222019
22A-2019-01153C

Marvin K. Meeks, Sr. v. Monro, Inc.
TOL72(39601)12122018
22A-2019-00653C

Marianne Edwards v. Cleveland Clinic Akron General
AKRA3(40083)02272019 AMENDED
22A-2019-01520C

Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Vacate Original No Probable Cause Finding and Grant for Further Review - Continued

Christine Grant v. Akron Metropolitan Housing Authority
AKRH3(40106)03122019
05-19-4670-8
22A-2019-01604F

Kevin J. Keller v. Air Wisconsin Airlines
DAYB6(27674)11272018
22A-2019-00515C

Stevie Brown v. Necco
DAY76(27700)12102018
22A-2019-00855C

Jon Perry v. Indian Hill Schools
DAYB6(27725)12212018
22A-2019-00920C

2. Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Vacate Original No Jurisdiction Finding and Grant for Further Review

Pamela Kindle v. Office of the Sandusky County Prosecuting Attorney
TOLA2(39610)12172018
22A-2019-00781C

3. Respondent's Request for Reconsideration – Grant for Further Review

Eva Johnson v. Buckingham Coal Company, LLC
COL71(46792)02122019
22A-2019-01269C

Stacey Atkinson v. Buckingham Coal Company, LLC
COL71(46812)02152019
22A-2019-01334C

Brittany Blosser v. Buckingham Coal Company, LLC
COL71(46813)02152019
22A-2019-01335C

Courtney Harris v. Buckingham Coal Company, LLC
COL71(46815)02152019
22A-2019-01337C

Larice Matthews v. FCA US LLC
TOL72(39600)12122018
22A-2019-00652C

Respondent's Request for Reconsideration – Grant for Further Review - Continued

Kimberly A. Wheeler v. Miami Valley Career Technology Center
DAYA6(27605)10292018
22A-2019-00288C

*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the basis of age and retaliation, issue of promotion; No Probable Cause - Dismiss on the basis of sex, issue of promotion

4. Complainant's Request for Reconsideration - Deny - Untimely

Ezequiel Saez Morales v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
COL74(45045)01072019
22A-2019-00926C

5. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General's Office

Ability Center of Greater Toledo v. Contour Toledo, LLC; Steven L. Diller, Statutory Agent; City of Toledo
TOLH2(38363)03232017
22A-2017-01646F
Complaint No. 18-HOU-TOL-38363

Fair Housing Resource Center v. Hans Richter and Hans Richter Trustee
CLEH4(44701)03082018 AMENDED
05-18-1427-8
22A-2018-02643F
Complaint No. 18-HOU-CLE-44701

Patrick Kelly v. Maple Brook at Golden Pond II, LLC; The NRP Group LLC, Randi Reed and Sheila Salisbury
AKRH3(39727)08132018
22A-2018-03269F
Complaint No. 19-HOU-AKR-39727

Phyllis Johnson v. Meigs County Clerk of Courts
DAYE6(26198)01282017
22A-2017-01162C
Complaint No. 17-EMP-DAY-26198

6. Issue Formal Complaint

Tiffany Ann Armstrong v. State of Ohio, Department of Health
COL71(46484)10052018
22A-2019-00064C

Issue Formal Complaint - Continued

Karen Marquardt v. City of Toledo, Fire and Rescue Department
TOL72(39549)09282018
22A-2019-00383C

Lorene Biglow v. Fox Creek Apartments; TG Toledo LLC A Michigan Limited Liability Company; The Tobin Group; Group Five Management Company; Latoya Harris, Property Manager
TOLH2(39482)10022018
05-19-3173-8
22A-2019-00091F

Kari Gonzalez v. City of Toledo, Fire and Rescue Department
TOL72(39490)10032018 AMENDED
22A-2019-00111C

Alex Turner v. Faurecia Exhaust Systems, LLC
TOLB2(39493)10052018
22A-2019-00114C

Mary Lewis v. City of Toledo, Department of Public Utilities, Division of Water
Distribution
TOL72(39504)10122018
22A-2019-00153C

Debra Saylor v. W-T Realty, Inc. et al; Brian Hemmer, Property Manager, Ross Park
Apartments; Amanda LNU, Employee; Ross Park Apartments LLC
TOLH2(39574)09282018
05-19-3427-8
22A-2019-00524F

Fair Housing Advocates Association v. Boulevard at Green, LLC, Vision WODA LLC & Vision
WODA LLC
AKRH3(40058)02192019 AMENDED
22A-2019-01377F

Roger Supinger v. Fitzsimmons Surgical Supply, Inc., Fitzsimmons Hospital Services
DAYA6(27603)10292018
22A-2019-00259C

Kimberly Wheeler v. Miami Valley Career Technology Center
DAYA6(27605)10292018
22A-2019-00288C

7. Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation

Raechel Peters v. Orange Township Fire Department
COL71(46633)12032018
22A-2019-00588C

Schlyer Crawford v. Rosemary Hajost, Owner
COLH1(47161)07122019
05-19-5812-8
22A-2019-02740F

Fair Housing Advocates Association v. Ollah Combs, Owner; Nancy Combs, Owner; Combs Properties
TOLH6(27691)12072018 AMENDED
05-19-4476-8
22A-2019-00845F

Sarah Shelley v. Ollah Combs, Owner; Nancy Combs, Owner; Combs Properties
TOLH2(39972)07122019
05-19-5912-8
22A-2019-02751F

H.O.M.E. v. William J. Holbrook
TOLH6(27719)12182018
05-19-3756-8
22A-2019-00867F

*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the issue of per se violation, advertising on the basis of National Origin, Familial Status and disability; No Probable Cause on the issue of Terms and Conditions regarding denial of rental on the basis of National Origin

Tim Jeffries for Vivian Jeffries v. Great Lakes Futsal, LLC
AKRG3(40001)01232019
22A-2019-01085F

Jaime Syvanych v. Franklin Arms Condominium Association, Joe Laberto, Mary Caspary and Sean Marenkovic
AKRH3(40105)03112019
05-19-4470-8
22A-2019-01603F

*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the basis of familial status and retaliation on the issue of harassment, coerce and terms and condition for Respondents Franklin Arms Condominium Association and Joe Laberto; No Probable Cause on the issue of harassment, coerce, and terms and conditions for Respondents Mary Caspary and Sean Marenkovic

Housing Research & Advocacy Center v. Giuseppina & Gaetano Campea and G.C. Real Estate, LLC
CLEH4(45100)02062019
22A-2019-01262F

Sydney Wilson v. Buckeye Community Sixteen LP; Rolling Ridge Housing Partners, Inc., et al.
DAYH6(27698)12102018
22A-2019-00853F

Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation - Continued

Anita C. Stevens v. Harvest Properties & Pennswood Drive Apartments, LLC
DAY76(27711)12132018
22A-2019-00863C

8. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order After a Finding of Probable Cause - Close

Danielle Tucker v. A&A Holdings, LLC dba Church's Chicken
COL71(46523)10192018
22A-2019-00182C

Marcus Green v. A.R.E. Accessories, LLC
AKR73(39861)10162018
22A-2019-00179C

Phenicia Thomas v. Stark County Metropolitan Housing Authority, Marvin Fox and Martin Chumney
AKRH3(39966)12212018
22A-2019-00886F

Loronz Gray v. United Prepaid Wireless, LLC dba Boost Mobile
CLEG4(45115)02152019
22A-2019-01347F

9. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination

Shirley Pollard and Jack Bornhoeft v. The Enclave at Albany Park; and Roger Norman, Manager
COLH1(47157)07112019 AMENDED
05-19-5890-8
22A-2019-02729F

Miami Valley Fair Housing Center, Inc. v. Greenwood Commons, LTD. and Wallick Properties LLC
CLEH6(27779)01242019 AMENDED
22A-2019-01218F

Mary A. Dillon v. Greenwood Commons, LTD. and Wallick Properties LLC
CLEH6(27780)01242019 AMENDED
22A-2019-01219F

Tamara Lamont v. Sylvania School District
CLEB2(39833)04292019 AMENDED
22A-2019-02096C

Arnold J. Womack, Jr. v. Cedar and Warrensville Apartments Limited Partnership, Millennia Housing Management, Ltd., and Diana Sampson
CLEH4(45202)04122019
05-19-5148-8
22A-2019-01922F

Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination - Continued

Bridgette Wilson v. The Parc; and Anita Profitt
ADRH1(47144)05212019 AMENDED
05-19-5629-8
22A-2019-02678F

Sandra Divel v. Wiley Heating and Cooling and Dan Shafer, Owner
ADRH1(47224)08052019 AMENDED
05-19-6522-8
22A-2019-03003F

Vincent West v. Jessica Castillo, Manager; Rylan Realty Group; Ryan Phillips, Broker/Owner Rylan Realty Group; Alan Longenecker, Realtor/Owner, Rylan Realty Group; Stephen M. Luda, Owner
ADRH2(39996)07232019
05-19-6026-8
22A-2019-02879F

Fair Housing Contact Service v. HER Property Management and Lehler Properties, LLC
ADRH3(40252)06282019
05-19-5888-8
22A-2019-02641F

Kristin Hohman v. HER Property Management, Lehler Properties, LLC
and Tracy Kauffman
ADRH3(40253)06282019
05-19-5889-8
22A-2019-02643F

Fair Housing Contact Services v. Lloyd Sacid and Louene Sacid
ADRH3(40257)07022019
05-19-5714-8
22A-2019-02661F

Jennifer Sikora v. TRE Properties, Thunder Holdings, LLC Eric Tack, and Rebecca Tack
ADRH3(40268)07162019 AMENDED
05-19-5970-8
22A-2019-02824F

Jennifer Sikora v. TRE Properties, Thunder Holdings, LLC Eric Tack, and Rebecca Tack
ADRH3(40311)07222019
05-19-5970-8
22A-2019-03090F

Lovene Rinn v. Jewish Senior Housing of Akron, Steve Newman
and Summit Management Services, Inc.
ADRH3(40312)07312019
05-19-6176-8
22A-2019-03151F

Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination - Continued

Sean Owen v. Ronald D. Sloan Revocable Living Trust and Harold and Barbara Allison
ADRH3(40317)08012019
05-19-6236-8
22A-2019-03172F

Janell Ferguson v. Robert Clark Jr.
ADRH3(40347)08232019
05-19-6359-8
22A-2019-03276F

Housing Research & Advocacy Center v. RHM Real Estate Inc. dba RHM Real Estate Group, State House Apartments, LTD., and Encore Residential, LLC
ADRH4(45270)05172019
22A-2019-02354F

Roberta Mowery v. Amherst Village Estates MHC, LLC, Horizon Land Co., and Jacqueline Casey
ADRH4(45385)07242019
05-19-6018-8
22A-2019-03097F

Shconya Green v. K & E Property Management, LTD, Kenneth Schwendeman, Mgr.
ADRH6(28189)07252019 AMENDED
05-19-6517-8
22A-2019-02949F

Bryan Hershey v. FedEx Freight
ADRB6(28196)07292019 AMENDED
22A-2019-02983C

David Tomlinson v. Samantha Pollock; Reefpoint LLC
DAYH6(27699)1210/2018
05-19-6296-8
22A-2019-00854F

10. Withdrawal of Charge – With Settlement

Virginia Davis v. Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease, LLP
COLB1(47094)06142019
22A-2019-02505C

Kimberly Jones v. Lutheran Homes Society, Inc. dba Genacross Lutheran Services Toledo Campus
TOLB2(39629)01032019
22A-2019-00951C

Withdrawal of Charge – With Settlement - Continued

Anthony L. Trevino v. Sauder Woodworking Co.
TOLB2(39631)01072019
22A-2019-00974C

Anita Flores v. Campbell Soup Company
TOL72(39638)01112019
22A-2019-00982C

Eileen Zeebuyth v. Campbell Soup Company, LLC
TOLA2(39656)01222019
22A-2019-01154C

Marquita Rankin v. Lutheran Homes Society, Inc. dba Genacross Lutheran Services
TOL72(40065)08192019
22A-2019-03142C

David Diggs v. GB Office Installation Group
ADRB1(47281)08262019 AMENDED
22A-2019-02389C

McNeal Thompson III for McNeal Thompson IV v. Dollar General
AKRG3(40214)05292019
22A-2019-02416F

Eslyn Woodberry v. Southeast, Inc.
ADR71(47064)06022019
22A-2019-01297C

Karmen Smith v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
ADR71(47169)07162019
22A-2019-02806C

Sandra Coleman v. Southeast, Inc. dba Southeast Healthcare Services
ADRA1(47241)08122019
22A-2019-03056C

Stacey Subblefield v. Thomas W. Wernert Center
ADR72(39920)06102019
22A-2019-02460C

Cynthia Slaughter v. Lucas County Job and Family Services
ADR72(39987)07222019
22A-2019-02863C

Withdrawal of Charge – With Settlement - Continued

Sheri Craig v. Rolf Park Pool
ADR72(39993)07232019
22A-2019-02876F

Janet Rychnovsky v. Golf Galaxy Inc.
ADR72(40015)07262019
22A-2019-02933C

Dionne Kelly-Taylor v. Lucas Metropolitan Housing Authority, Executive Director Demetria Simpson;
Amy Gerber, Property Manager
ADRH2(40021)07292019
05-19-6035-8
22A-2019-02956F

Julie Morhidge v. Falls Motor City, Inc.
ADR73(40057)02152019
22A-2019-01376C

Julie Morhidge v. Falls Motor City, Inc.
ADR73(40192)05082019
22A-2019-02281C

Natalie Alman v. Select Comfort Retail Corporation dba Sleep Number
ADR73(40228)06112019
22A-2019-02472C

Tim Simmers v. Suez Water Technologies and Solutions
ADR73(40255)06302019
22A-2019-02645C

Tim Simmers v. Suez Water Technologies and Solutions
ADR73(40256)06302019
22A-2019-02646C

Leon Cannon v. Meridian Healthcare
ADR73(40263)07092019
22A-2019-02713C

Hubert Clayton v. ABM Industry Group, LLC
ADR73(40265)07112019
22A-2019-02808F

Mona Lisa Saunders v. Akron Public Schools
ADR73(40273)07182019
22A-2019-02840C

Withdrawal of Charge – With Settlement - Continued

Allie Riley v. Abarta Coca-Cola Beverages
ADR73(40307)07312019
22A-2019-03025C

Adrian A. Claybrooks v. Swift Transportation
ADR74(45326)06142019
22A-2019-02531C

Emmanuel Stone v. Allstate Corporation and Regina Wolf
ADRH4(45330)06192019
05-19-5710-8
22A-2019-02573F

Jonathan Moore, Sr. v. Mill Rose Company
ADRA4(45334)06212019
22A-2019-02577C

Robin Barnett On behalf of Jeremy Barnett v. Charlie and Tango
ADRE4(45371)07152019 AMENDED
22A-2019-03005C

Roberta Mowery v. Bobbie and Brenda Grimmatt
ADRH4(45386)07242019
22A-2019-03098F

Stephanie Lira v. JD's Pizza
ADRB4(45391)07262019
22A-2019-03103C

Allie Riley v. Abarta Coca-Cola Beverages
ADR74(45432)08152019
22A-2019-03259C

11. Withdrawal of Charge – Grant

Dirk Burns v. Continental Secret Service Bureau, Inc.
TOL72(40077)08222019
22A-2019-03237C

Kinra King v. Goodwill Easter Seals Miami Valley
DAYA6(28203)08052019
22A-2019-03132C

12. Withdrawal of Charge – Request for Notice of Right to Sue

Richard S. Kiggins v. Toth Industries, Inc.
TOLA2(39648)01182019 AMENDED
22A-2019-01089C

13. Administrative Closure

James Craddock v. Pietra Naturale, Inc.
DAYE6(27732)12272018
22A-2019-00931F

14. No Jurisdiction – Dismiss (XNJ)

Martin Hopkins v. Alltel Corporation dba Verizon Wireless
COLE1(47109)06192019
22A-2019-02561F

Tabitha Stokes v. Fairfield Metropolitan Housing Authority and Leslie Fitch
COLH1(47153)07102019
22A-2019-02715F

John Pharo v. Synchrony Bank; Paypal, Inc.; MetaBank; and Keys
COLK1(47179)07182019
22A-2019-02837F

James Edwards v. Industrial Fabricators, Inc.
COLE1(47188)07192019
22A-2019-02852F

Shannon Whetsel v. Perimeter Lakes Apartments, Jaime LNU,
and AERC Perimeter Lakes Inc.
COLH1(47194)05052019
05-19-5854-8
22A-2019-02874F

Seth Stephenson and Emily McDonald v. The Reserve at the Fall
COLH1(47196)05072019
05-19-5910-8
22A-2019-02875F

Peyton Bradley v. Alliance Data
COLE1(47202)07262019
22A-2019-02940F

Twila Martin v. Washington County Fairgrounds
COLGI(47205)07282019
22A-2019-02946F

No Jurisdiction – Dismiss (XNJ) – Continued

Charles Davis v. Alyssa Lacey and WoodSpring Suites Hotels
COLH1(47206)07282019
22A-2019-02947F

Robert E. White v. Lazer Spot
COLE1(47215)07312019
22A-2019-02976F

Julio Patiño v. Oakwood Management Company
COLH1(47246)08122019
22A-2019-03060F

Ashlee Nelson v. Dan and Wallick Properties
COLH1(47252)08132019
22A-2019-03074F

Jeremy Murdock v. Selas Heat Technology Company, LLC
AKRG3(40235)06232019
22A-2019-02597C

Joshua Malone v. Allen Atkins dba AMA Transport LLC
AKRE3(40238)06242019
22A-2019-02601F

Justine Valentine v. Akron Child Support Agency
AKRG3(40264)07092019
22A-2019-02716F

Todd M. Shorts v. Parma City Schools
CLEE4(45337)06242019
22A-2019-02746F

Kori White v. Kohrman Jackson & Krantz
CLEE4(45340)06272019
22A-2019-02748F

Hannah Strunk v. Marble Builder Direct International, Inc.
CLEE4(45349)07022019
22A-2019-02675F

Joshua Knowles v. LorMet Community Federal Credit Union
CLEE4(45355)07082019
22A-2019-02701F

No Jurisdiction – Dismiss (XNJ) - Continued

Frater Minster Ronald Darrel Garr v. Terry McKiver KKK in Cuyahoga Falls Ohio
CLEK4(45358)07052019
22A-2019-02753F

Thomas Rutledge v. NRP Group
CLEH4(45402)07312019
22A-2019-03111F

Felita Thomas v. Premier Estates of Northwood
DAYE6(27606)10272018
22A-2019-00682F

Lavenia Jones v. Good Samaritan Hospital
DAYE6(27765)01182019
22A-2019-01075F

Melissa Gilliland v. Stillwater Center
DAYE6(27788)01252019
22A-2019-01310F

Nicole Eidemiller v. Old Troy Pike Veterinary Clinic ARLC, Inc.
DAYE6(27803)01302019
22A-2019-01322F

15. No Jurisdiction – Dismiss

Gregory Reed Sargent v. Marion County District Attorney’s Office,
Family Support Division
COLG1(47213)07302019
22A-2019-02973F

Horace Walker, Jr. v. Chalmers P. Wylie VA Ambulatory Care
COLG1(47263)08182019 AMENDED
22A-2019-03128F

Kevin M. Mapes v. Kids Count Too, Inc.
TOLG2(39867)05132019
22A-2019-02282F

Kevin Eslinger v. Altercare Transitional Care of the Western Reserve
AKRG3(40240)06192019
22A-2019-02603F

Kevin Eslinger v. Altercare Transitional Care of the Western Reserve
AKRH3(40243)06192019
22A-2019-02606F

No Jurisdiction – Dismiss - Continued

Felicia Bivins v. Cuyahoga County Sheriff's Department
CLEE4(45430)08192019
22A-2019-03270F

Sherry Green v. All Banks in Account History since 2011
DAYF6(27723)12202018
22A-2019-00916F

Ethan Moore v. Van Wert County Probate Court
DAYG6(27800)01292019
22A-2019-01319F

Ethan Moore v. Van Wert County Probate Court Judge
DAYG6(27802)01302019
22A-2019-01321F

16. No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Tamar Bradberry v. StyleTech Corporation dba Great Clips
COL71(46577)11062018
22A-2019-00367C

Mary Owen v. Avondale Apartments Limited Partnership, Dennis K. Leisgang, Walter S. Smitson, and Jennifer Simpson, Manager for National Church Residence/Avondale Village Senior Apartments
COLH1(46613)11192018 AMENDED
05-19-3508-8
22A-2019-00493F

Terry Ligget v. The King's Clean, LLC d.b.a. The King's
COL71(46631)12032018
22A-2019-00547C

Terry Ligget v. The Ohio State University, College of Dentistry
COL71(46632)12032018
22A-2019-00548C

*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this matter

Chad Strohm v. State of Ohio, Department of of Rehabilitation and Correction
COL71(46634)12032018
22A-2019-00570C

Glennys and Vicente Guzman v. New Life Multifamily Management LLC
and Joshua Lindsey, Property Manager
COLH1(46642)11302018
05-19-3579-8
22A-2019-00602F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Andre Rashaun Vactor Sr. v. State of Ohio, Reformatory for Women
COL71(46649)12032018
22A-2019-00616C

Rajat Khadka v. Bista Brother LLC
COLG1(46654)12132018 AMENDED
22A-2019-00671F

Abby Crager v. American Tire Distributors
COL71(46671)12182018 AMENDED
22A-2019-00771C

Ellis Ford v. State of Ohio, Department of Public Safety
COLB1(46672)12192018
22A-2019-00782C

Michael Miller v. Certified Gas Station
COLG1(46674)12202018
22A-2019-00788F

Michael Miller v. Mount Carmel West Hospital
COLG1(46675)12202018
22A-2019-00789F

NaKatia Robinson v. JPMorgan Chase Bank, N.A.
COL71(46715)01102019
22A-2019-00967C

Wendy Katherine Wyss v. JPMorgan Chase Bank, National Association
COLA1(46736)01202019
22A-2019-01044C

Tiffany Myers v. City of Columbus, Columbus Police Department
COL71(46748)01252019
22A-2019-01077C

Antonique Dunbar v. Amazon.com Services, Inc.
COL71(46754)01252019
22A-2019-01095C

Loretta M. Harrison v. Gateway Health & Wellness
COL71(46759)01282019
22A-2019-01106C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Debra Cooley v. Holy Family Soup Kitchen
COLG1(46827)02212019
22A-2019-01382F

Andre Tucker v. OhioHealth Corporation
COL71(46876)03142019
22A-2019-01581C

Anthony Fultz v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction
COLB1(46895)03192019
22A-2019-01646C AMENDED

Tina Stewart v. State of Ohio, Department of Public Safety-Ohio State Highway Patrol
COLB1(46924)04012019 AMENDED
22A-2019-01761C

Shirley A. Ruffin v. City of Columbus, Department of Public Utilities
COL71(46935)04092019
22A-2019-01821C

Whitley Nicole Thomas v. Marsden Holding, LLC and Scioto Services, LLC (Scioto, LLC)
COL71(46937)04092019
22A-2019-01846C

Tasia Abel v. Bandit Choppers LLC
COLE1(46995)05022019 AMENDED
22A-2019-02113F

Ralph Whitlow v. DMG Rentals 14, LLC; Tammy Fiscus, Property Manager;
and the Reserve at Capital Pointe
COLH1(47026)05162019
05-19-5154-8
22A-2019-02778F

Charon Brown v. National Church Residences dba Inniswood Village
COL71(47060)06032019
22A-2019-02385C

William Kimmel v. State of Ohio, Department of Health
COLB1(47083)06122019
22A-2019-02476C

Jamie Gwin v. ACCEL Schools SR LLC dba Columbus Arts and Technology Academy, Inc.
COLB1(47071)06052019
22A-2019-02414C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

David James v. Brentlinger Enterprises dba Midwestern Auto Group
COL71(47107)06202019
22A-2019-02562C

David James v. Brentlinger Enterprises dba Midwestern Auto Group
COL71(47181)07192019
22A-2019-02843C

Robert F. Campos v. Whirlpool Corporation
TOL72(39584)12012018 AMENDED
22A-2019-00550C

Scott Bliss, Sr. v. Cox Trucking, Inc.
TOL72(39587)12032018
22A-2019-00553C

Krystal Coffey v. Pathway Inc.
TOL72(39612)12202018
22A-2019-00797C

Miriam Brown v. United Automobile, Aerospace & Agricultural Implement Workers of America –
UAW, Local No. 14
TOL72(39615)12212018
22A-2019-00805C

Delisa Simmons v. Med1Care Home Health, LLC
TOLB2(39616)12262018
22A-2019-00828C

Terree' Walton v. Renhill Group, Inc.
TOL72(39620)12272018
22A-2019-00833C

Den'zel Thompson v. The University of Toledo Medical Center
TOL72(39627)01022019
22A-2019-00949C

Nancy Macias v. City of Toledo, Division of Water Distribution, Field Services
TOL72(39628)01032019
22A-2019-00950C

Jason Raynor v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction,
Adult Parole Authority
TOL72(39630)01042019
22A-2019-00952C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Kasey Otto v. Pleasant McComb Portage Joint Ambulance District
TOL72(39633)01092019
22A-2019-00976C

Ida Cole v. State of Ohio Department of Developmental Disabilities (DODD),
Northwest Ohio Developmental Center (NODC)
TOL72(39634)01102019
22A-2019-00977C

Kenny Hobson v. Humbard Enterprises, Inc., dba McDonald's
TOLB2(39642)01142019
22A-2019-01079C

Samuel W. Thomas v. City of Toledo, Department of Public Utilities
TOLA2(39644)01172019
22A-2019-01082C

Tonya Grainger v. Amplex Electric, Inc. dba Amplex Internet
TOL72(39645)01172019 AMENDED
22A-2019-01084C

Rodtesha Ballard v. The University of Toledo
TOL72(39646)01172019 AMENDED
22A-2019-01087C

LaGarius Gardner v. The University of Toledo Medical Center
TOL72(39649)01182019
22A-2019-01090C

Dane Johnson v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction,
Toledo Correctional Institution
TOLB2(39662)01252019
22A-2019-01160C

H.O.M.E. v. William J. Holbrook
TOLH6(27719)12182018
05-19-3756-8
22A-2019-00867F

*Split Determination: Probable Cause on the issue of per se violation, advertising on the basis of National Origin, Familial Status and disability; No Probable Cause on the issue of Terms and Conditions regarding denial of rental on the basis of National Origin

Reba Alexander v. DHL Supply Chain
AKRB3(39993)01172019
22A-2019-01034C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Mark Seese v. Kenny-Obayashi V, A Joint Venture dba Granite Construction Incorporated
AKR73(40074)02222019
22A-2019-01450C

Sarah Karim v. Charter Communications, Inc. dba Spectrum
AKRB3(40075)02222019
22A-2019-01467C

Kevin Tucker v. PCC Airfoils, LLC
AKR73(40081)02272019
22A-2019-01518C

Lydia Hershberger v. Elite Finishing, LLC
AKR73(40087)03042019
22A-2019-01525C

Suansirhea Becton v. Integrity Home Healthcare of Hudson, LLC
dba Brightstar Care of Hudson/Solon
AKR73(40088)03042019
22A-2019-01526C

Shayla Hubbard v. Portage-Geauga County Juvenile Detention Center
AKR73(40098)02062019
22A-2019-01571C

Jaime Syvanych v. Franklin Arms Condominium Association, Joe Laberto, Mary Caspary and Sean
Marenkovic
AKRH3(40105)03112019
05-19-4470-8
22A-2019-01603F

*Split Determination: No Probable Cause on the issue of harassment, coercion, and terms and conditions for Respondents Mary Caspary and Sean Marenkovic; Probable Cause on the basis of familial status and retaliation on the issue of harassment, coercion and terms and condition for Respondents Franklin Arms Condominium Association and Joe Laberto

Isabelle Rodriguez v. Michael Donahue, III
AKRH3(40108)03132019
05-19-4677-8
22A-2019-01607F

Meghan Conley v. Bark-N-Play, LLC dba Camp Bow Wow
AKR73(40109)03112019
22A-2019-01610C

Alexandria Williams v. Oakmont Education, LLC
AKR73(40110)03112019
22A-2019-01611C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Chele Hardy v. Sun America, LLC
AKR73(40111)03112019
22A-2019-01612C

Silas Landis v. Cleveland Clinic Akron General
AKR73(40118)03182019
22A-2019-01636C

Tyrone Gregory and Juanita Taylor v. Veer Chirag LLC dba Steve's Motel
AKRG3(40124)03232019
22A-2019-01693F

Alycia Jordan v. Charter Communications, LLC
AKRB3(40128)03252019
22A-2019-01699C

Jerry Muhammed v. NW Akron Investments LLC and Jacob Wilhite
AKRH3(40153)04152019
05-19-4867-8
22A-2019-01924F

Michael Reynolds v. Minute Men, Inc.
AKRA3(40166)04242019 MENDED
22A-2019-02033C

Michael Reynolds v. GE Lighting Special Pack, Inc.
AKRA3(40167)04242019 AMENDED
22A-2019-02034C

Timothy Henry, Sr. v. 444 East, Inc. dba Eurogyro
AKRA3(40171)04242019
22A-2019-02039C

Tyrone Gregory and Juanita Taylor v. Kanu Patel dba Steve's Motel and Rick Dzuray
AKRH3(40174)04252019
05-19-5076-8
22A-2019-02064F

Kimberly Pachis v. Bretton North Condominium Mo. II Unit Owners Association Inc., and Patrick Hahe
AKRH3(40209)03132019
05-19-4688-8
22A-2019-02428F

Brad Fox v. Advance Stores Company, Incorporated dba Advance Auto Parts
CLE72(39736)03152019
22A-2019-01594C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Darlene Williams v. City of Toledo, Division of Streets, Bridges and Harbor
CLEA2(39831)04262019
22A-2019-02046C

Broderick Manahan v. Sun Chemical Corporation
CLE72(39838)05012019
22A-2019-02108C

JaQuatta Manahan v. Westgate Hospitality, LLC dba Hampton Inn & Suites
CLE72(39846)05032019
22A-2019-02154C

Chelsea James v. Roetzel & Andress, LLP
CLE73(40143)04012019
22A-2019-01764C

Brian Walsh v. Summa Health System, Akron City Hospital
CLE73(40150)04092019
22A-2019-01845C

Patrick Austin v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction,
Trumbull Correctional Institution
CLE73(40197)05132019
22A-2019-02291C

Nathan Cramer v. Sim Buick-GMC Truck, Inc.
CLE73(40211)05282019
22A-2019-02412C

DeHavn Starr v. Our Lady of Angels Apartments, Inc., Catherine Sabolik, and Lori Stadalsky
CLEH4(45070)01182019
05-19-4374-8
22A-2019-01062F

Lisa M. Brady v. The Alliance Group Agency, Inc.
CLEE4(45082)01242019
22A-2019-01120F

Willie Haywood v. AAustin Express, Inc.
CLE74(45090)01292019
22A-2019-01190C

Mia Collier v. Progressive Casualty Insurance Company
CLEM4(45097)01312019
22A-2019-01259C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Andrea Brueggeman v. John Matzke
CLEH4(45098)02042019
05-19-5108-8
22A-2019-01260F

James N.M.I. McCray v. Renal Care Group, Inc.
CLE74(45102)02072019
22A-2019-01265C

Gregory Archer v. The Contractors Choice Agency, Inc. dba National General Insurance
CLEB4(45198)04112019
22A-2019-01918C

Roshonda Weathers v. Coastal Logistic, Inc.
CLE74(45215)04182019
22A-2019-01972C

Sally Brugh v. R1 Motors, Inc. dba Mercedes Benz of North Olmsted
CLEA4(45224)04232019
22A-2019-02070C

Todd Shorts v. Parma City School District
CLEB4(45232)04292019
22A-2019-02079C

Shawona Dotson v. State of Ohio, Department of Developmental Disabilities, Warrensville
Developmental Center
CLE74(45241)05012019
22A-2019-02117C

Rayshoun Hinton v. Firenza Stone, Inc.
CLEA4(45254)05092019
22A-2019-02247C

Destiny Gray v. Forman Mills, Inc.
CLEG4(45260)05102019
22A-2019-02253F

Michael Threat v, City of Cleveland, Division of EMS
CLE74(45285)05282019
22A-2019-02454C

Margerita Nolan-Moore v. City of Cleveland, Division of EMS
CLE74(45303)05232019
22A-2019-02515C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Eddie Robinson v. Herold's Salads, Inc.
CLEB4(45304)06052019
22A-2019-02522C

Latasha Luster v. Jack Cleveland Casino, LLC
CLEG4(45306)06062019
22A-2019-02524F

Aaron Smith v. Leo James Landscape and Design, LLC
CLEE4(45324)06142019
22A-2019-02498F

Julie Sikorsky v. The salvation Army dba The Salvation Army
Ray and Joan Kroc Corps Community Center
CLEG4(45333)06202019
22A-2019-02576F

Gina Jackson v. State of Ohio, Bureau of Worker's Compensation
CLE74(45341)06272019
22A-2019-02749C

Michael Ruzicho v. DenOne, LLC dba Denny's
CLE74(45348)07012019
22A-2019-02660C

Gloria Valentine v. Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority
CLEG4(45352)07082019
22A-2019-02698F

Todd Shorts v. Parma City School District
CLEB4(45366)07112019
22A-2019-02773C

Todd Shorts v. Ohio Association of Public-School Employees
OAPSE/AFSME Local 4, AFL-CIO
CLEB4(45367)07112019
22A-2019-02775C

Michael Carroll Jr. v. EHR Specialties, Inc. dba Math Monkey
CLEB4(45395)07292019
22A-2019-03107C

John Williams v. LexisNexis
DAY76(27664)11212018
22A-2019-00737C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Kenneth Talley v. Marriott
DAYB6(27690)12072018
22A-2019-00843C

Alana Glenn v. Merchants Security Service
DAY76(27713)12172018
22A-2019-00865C

Sherry Green v. Greyhound Bus Lines
DAYG6(27722)12202018
22A-2019-00915F

Daniel Simpson v. Julie Hatton
DAYH6(27736)01022019
22A-2019-00935F

Roderick Wills v. Birge & Held Asset Management
DAY76(27747)01052019
22A-2019-01023C

Michelle Clark v. Synchrony Financial
DAY76(27752)01102019
22A-2019-01027C

Kristen Schneider v. Frisch's Big Boy
DAY76(27756)01112019
22A-2019--01031C

Christina Couch v. Kettering Medical Center
DAYB6(27767)01212019
22A-2019-01124C

Donald Frey v. Adient U.S. LLC
DAY76(27768)01182019
22A-2019-01125C

David Angeline v. Great Oaks Career Campuses
DAYA6(27677)11282018
22A-2019-00767C

Katherine Tompkins Shutte v. Globe Food Equipment Company
DAY76(27769)01222019
22A-2019-01129C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss - Continued

Jennifer Casson v. Access Hospital
DAYA6(27784)01252019
22A-2019-01305C

Ronald Keith Brock v. Gurmukh Sign; Clifton Cooperative Market
DAYB6(27790)01282019
22A-2019-01311C

William Tidwell v. Landry's Inc. dba Mortons Steakhouse
DAY76(27793)01292019
22A-2019-01198C

Haile Zenz v. Ridgeview Behavioral Health
DAY76(27796)01292019
22A-2019-01315C

Michael Wheeler v. Lenny's Food Service
DAYB6(27798)01142019
22A-2019-01316C

Paul Sohi, DDS v. Hamilton County, Board of County Commissioner
DAY76(27806)02042019
22A-2019-01210C

Amy Smith v. Watkins Academy via Ohio Department
DAY76(27809)01312019
22A-2019-01417C

Sherry Y. Green v. Midwest Acquisition; et al.
DAYH6(27810)01312019
22A-2019-01221F

MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to approve the September 26, 2019 Confirmation Agenda. Second by Commissioner Singh.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	DID NOT PARTICIPATE
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

STAFF BRIEFING

The compliance director reported that the Commission had complied with all notification requirements as set forth in Ohio Administrative Code Section 4112-1-04.

The Compliance Department, with the Executive Director's approval, requests that the following correction be made to the August 29, 2019 minutes:

Vacate Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation Determination

Anita C. Stevens v. Harvest Properties & Pennwood Drive Apartments, LLC
DAY76(27711)12132018
22A-2019-00863C

MOTION by Commissioner Singh to make the aforementioned correction to the August 29, 2019 minutes. Second by Commissioner Peters.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	DID NOT PARTICIPATE
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

The City of Toledo, Fire and Rescue Department has withdrawn the Request for Reconsideration (and appearance) in the following matter:

Week 3, Page 1, Item I-A

Kari Gonzalez v. City of Toledo, Fire and Rescue Department
TOL72(39504)10122018
22A-2019-00153C

The City of Toledo, Department of Public Utilities, Division of Water Distribution has withdrawn the request to appear before the Commissioners in the following matter:

Week 3, Page 1, Item I-A

Mary Lewis v. City of Toledo, Department of Public Utilities Division of Water Distribution
TOL72(39504)10122018
22A-2019-00153C

The Charging Party in the following matter informed staff she would not be in attendance at today's meeting due to an unavoidable scheduling conflict:

Week 3, Page 1, Item II-A

Nicole Praet v. Hanco Emergency Medical Services, LLC
TOLB2(39395)10012018 AMENDED
22A-2019-00024C

APPEARANCE CASES

Appearance 1

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 3, Page 1, Item II-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Allen Smith v. Hanco Emergency Medical Services, LLC
TOLA2(39517)10162018
22A-2019-00196C

Upon review of the application for reconsideration in this matter, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Peters to reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 2

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 4, Page 1, Item I-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: Uphold Probable Cause Determination

Debra Saylor v. W-T Realty, Inc. et al; Brian Hemmer, Property Manager, Ross Park Apartments;
Amanda LNU, Employee; Ross Park Apartments LLC
TOLH2(39574)09282018
05-19-3427-8
22A-2019-00524F

Upon review of the application for reconsideration in this matter, staff recommended the Commission uphold the previous Probable Cause determination. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Singh to uphold the previous Probable Cause determination. Second by Commissioner Patmon.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 3

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 2, Page 1, Item I-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Darren J. Furnas v. Montgomery County Engineer
DAYB6(27542)10022018
22A-2019-00046C

Upon review of the application for reconsideration in this matter, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	NO
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	NO
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	NO

Motion failed.

MOTION by Commissioner Singh to reverse the previous No Probable Cause determination to Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation; Authorize the executive director to issue a formal complaint should conciliation efforts fail. Second by Commissioner Peters.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	NO
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	NO
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to take a brief recess. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to go back to public session. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 4

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 1, Page 1, Item II-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Amanda L. Marple v. Grand Canyon University
COLK1(46560)11012018 AMENDED
22A02918-00332F

Upon review of the application for reconsideration in this matter, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

**MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination.
Second by Commissioner Peters.**

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to take a lunch recess. Second by Commissioner Peters.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

MOTION by Commissioner Peters to go back to public session. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 5

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 4, Page 1, Item I-B

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: Reverse Probable Cause to No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Tiffany Armstrong v. State of Ohio, Department of Health
COL71(46484)10052018
22A-2019-00064C

Upon review of the application for reconsideration in this matter, staff recommended the Commission reverse the previous Probable Cause determination to No Probable Cause - Dismiss. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Peters to reverse the previous Probable Cause determination to No Probable Cause - Dismiss. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 6

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 4, Page 2, Item II-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Bing Tian v. The Ohio State University
COLA1(46489)10092018
22A-2019-00104C

Upon review of the application for reconsideration in this matter, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

**MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination.
Second by Commissioner Peters.**

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	RECUSE
Commissioner Madhu Singh	NO
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Appearance 7

Commissioners' Agenda - Week 4, Page 2, Item II-A

Recommendation Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Neal Kelly v. The Ohio State University
COLB1(46490)10092018
22A-2019-00105C

Upon review of the application for reconsideration in this matter, staff recommended the Commission reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination. Both parties were present to discuss the case.

**MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to reinstate the previous No Probable Cause determination.
Second by Commissioner Peters.**

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	RECUSE
Commissioner Madhu Singh	NO
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioners' Agenda for Week 1

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

There were no remaining cases on the Week 1 agenda.

Commissioners' Agenda for Week 2

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Barbara Columbus v. AMERATHON LLC dba American Health Associates
DAYB6(27671)11272018
22A-2019-00584C

MOTION by Commissioner Singh to adopt the staff finding in the foregoing captioned case on the Commissioners' Agenda for Week 2. Second by Commissioner Peters.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioners' Agenda for Week 3

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration: Uphold Probable Cause Determination

Mary Lewis v. City of Toledo, Department of Public Utilities
CLE73(39968)12212018
22A-2019-00911C

2. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Nicole Praet v. Hanco Emergency Medical Services, LLC
TOLB2(39395)10012018 AMENDED
22A-2019-00024C

Charity Armstrong v. State of Ohio, Department of Transportation
Division of Water Distribution
TOL72(39504)10122018
22A-2019-00153C

MOTION by Commissioner Singh to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned case on the Commissioners' Agenda for Week 3. Second by Commissioner Peters.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Commissioners' Agenda for Week 4

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration: Uphold Probable Cause Determination

Steven Phillips v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction
TOLB2(39546)10312018
22A-2019-00380C

2. Findings Upon Reconsideration: No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Kathy Kessler v. Rescue Incorporated
TOL72(39527)10232018
22A-2019-00299C

Londer Weathers v. Herman & Kittle Properties, Inc., Beacon
Beacon Pointe I, L.P., Butler Metropolitan Housing Authority
and Lisa Bradley
CLEH6(27660)11162018 AMENDED
22A-2019-00730F

Londer Weathers v. Herman & Kittle Properties, Inc., Beacon
Beacon Pointe I, L.P., Butler Metropolitan Housing Authority
and Lisa Bradley
CLEH6(27775)01232019 AMENDED
22A-2019-01216F

Charles Williams v. Amazon.com Services, Inc.
DAY76(27827)02072019
22A-2019-01392C

MOTION by Commissioner Cespedes to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Commissioners' Agenda for Week 4. Second by Commissioner Peters.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

Report from the Ohio Attorney General's Office

Civil Rights Section Chief Lori Anthony reported on the status of appeals cases for Vadim Tarshis and Peter Newman.

Report from the Chief Legal Counsel

On September 16, 2019, in a 4-3 decision, the Arizona Supreme Court struck down part of a Phoenix City Ordinance and upheld the rights of business owners, operating as a LLC, to decline creating wedding invitations for same-sex couples.

Plaintiffs, Joanna Duka and Breanna Kroski operated an Internet-based business creating custom wedding invitations. The business, Brush & Nib, LC, operates no brick and mortar stores. The company touts itself as a for-profit business operating as an "art studio" specializing in creating custom artwork for weddings, events, special occasions, home décor and businesses. The company does include in their Operating Agreement a statement that the company's core beliefs is an unwillingness to use its artistic process or create art that contradicts its religious beliefs and message. The Agreement also specifies the company will refuse to create custom artwork that communicates messages that contradict biblical truth, demean others, endorse racism, incite violence, or promote any marriage besides marriage between one man and one woman.

The City Ordinance at issue prohibits places of public accommodation from discriminating against patrons on the basis of protected class, including sexual orientation by refusing, withholding from, or denying any person the accommodations, advantages, facilities or privileges of the place of public accommodation. As the court notes, neither federal law nor state law contains the same prohibition against persons based on orientation. Additionally, the ordinance makes it unlawful to directly or indirectly display, circulate, publicize or mail any ad, notice or communication which states or implies that any facility or service shall be refused or restricted or that states or implies that based on a person's status, they would be "unwelcome, objectionable, unacceptable, undesirable or not solicited."

In the seemingly ongoing battle between the interplay of rights of equality granted under statutory and administrative codified law and the rights of free speech and free exercise of religion granted by state constitution and the First Amendment to the US Constitution, the court struck down part of the ordinance and applying the portion not struck down, found under a strict scrutiny analysis, the rights of the business owner to free speech (deeming this artwork constituting pure speech) and their exercise of Christian beliefs overrode the city's right to institute criminal penalties against the business owners for refusing to avail their services to same sex couples.

Along the line of Masterpiece cake, the business owners sought limited protection in that they sought an injunction only as it pertains to custom designed invitations. They did not seek protection for non-custom designed products and the other goods and services offered to the public. Unlike Masterpiece, they had not denied any patron. They proactively sought the court to enjoin the city from enforcing this ordinance against them. The lower court denied the injunction and found for the City. The Court of Appeals uphold the denial of injunction and grant of summary judgment for the City but struck down as unconstitutionally vague the portion of the statute pertaining to "unwelcome, objectionable, unacceptable, undesirable or not solicited." The Arizona Supreme Court reversed granting summary judgment for the business owners and awarding them attorney fees for the costs in appealing the case to the state's supreme court.

Report from Executive Director

Executive Director G. Michael Payton began his report by thanking Lori Anthony and her staff at the Attorney General's office for their work on the appeals cases.

Statewide Staff Training Day: The executive staff received very positive feedback from the staff regarding the annual statewide staff training day. The presenters were Susan Willeke (Ohio Ethics Commission), Billy White (Zanesville tattoo parlor owner), and Daedra McGhee (U.S. Department of Justice, Community Relations Service). Thanks to Commissioners Peters and Cespedes for attending the event. Mary Turocy was commended for her hard work in organizing and coordinating the event.

Welcome Hanna Sylvester: Youngstown State University student Hannah Sylvester has joined the OCRC as a summer/fall intern and is assisting Mary Turocy. Ms. Sylvester's internship stems from her participation in Kent State University's annual Columbus Program in Intergovernmental Issues hosted and administered by Ohio Senator and Professor Vernon Sykes.

Remarks

The Commissioners commended staff for their hard work. Commissioner Peters specifically acknowledged Columbus Regional Supervisor Angel Stone for doing a good job on her presentation of cases at the meeting.

MOTION by Commissioner Peters to adjourn the public meeting. Second by Commissioner Cespedes.

Roll Call Vote:

Chair Lori Barreras	YES
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III	YES
Commissioner Madhu Singh	YES
Commissioner Juan Cespedes	YES
Commissioner Carolyn Peters	YES

Motion carried.

The regular meeting of The Ohio Civil Rights Commission was ADJOURNED at 2:20PM.

* * *



Commissioner